Utilizing CBMS in Monitoring Human Development: The Case of the Province of Palawan

The government of Palawan, through its Provincial Planning and Development Office (PPDO), will soon be releasing its human development report. Aside from containing an updated basic demographic information about the province, the report assesses the condition of Palaweños across municipalities in terms of income and livelihood, sanitation, health, nutrition, security and shelter, and education. The report presents a set of almost thirty development indicators from all major development sectors to provide baseline information on the current living conditions of families and communities in Palawan, in particular, on their satisfied and unsatisfied needs. It also sheds light on the progress that has been made during the past two decades, whether it was gained through government interventions or through the endeavors of civil society.

The primary data source of the development report is a province-wide household survey that was conducted in the year 2000 with the implementation of the community-based monitoring system (CBMS). The CBMS survey collected information in 21 out of the 23 municipalities of the province, involving around 46 percent (71,164) of the existing 154,000 households in Palawan.

The provincial government of Palawan implemented a community-based monitoring system (CBMS) specifically to monitor the welfare condition of its constituents. With technical assistance from the Project Management Team of the Micro Impacts of Macroeconomic Adjustment Policies (MIMAP) Project–Philippines, the provincial government, through its PPDO, also spearheaded the conduct of a series of orientation and training workshops in cooperation with the various municipal and village planning and development units. A pilot test of the system was conducted in two barangays in the municipality of Taytay in November 1999. The actual CBMS survey was then started in the second half of year 2000.

The establishment of the CBMS in the province is geared towards a more systematic way of gathering baseline information on various welfare indicators pertaining to income and livelihood, water and sanitation, health and nutrition, and education. In addition, the information gathered will aid local planners and program implementors as well as various interest groups in the identification and prioritization of needs and in the allocation of resources in the province.

What’s Inside

Palawan holds LGU forum on CBMS
Continuing MIMAP–Palawan collaboration
Surfing the MIMAP research network website
Palawan holds LGU forum on CBMS

A forum of local government units in Palawan, organized by the Provincial Planning and Development Office (PPDO), was held in Puerto Princesa City on January 30, 2001 to assess the recent initiatives of the provincial government regarding the implementation of the community-based monitoring system (CBMS). The assessment included a current level analysis and validation of the CBMS results.

In his opening remarks, Mr. Nelson Devenadera, Provincial Planning and Development Coordinator of Palawan, stressed the PPDO’s goal to cover the entire province of Palawan in the implementation of the CBMS. He thereby requested the full commitment and cooperation of all local government unit (LGU) representatives in the accomplishment of CBMS-related activities.

One of the highlights of the forum was the presentation of the human development report of Palawan, utilizing the information gathered thus far from the CBMS (see related main article). The PPDO conceptualized the report in order to increase the general level of awareness and understanding of the development status in Palawan. The report presented data on the current degree of human development by sector, namely, demography, health and nutrition, water and sanitation, security and shelter, education, enabling and livelihood, peace and order, community development, and infrastructure and utilities. The human development index (HDI) was used to measure the achievements in basic human development. The report would serve as the basis for the provincial and municipal development bodies in setting up frameworks and direction for development initiatives and programs. However, the preparation of the report is still in the preliminary stage since results from other villages (barangays) and municipalities are still to be submitted for inclusion in the report.

The open discussion that followed, which was facilitated by MIMAP—Philippines Project Director, Dr. Celia Reyes, became the venue for the municipal representatives to share their recent activities, problems encountered and future initiatives regarding CBMS. Among the activities lined up for the year are:

- validation of results from municipalities with partial or completed CBMS results,
- completion of data processing and data validation in municipalities where only partial results were previously available,
- culmination of surveys in those areas with incomplete results,
- conduct of advocacy activities in municipalities where the CBMS was not previously conducted and initiated,
- institutionalization of the municipal CBMS database, and
- start of the utilization of CBMS data at the local government units.

Among the participants in the forum were selected local chief executives (mayors), municipal planning and development coordinators (MPDCs) and representative staff members, and Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG) officials from the various municipalities of Palawan. KCI

Mr. Nelson Devenadera (extreme left) of the Palawan PPDO stresses the value of the information gathered through CBMS to local planning.
In line with the province-wide implementation of the community-based monitoring system (CBMS) in Palawan, the City Planning Office of Puerto Princesa and the Provincial Planning and Development Office (PPDO) jointly held an orientation for officials of the city planning office and village (barangay) planners of Puerto Princesa City on the CBMS last March 8, 2001.

Serving as resource persons on the CBMS were Dr. Celia Reyes and Ms. Bernadette Mandap of the MIMAP–Philippines Project Management Office (PMO). Also present to discuss the accomplishments as well as the ongoing and future CBMS-related initiatives in Palawan were Mr. Dirk Heinrichs and Ms. Josephine Escaño of the PPDO. Speaking on behalf of the City Planning Office of Puerto Princesa, Assistant City Planning Coordinator Mr. Mauro Ordillo, Jr. welcomed the CBMS initiative as an improvement in planning and program design, monitoring and implementation. However, in consideration of the upcoming May 14 local election, the implementation of said system in Puerto Princesa will be shelved until the new local administration is in place.

For municipalities which have yet to complete the implementation of the CBMS, meanwhile, continuing training activities are being held on various processes. For instance, in the municipality of Sofronio Española, Southern Palawan, a training workshop for enumerators and data processors was organized on March 28-29, 2001 by its municipal planning office spearheaded by Engr. Rogelio Abiog. The MIMAP–Philippines PMO was invited to brief the participants on CBMS and give basic training on the conduct of the survey operation and data processing. Representing the MIMAP PMO were Mr. Kenneth Ilarde and Ms. Bernadette Mandap. Also on hand to assist was Ms. Josephine Rabang of the PPDO.

College students were tapped as CBMS survey enumerators and data processors in Española, Southern Palawan. In photo are the college volunteers with their trainors from MIMAP.
Preliminary results indicate a high incidence of poverty in the province, with barely 30.7 percent of the households surveyed having income above the poverty threshold. Data reveal the seasonality of income-earning opportunities in most of the households surveyed. Agriculture is the main source of employment (62.6%) in the province. Though employment rate is generally high in the province at 87 percent, a huge proportion of the households reveal their members’ desire to seek additional work in order to supplement their income. In terms of access to basic services, the survey shows that there are a number of households in the province who do not have access to safe water and sanitary toilet facilities. The set of the core information that can be gathered through the CBMS is shown in Table 1.

A glimpse of the findings to be presented in detail in the forthcoming Palawan human development report is summarized in the succeeding sections.

### Table 1: CBMS Indicators, Palawan, Philippines

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area of Concern</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Rate (in percent)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A. Survival</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Proportion of households without infant death</td>
<td>97.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Proportion of households without deaths of children (1-6 yrs. old)</td>
<td>98.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nutrition</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Proportion of households without malnourished children</td>
<td>91.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water and sanitation</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Proportion of households with access to safe water</td>
<td>50.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Proportion of households with sanitary toilet facilities</td>
<td>60.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B. Security</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shelter</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Proportion of households not in makeshift house</td>
<td>95.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peace and order</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Proportion of households without members who were victims of crimes</td>
<td>99.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Proportion of households without members who were victims of armed encounters</td>
<td>99.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C. Enabling</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income and livelihood</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Proportion of households with income greater than the poverty threshold</td>
<td>30.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Proportion of households with at least one employed member</td>
<td>87.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Proportion of households without underemployed workers</td>
<td>46.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic education and literacy</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Proportion of households with children (6-12 yrs. old) attending elementary education</td>
<td>82.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>Proportion of households with children (13-16 yrs. old) attending secondary education</td>
<td>60.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Proportion of households with all members who are literate</td>
<td>81.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political participation</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>Proportion of households with at least one member involved in a community organization</td>
<td>32.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>16</td>
<td>Proportion of households with at least one member who participated in the last electoral process</td>
<td>78.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

RESEARCH RESULTS

Health and Nutrition

In general, the children in the province are noted to be in good health condition. Infant mortality is low with only 2.9 percent of the households surveyed having had infant deaths. Death of children among households is also minimal at 1.4 percent. Incidence of child malnutrition among households, on the other hand, registered at 8.1 percent.

Water and Sanitation

Access to safe water is estimated to be 50.8 percent. The common sources of water are shallow well (26.9%), shared deep well (14.2%), and natural bodies of water such as spring, lake, among others (13.8%). Among the least served in terms of this facility as shown in Figure 1 are the communities of Cagayancillo (20.0%), Roxas (21.5%), Quezon (24.3%), Araceli (25.2%), and Balabac (27.2%). Meanwhile, access to this facility is high in the areas of Española (95.1%), Narra (91.2%), Linapacan (84.9%), Aborlan (77.3%), and Rizal (69.7%).

On the other hand, data reveal that 40 percent of the households surveyed do not have access to sanitary toilet facilities. The common types of sanitation facilities/methods are manual flushing by bucket (“de-buhos”) (52.7%) and closed pit (12.5%). Meanwhile, almost 15 percent of the households have unclassified types of facility. Among the least served communities in terms of sanitation facility as noted in Figure 2 are Linapacan (42.3%), Balabac (43.4%), Coron (43.8%), Bataraza (44.7%), and Quezon (51.4%).

Shelter

Most of the households surveyed live in durable dwelling units. Only 4.6 percent live in makeshift housing.

Peace and Order

With regards to peace and order, the data indicate a very peaceful environment in the province, with most of the households surveyed not encountering incidences of crime (99.8%) or armed encounters (99.6%).

---

By standard definition, water is considered safe when sources come from a community water system or deep and artesian wells.
**Research Results**

**Income and Livelihood**

Only 30.7 percent of the households surveyed have incomes above the poverty threshold. By official standard, this implies a huge proportion of households that are unable to earn enough to satisfy their daily basic needs. As mentioned earlier, this finding is largely attributed to the seasonality of income-earning opportunities of the employed members of the households. Figure 3 indicates that among the communities that have the least number of households with incomes above the poverty threshold are Rizal (.3%), Linapacan (9.8%), Cagayancillo (11.8%), Coron (13.9%), and Dumaran (15.2%).

Meanwhile, data reveal that employment rate is rather high in the province. Almost 87 percent of the households surveyed have at least 1 employed member. The high incidence of poverty in spite of the latter, however, may be explained by the observation that 53.1 percent of the households surveyed reported having members who are underemployed. Stated differently and as shown in Figure 3, the proportion of households with income greater than the poverty threshold is lowest in Rizal (.3%), Linapacan (9.8%), Cagayancillo (11.8%), Coron (13.9%), and Dumaran (15.2%).
In Figure 4, among the areas with the least number of households which do not have underemployed members are Brookes' Point (21.6%), Rizal (30.3%), Cagayancillo (33.5%), Narra (41.8%), and Coron (42.9%).

**Basic Education and Literacy**

The survey also reveals that the literacy rate is high in the province with 81.9 percent of the households surveyed having all members literate. The proportion of households with school-aged children (6-12 years) attending primary education is pegged at 82.8 percent. Meanwhile, almost 40 percent of the households surveyed have children 13-16 years of age not going to secondary education. One observation derived from the survey operation is that some of the children of the latter households are still in the primary level. Among the communities with the least number of households with children attending secondary education are Araceli (23.8%), Quezon (44.5 %), Rizal (42.3%), Coron (45.9%), and Busuanga (46.6%).

**Political Participation**

Finally, almost 79 percent of the households surveyed have actively participated in the last electoral process (May 1998 election). On the other hand, membership in community organizations (those involved in groups that take part in the development of the community, i.e., cooperatives and civic organizations, among others) is low at 32.4 percent. Among those communities with the least proportion of households having members involved in community organization are the communities of Quezon (18.3%), Española (23.3%), Brookes’ Point (26.1%), Bataraza (26.7%), and Magsaysay (27.2%). BEM and JPA.
Surfing the MIMAP research network website (www.mimap.org)

Since 1990, the International Research Development Centre (IDRC) of Canada, through its Micro Impacts of Macroeconomic Adjustment Policies (MIMAP) program, has been assisting developing countries in their research and advocacy efforts to reduce poverty through sound macro policy and micro interventions.

During this period, IDRC has established MIMAP projects in 13 Asian and African countries, namely, Bangladesh, Benin, Burkina Faso, Ghana, India, Lao PDR, Morocco, Nepal, Pakistan, Philippines, Senegal, Sri Lanka and Vietnam. In addition, IDRC has also established at least six thematic sub-network projects which develop knowledge and tools in cross-cutting areas on environment, gender, gender budget, health, labor and microfinance. This is now known as the MIMAP Network. The network, as a whole, connects developing country researchers, policy officials, non-government organizations (NGOs), and international experts, and their works to understand the human costs of macro policies and shocks. Through the network, too, research, training and dialogues are shared in the hope of designing better policies and poverty alleviation programs.

To meet the information-sharing needs of the various project teams and stakeholders of the MIMAP program’s research network, IDRC has developed the MIMAP Network Website (MNW). The site serves as a platform for the network’s research advocacy and as a resource center wherein researchers, institutions, policymakers and the public at large may find most, if not all, information on the MIMAP program. The site also contains information and links to websites of MIMAP country level initiatives and thematic projects as well as to other sources on poverty and economic policies. Some of these information provided at the website are network and project level news updates, meetings and conferences, online databases, training materials, research papers, references and other relevant documents. It is envisioned that the website would become an important source of information on poverty and macroeconomic policy in developing countries. The site can be viewed at http://www.mimap.org.