The debate on the dichotomy of growth versus equity has existed for several decades among economists and policymakers. The theoretical mechanism linking poverty, inequality, and growth made this issue very attractive for debate. The basic conclusion from empirical studies suggests that growth and equity are complementary in some fundamental dimensions of development (Bourguignon, 2007). In addition, other empirical results have shown that developments that focus on distribution and equity will have a more positive impact for the people (National Development Planning Agency, 2007). The United Nations (UN) has actively raised the discourse of development to promote human welfare. These efforts had an effect at the Millennium Summit in New York in September 2000, with the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) launched as an agreement of 189 Member States of the United Nations at the Summit.

The interconnected MDGs that are incorporated in a global agenda are: (i) eradicate extreme poverty and hunger; (ii) achieve universal basic education; (iii) promote gender equality and empower women; (iv) reduce child mortality; (v) improve maternal health; (vi) combat HIV/AIDS, malaria, and other diseases; and (vii) ensure environmental stability. These goals were translated into measurable targets and their progress reported through verifiable and internationally comparable indicators.

Goals in the MDGs are not new in the context of development in Indonesia. All governments under all presidential administrations since independence have focused on the guiding development framework which was prevalent at the time. For example, in the New Order Era, Indonesia had Five Year Development Plans (REPELITA), which started with REPELITA I in 1969 and finished with REPELITA VI in 1994, with the latter unfortunately disrupted by the 1997 financial crisis. After the fall of the New Order Era and during the transition era, Indonesia developed a similar document on development planning called the 2004–2009 National Midterm Development Plan (RPJMN). The latest version of this is the 2010–2014 RPJMN. The RPJMN provides policy and program guidance for five years for both national and local governments, based on the vision and mission of the elected president. The inclusion of the MDGs into the RPJMN and other documents on poverty alleviation programs implies that the government remains firm in treating the MDGs not only as a declaration of good intentions but as something that should be backed up with definite actions (Bappenas, 2006).

Before decentralization, needs for data for planning, monitoring as well as evaluation could be ignored. However, under the decentralization era in which the regional governments play a bigger role in local development, these governments need reliable information on the condition of their people and answers to some questions such as what development programs would be more appropriate to meet the people’s needs, how
Research Results

Development can be accelerated, which groups should be more focused on, or which subdistricts/area should be more prioritized. It is very costly and not easy, however, to do surveys and data collection. Although there was an effort to implement a pilot project on a survey of MDG indicators at the district and sub-district levels in five districts at two provinces (Bantaen, Takalar and Bone districts in South Sulawesi Province and Polman and Mamuju districts in West Sulawesi Province in 2007), most regional governments are somewhat reluctant to do such expensive survey and data collection. And while it is true that the MDGs are not merely about measurements but more about action (Stalker, 2008) and the intention is not to count how many people live below the poverty line but on how to make them live a decent life, the availability of reliable data at the local level would allow a review of what the regional governments have and have not done for their people's welfare to be made.

The Objective of Generating MDGs from CBMS Data

The main objective of looking at the MDG achievement from the CBMS (Community-Based Monitoring System) in Kota Pekalongan is not to assess the MDG indicators but to show that some MDG indicators can be generated from a household survey and that a review of the progress of the MDG achievement in Pekalongan can be completed, albeit with several limitations. Among these limitations are: (1) there are difficulties dealing with the 1990 Population Census (baseline) data because of the lack of data. The data could only present the recent figures of some MDG indicators achievement in Pekalongan without comparing them with the baseline data; (2) only some MDG indicators can be generated by using CBMS data. Hence, the data analysis is only for available indicators; and (3) since the CBMS survey involves household level data, it is possible that there were missing values and consequently, the MDG achievement might be lower than the published ratio.

There are some targets in four (out of eight) goals in the following subsection, i.e., goal 2 on achieving universal primary education, goal 3 on promoting gender equality and empowering women, goal 4 on reducing child mortality, and goal 5 on improving maternal health. Lastly, it should be noted that the indicators in two kecamatan (Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur and Pekalongan Selatan) are based on 2008 census data while in the other two (Kecamatan Pekalongan Barat and Pekalongan Utara), they are based on 2009 data.

**Goal 2: Achieve Universal Primary Education**

**Target 2.A: Ensure that by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling.**

The measurement for this target in Indonesia uses the following indicators: (1) Primary school net enrolment ratio (NER) (7–12 years); (2) Junior high school net enrolment ratio (13–15 years); and (3) Literacy rate of the 15–24 year age group.

Table 1 shows the net enrolment ratio (NER), both for primary school and junior high school aged children in Pekalongan. All four kecamatan have achieved a NER more than 95 percent for the primary school age. This means that more than 95 percent of children aged 7-12 years old are in school. For those in the junior high school age, the NER ratio is slightly below that of the primary school age, i.e., about 80 percent in average. Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur has the highest NER ratio in junior high school (82.54%) and Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur has the lowest ratio.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Net Enrolment Ratio</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Selatan</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Barat</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Utara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary School Age (7-12 years)</td>
<td>96.05%</td>
<td>95.90%</td>
<td>95.64%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior High School Age (13-15 years)</td>
<td>82.54%</td>
<td>96.04%</td>
<td>81.67%</td>
<td>78.53%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CBMS Census 2008-2009

The third indicator is the literacy rate of the population aged 15-24 years old as shown in Table 2. For this indicator, all kecamatan in Kota Pekalongan achieved an impressive figure of more than 98 percent. Even for Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur, the percentage of literate population aged 15-24 years old in 2008 was nearly 100 percent.

**Target 3.A: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005, and in all levels of education no later than 2015.**

The progress with this target is being monitored using the following indicators: (1) ratio of girls to boys in primary and secondary education as measured through the net enrolment ratio (NER) of girls to boys; (2) literacy ratio of women as compared to men in the 15–24 year-old age group as measured through the literacy rate of women to men (gender literacy parity index); (3) share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector; and (4) proportion of seats held by women in the national parliament (MPR).

To reach the goal of promoting gender equality and empowering women, the target ratio of girls to boys in primary education as well as the literacy ratio of women compared to men aged 15-24 years old are considered. Unfortunately, indicators (3) and (4) from the CBMS data cannot be generated. As shown in Table 3, the ratio of girls to boys in primary school (7–12 years old) in two kecamatan, i.e., Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur and Kecamatan Pekalongan Selatan, stand at 100.11 percent and 100.95 percent, respectively, in 2008. The 2009 census in Kecamatan Pekalongan Utara generated about the same figure where the proportion reaches more than 100 percent. Kecamatan Pekalongan Barat, however,
Research Results

Table 2. Literacy Rate of Population Aged 15-24 Years (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Literacy Rate</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Selatan</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Barat</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Utara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Literacy Rate age 15-24 years</td>
<td>99.56%</td>
<td>99.34%</td>
<td>98.89%</td>
<td>98.34%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CBMS Census 2008-2009

Table 3. Ratio of Girls to Boys in Primary Education (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ratio of Girls to Boys in Primary Education</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Selatan</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Barat</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Utara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ratio of girls to boys in primary schools</td>
<td>100.11%</td>
<td>100.95%</td>
<td>99.57%</td>
<td>100.42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ratio of girls to boys in junior high schools</td>
<td>98.43%</td>
<td>106.03%</td>
<td>100.69%</td>
<td>106.10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CBMS Census 2008-2009

had a figure below 100 percent, the lowest proportion among all the others. On the other hand, the ratio of girls to boys in junior high school (13-15 years old) in Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur is below 100 percent while in the three other kecamatans, the figures are above 100 percent net enrolment ratio of girls to boys in junior high school.

For the second indicator, Pekalongan again has an impressive achievement. Three out of its four kecamatans achieved more than 100 percent gender literacy parity index. Only Kecamatan Pekalongan Barat has a ratio slightly below 100 percent as seen in Table 4. Thus, based on the three indicators mentioned above, the MDG target of gender equality in terms of education and literacy in Pekalongan has already been achieved. This is better compared with the national level.

Goal 4: Reduce Child Mortality

Target 4.A: Reduce by two-thirds, between 1990 and 2015, the under-five mortality rate.

The indicators used to evaluate the target of reducing the mortality rate of children under five by as much as two-thirds between 1990 and 2015 are: (1) infant mortality rate per 1,000 live births; (2) under-five mortality rate per 1,000 live births; (3) percentage of one-year-old children immunized against measles; and (4) percentage of children aged between 12 and 23 months old who are immunized against measles. It should be noted that these data only cover the last children in the households. For the percentage of one-year-old children immunized against measles, the figures in Pekalongan are quite discouraging. The highest number for this indicator is 26.58 percent in Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur, followed by 25.17 percent in Kecamatan Pekalongan Utara, 22.84 percent in Kecamatan Pekalongan Selatan, and 22.08 percent in Kecamatan Pekalongan Barat. The percentage of children aged 12-23 months old immunized against measles is rather encouraging. All four kecamatans have achieved more than 50 percent. The
Research Results

Table 4. Literacy Ratio of Women to Men in the 15-24 Years Old Age Group (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Selatan</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Barat</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Utara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Literacy Ratio of Women to Men Aged 15-24 Years</td>
<td>100.09%</td>
<td>100.22%</td>
<td>98.89%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CBMS Census 2008-2009

For the second indicator, the data tracked down the proportion of last births assisted by skilled health professional. The percentage of last births assisted by skilled health professional shows remarkable rates in four kecamatan (Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur, Selatan, Barat, and Utara) at 93.78 percent, 86.59 percent, 94.49 percent and 89.72 percent, respectively (Table 5).

Goal 5: Improve Maternal Health

Target 5.A: Reduce by three-quarters, between 1990 and 2015, the maternal mortality rate.

The following indicators are used to measure the reduction in the maternal mortality rate by as much as three-quarters for the period 1990-2015: (1) maternal mortality rate per 100,000 live births; and (2) proportion of births assisted by trained birth attendants (in percent).

As for other health indicators, data limitations prevent an analysis of the efforts to improve access to reproductive health. The main indicator — maternal mortality rate—is not available for Pekalongan for the same reasons explained in the last indicators.

Target 5.B: Achieve, by 2015, universal access to reproductive health.

The indicator for this is the proportion of married women between the ages of 15 and 49 using any method of contraceptives (in percent). For Pekalongan, using CBMS data, the contraceptive rate of married women aged 15-49 years old can be obtained (Table 7). The proportion generated from the 2008 census in Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur and Selatan shows that 51.55 percent and 44.75 percent, respectively, of married women aged 15-49 years old are using any method of contraceptives. Meanwhile, the percentages for Kecamatan Pekalongan Barat and Utara from the 2009 Census measure 52.55 percent and 55.96 percent, respectively. These numbers indicate that the government should give more attention to reproductive health development. Otherwise, there will be demographic problems in the future.

Conclusion

Tracking the MDGs needs the concerted efforts of both the central and the local governments. Since the goal of tracking the MDGs is essentially to improve the lives of many, if not all, people, it becomes all the more important that household level data be made available. What may be seen at the national level may not be true at the grassroots—e.g., the level of poverty may be skewed as can be seen, for example, in regional disparities in income.

The exercise on using the CBMS data of Kota Pekalongan, Indonesia for tracking the MDGs showed that there are still households that are lagging behind certain goals and targets. Though most of the households in Kota Pekalongan are

Table 5. Percentage of Children Immunized against Measles (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage of Children Immunized against Measles</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Selatan</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Barat</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Utara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of One-Year Old Children Immunized</td>
<td>26.58%</td>
<td>22.84%</td>
<td>22.08%</td>
<td>25.17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of 12-23 Month-Old Children Immunized</td>
<td>78.30%</td>
<td>59.31%</td>
<td>69.54%</td>
<td>67.32%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CBMS Census 2008-2009

Table 6. Percentage of Births Attended by Skilled Health Personnel (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage of Births Attended by Skilled Health Professional</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Selatan</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Barat</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Utara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Percentage of Births Attended by Skilled Health Professional</td>
<td>93.78%</td>
<td>86.59%</td>
<td>94.49%</td>
<td>89.72%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CBMS Census 2008-2009
CBMS Team in Argentina achieves several project milestones

Three months after the CBMS project in Argentina officially started, the research team headed by Dr. Sebastian Auguste of the Universidad Nacional del Centro de la Provincia de Buenos Aires (UNICEN) reported that they have already completed the following milestones in their project: (1) review of existing monitoring systems in the country, (2) design of the questionnaire, (3) selection of key poverty indicators, (4) selection of project sites in Tandil and Salta, and (5) establishment of partnerships through meetings and consultations with project stakeholders.

The research team has now moved on to the next steps of their project which seek to pilot test the CBMS methodology in both urban and rural settings and to provide practical, scientifically generated data to the local governments in these areas for their effective planning, monitoring and evaluation of development projects. These include the presentation of the CBMS design at a workshop for stakeholders, development of training modules for both interviewers and supervisors, and establishment of a selection process for the hiring of pollsters, supervisors and data processors.

The main institution in charge of the CBMS project in the country is the Instituto de Economía of UNICEN. The institute is responsible for developing the methodological approach, implementing the pilot test, processing the information, writing the reports, and disseminating the results.

The project head, Dr. Auguste, is director of the institute and professor of Microeconometrics at the Universidad Torcuato Di Tella.

The CBMS work in the country will be implemented in three phases: (i) Phase 1: selection of indicators and design of the methodology; (ii) Phase 2: implementation of the pilot CBMS; and (iii) Phase 3: data analysis, preparation of reports and dissemination of the results.

As expressed earlier, all stakeholders should play a role in this effort, including the regional governments. Tracking the MDGs requires the involvement of all key players.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proportion of Married Women Aged 15-49 Years Old Using Contraceptives (%)</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Timur</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Selatan</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Barat</th>
<th>Kecamatan Pekalongan Utara</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of Married Women Aged 15-49 Years Old Using Contraceptives, any method</td>
<td>51.55%</td>
<td>44.75%</td>
<td>52.55%</td>
<td>55.96%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7. Proportion of Married Women Aged 15-49 Years Old Using Contraceptives (%)

Source: CBMS Census 2008-2009
News Updates

7th CBMS Philippines National Conference attracts record number of participants

More than 700 stakeholders of the Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS) participated in the recently concluded 7th CBMS Philippines National Conference held at the Sofitel Philippine Plaza in Pasay City on February 7-9, 2011. The 3-day conference attracted the biggest attendance as yet of CBMS practitioners, academicians and policymakers, including at least seven governors and 143 municipal mayors.

Under the theme “Reducing Poverty and Vulnerabilities Amidst Global Shocks,” the conference featured presentations on the national poverty reduction agenda, status of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) in nine provinces, disaster risk mapping and adaptation strategies to climate change, developing partnerships for development, issues and challenges on program targeting and impact monitoring, and monitoring child welfare.

Br. Narciso Erquiza FSC, President of De La Salle University, gave the welcome remarks and expressed his view that the CBMS and the local-level information that it provides to local and national government have proven indispensable to program implementation and for policymaking. “Providing information is the biggest strength and most important service of the CBMS, lending large assistance in our fight against poverty,” Br. Erquiza noted further.

Secretary Jesse M. Robredo and Secretary Joel M. Rocamora of the Department of the Interior and Local Government (DILG) and National Anti-Poverty Commission (NAPC), respectively, echoed this sentiment as well. In his message featured in the souvenir program, Secretary Robredo underscored the urgency of covering all provinces nationwide by 2012. He further said that it is his wish “to see other provinces, and their component cities and municipalities, adopt and implement the CBMS and eventually enhance local governance to provide a better quality of life to their constituents.” Meanwhile, Secretary Rocamora pointed out that “through the CBMS, we have been able to build the capacities of our local government units (LGUs) to develop and enrich their databases, thereby enabling them to design, target, implement, and monitor their own social services and programs.”

Secretary Imelda Nicolas of the Commission on Filipinos Overseas (CFO) for her part revealed her agency’s plan to use CBMS in guiding “diaspora philanthropy.” She said that the CFO will utilize the CBMS poverty maps to inform and educate donors on where best to put their donation to work.

“With CBMS, for instance, we can generate more donations specifically targeted to waterless areas, direct medical missions to areas with higher reported rates of disease, infant and maternal mortality, increase school buildings where there are none, and scholarships to children in households that need them most. This will also prod many of the LGUs to institutionalize CBMS in their planning procedures. Knowing that donors look at CBMS to guide their philanthropy will prompt more and more LGUs to invest in the system, in the process increasing the level of transparency in local governance particularly in terms of development planning,” Secretary Nicolas further noted.

Mr. Archimedes King, President of the Angelo King Foundation Inc. (AKFI), on the other hand, said that the wide coverage of CBMS all over the archipelago bodes well for grant-making donor organizations such as the AKFI. He pointed out that these organizations always spend a significant amount of their resources in trying to establish baseline information which is critical for their monitoring processes. But with CBMS in place, these organizations can reallocate the money initially allotted for data collection activities to direct program cost. “For AKFI and similar organizations, this means that we will be able to help more people help themselves,” Mr. King added. He then disclosed his intent to collaborate with the CBMS Network in establishing a competitive grants program where LGUs can apply for a grant for a school building project.

Meanwhile, Dr. Evan Due, Senior Regional Program Specialist of IDRC, said that they
CBMS Network launches new publications

Our publications were launched by the Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS) Network during the 7th CBMS Philippines National Conference held on February 7-9, 2011 at the Sofitel Philippine Plaza Manila. These are the (i) Status Reports on the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) Using CBMS Data, (ii) The Many Faces of Poverty (Volume 2), (iii) Impact of the Rising Prices of Food and Fuel on Poverty in Cambodia, Ghana and the Philippines, and (iv) Building Partnerships, Strengthening Capacities and Fostering Responsive and Accountable Governance (Proceedings of the 2009 CBMS Philippines National Conference).

Secretary Jose Eliseo Rocamora, Lead Convenor of the National Anti-Poverty Commission (NAPC), was the guest of honor during the launching.

Prepared with the technical assistance and support of the CBMS Network, National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA) and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), the Status Reports on the MDGs Using CBMS Data featured the following provinces: Agusan del Norte, Agusan del Sur, Biliran, Camarines Norte, Eastern Samar, Marinduque, Romblon, Sarangani and Siquijor. These reports are expected to enable development stakeholders to prepare in order to overcome the potential obstacles in attaining the MDG targets by 2015 and to enable the country to complete the course in achieving them. The reports are also expected to bring increased awareness that the attainment of the MDGs ultimately depends on the provision of basic services whose function has been devolved to the local government units.

The Many Faces of Poverty (Volume 2) is a compilation of statistical tables and poverty maps of seven provinces generated through the CBMS methodology. The provinces featured in this volume are Agusan del Sur, Dinagat Islands, Marinduque, Oriental Mindoro, Palawan, Sarangani, and Southern Leyte. The statistics presented in this publication are based on the CBMS surveys conducted in these provinces during a 4-year period – from 2005-2008. The publication attempts to identify who and where the poor are as it provides a comprehensive picture of the different faces of poverty in the seven provinces. It will also aid in identifying the most pressing needs of the various communities, assist in prioritizing interventions to address these needs, and facilitate the targeting of programs for those who need the assistance most.

Meanwhile, the Impact of the Rising Prices of Food and Fuel on Poverty in Cambodia, Ghana and the Philippines provides an assessment of the impact on poverty of the significant increase in the prices of food and fuel which happened during the first half of 2008. The CBMS data collected for this study were used in monitoring changes in the welfare conditions of the households in the sentinel sites.

Finally, the book Building Partnerships, Strengthening Capacities and Fostering Responsive and Accountable Governance is a compilation of the papers presented during the 6th CBMS Philippines National Conference held at the Manila Diamond Hotel on December 8-10, 2009.

These publications may be downloaded from the Poverty and Economic Policy (PEP) website at: www.pep-net.org.
News Updates

CBMS Network holds PEP School on Poverty Mapping

The PEP School was attended by a total of 17 researchers from 9 CBMS implementing countries. The goal of the workshop was to equip the participants with the knowledge on how to generate poverty maps.

A total of 17 researchers from CBMS-partner institutions in Argentina, Benin, Burkina Faso, Indonesia, Kenya, Lao PDR, Nigeria, Peru and Zambia attended the Poverty and Economic Policy (PEP) School on Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS) Poverty Mapping held on March 14-18, 2011 at the Somerset Millennium, Makati City, Philippines.

The five-day event aimed to introduce to these researchers the CBMS-Natural Resources Database (NRDB)-based poverty mapping methodology utilized by CBMS-Philippines. The training workshop was also intended to equip the participants with knowledge on how to create CBMS poverty maps using the CBMS-NRDB and to interpret the results. Researchers from the CBMS-Philippines headed by CBMS Network Leader, Dr. Celia M. Reyes, served as resource persons.

Topics covered during the workshop include: familiarization with the CBMS-NRDB environment, utilization of existing spatial and non-spatial data, creation of new spatial data, and overview of the CBMS data processing system in the Philippines.

At the beginning of the training workshop, the participants presented the status of the CBMS projects in their respective countries which provided an opportunity to exchange learnings and experiences. The participants also learned how to manage their CBMS databases. At the end of the training, the participants presented the poverty maps for the different administrative levels in their project sites. The participants agreed that using thematic maps would greatly help them in their efforts to actively engage local government officials in poverty alleviation initiatives.