9 provincial reports highlight disparities in MDG attainment

With five years to go before 2015 when the eight anti-poverty goals should have been achieved, Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS)-based reports on the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) of nine provinces in the Philippines released this year highlighted disparities between their status and the 2015 national targets.

The MDGs are eight international development goals that all 192 United Nations member states and at least 23 international organizations have agreed to achieve by the year 2015. These include eradicating extreme poverty, reducing child mortality rates, fighting disease epidemics such as AIDS, and developing a global partnership for development. The CBMS can generate indicators for all of these eight goals. Table 1 shows some of the indicators generated for some of the goals of the nine provinces.

The nine provinces of Agusan del Norte, Agusan del Sur, Biliran, Camarines Norte, Eastern Samar, Marinduque, Romblon, Sarangani, and Siargao took stock of their status on the MDGs with the assistance of the PEP-CBMS Network, National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA) and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Philippines; laid out some concrete steps; and identified financing requirements to close the remaining gaps.

The collaboration aimed to sustain the momentum and build on the gains of the Philippine government, which had previously published 3 national progress reports on the MDGs: the first in January 2003, the second in June 2005, and a midterm report in June 2007, and also produced 17 sub-national (regional) reports in 2007-2008.
The preparation of provincial MDG reports was considered significant not only because  
this was the first time that these provinces will take stock of their achievements on the MDG  
goals and targets but also because they will attempt to formulate their reports using data  
that they themselves have collected through the CBMS methodology.

Available statistics from the National  
Statistical Office are currently not disaggregated enough to allow local  
government units (LGUs) to track where they are vis-a-vis their MDG targets.

The CBMS that is being implemented in several LGUs in the country is touted to be  
well-positioned to track progress toward the MDGs at the local level. For one, a number of  
indicators being monitored in the CBMS are included in the indicators for monitoring progress toward the MDGs. Moreover, CBMS is intended to be done on a regular basis and can therefore be used for updating MDG indicators and for facilitating the preparation of regular MDG reports. The CBMS can also be used by the national and local governments as basis for costing and identifying appropriate interventions needed to achieve the MDGs, as well as for resource allocation. Finally, given the large spatial disparities, the CBMS can help identify where focus has to be given to achieve the targets.

The formulation of the MDG reports was also considered as very timely: exactly five years  
before the eight anti-poverty goals should have been achieved. As the year 2015 draws near, sub-national progress reports will enable development stakeholders to prepare and overcome potential obstacles and ensure that the country attains the goals and targets— informed by the findings and
recommendations generated from these reports.

The MDG reports will also bring increased awareness that the attainment of the MDGs ultimately depends on the provision of basic services, which are functions devolved to the LGUs. In fact, some of the local chief executives of the nine provinces have identified priority policies and programs to respond to the gaps and have committed funding for some of these programs. Meanwhile, other LGUs have set aside funds for the printing and dissemination of their reports.

The capacity building of the Provincial MDG Teams consisted of three workshops and one-on-one mentoring process, as follows:

- **Processing of CBMS Data to Generate MDG Indicators.** This workshop was designed to provide participants with (i) a deeper appreciation of the importance of the CBMS in benchmarking/tracking local progress toward the attainment of the MDGs, (ii) a satisfactory level of knowledge in processing CBMS data to facilitate analyses of accomplishments versus targets, (iii) some basic skills on how to incorporate MDG targets in local development plans and facilitate corresponding increase in budget allocation for MDG-responsive projects, and (iv) tools and methodologies in formulating MDG reports.

- **Preparation of Provincial MDG Reports Using CBMS Data.** This workshop was designed to build on the gains of the first workshop by providing technical assistance to the Project Teams in (i) processing CBMS data to generate the additional MDG indicators and consolidating their data at the provincial level, (ii) benchmarking/tracking their progress toward the attainment of the MDGs, (iii) reviewing partial provincial reports based on the indicators generated using the first workshop, and (iv) finalizing list of indicators to be included in the report.

- **Presentation and Critiquing of Provincial MDG Reports.** This workshop was designed to finalize the Provincial MDG Reports while providing an opportunity for an exchange of views, possible harmonization of approaches, as well as providing consistent guidance to all the Provincial MDG Teams. The expected output from this workshop was the complete manuscript of the MDG Report that already incorporates the comments/inputs of the assigned mentor and resource persons who were invited to share their expertise during the workshop.

- **Mentor/Mentee Relationship.** To ensure a sustained and focused mentoring program, a mentor from the Research Team of the CBMS Network was matched to one Provincial MDG Team. The assigned mentor was expected to set a specific time each week to interact with his/her Provincial MDG Team and discuss the following: (i) review progress in the drafting of the Provincial MDG Report, (ii) set/identify targets for the coming weeks, and (iii) draw up an action plan to achieve those targets. In addition, the mentor was expected to assist his/her assigned MDG Team in identifying and solving problem areas.

The Philippine government and the United Nations-Philippines Country Office formally launched the status reports on the MDGs of nine partner provinces of the PEP-CBMS Network, together with the 2010 national progress report, during the Stakeholders Step-Up Campaign on the MDGs on September 8, 2010 at the Dusit Thani Hotel in Makati City. The event was graced by President Benigno Simeon C. Aquino III, who also gave the keynote address. The national progress report and the provincial reports were presented by Secretary Cayetano W. Paderanga Jr. of the NEDA. Copies of the Provincial MDG Reports were also made available to the public through the UNDP, NEDA, and PEP websites.

A session on “Achieving the Millennium Development Goals” was also held during the 48th Annual Meeting of the Philippine Economic Society at the Bangko Sentral ng Pilipinas (BSP). Three provinces (Agusan del Norte, Biliran, and Sarangani) presented their MDG reports during the session. These dissemination activities have prompted other provinces to express interest in preparing CBMS-based MDG reports.
CBMS Team recommends providing assistance to poverty-stricken Tana River District in Kenya

The CBMS Team in Kenya headed by Dr. Mary Amuyunzu-Nyamongo, also the executive director of the African Institute for Health and Development (AIHD), recommended that the Kenyan government put in place measures to address acute shocks that the Tana River District is facing and at the same time address infrastructural deficiencies in its overall development.

In a report that compared two study periods (2008 and 2009) the poverty trends in the area in terms of the ability of households to access social services such as health, education, safe drinking water, and wealth-creation opportunities, the research team headed by Dr. Nyamongo noted that the drought and the resultant food shortage had negative impacts on education, income, and access to water with long-term implications on the livelihoods and well-being of the communities.

Tana River District is prone to periodic droughts that usually begin around July and end by October. However, the 2009 drought extended until December, which affected many households. During this episode, most of the residents in the area depended on relief goods.

When the research team set out in 2008 to lay the groundwork for the implementation of the local poverty monitoring system (LPMS) in the area, they selected three sub-locations namely Tarasaa, Laini, and Walesorrhea. These three represent three livelihood zones in the district, namely, marginal mixed farming, mixed farming, and pastoral livelihoods. The first and second rounds of data collection were conducted from July to August 2008 and July to October 2009, respectively, with the longer second round being caused by the increase in study sites for the study. The second round of data collection surveyed the same households covered in 2008. Between the two study periods, Tana River District experienced a 14% growth in its household population.

Table 1. Household Information on the Study Sites, CBMS-Kenya 2008 and 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Zone Characteristics</th>
<th>Number of Households, 2008</th>
<th>Number of Households, 2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Walesorrhea sub-location</td>
<td>Pastoral</td>
<td>692</td>
<td>694</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laini sub-location</td>
<td>Marginal mixed farming</td>
<td>946</td>
<td>1,133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tarasaa sub-location</td>
<td>Mixed farming</td>
<td>1,110</td>
<td>1,295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>2,748</td>
<td>3,122</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Some of the research team’s key findings are presented below:

School Attendance

The proportion of out-of-school children aged 6-12 and 13-17 years increased although not significantly. This could be due to migration in search of pasture for the pastoralist households or due to the need for immediate income for farming communities. School dropout is an indicator, in this case, of stress at the household level that forces individuals and households to adopt coping measures that impact on younger people (MDG Report 2010). Low school attendance implies that the community will continue to have high levels of illiteracy unless action is taken to retain children in school especially during economic shocks. In fact, Tana River is one of the districts where pupils perform poorly in the National Examinations in the country (GoK 2006). According to the latest United Nations’ Millennium Development Goal (MDG) status report, the Arid and Semi-Arid Lands (ASAL) region where Tana River is located, has low literacy rates (MDG 2010 Status report). This low figure indicates an urgent need for measures to ensure regional parity in education attainment.
Table 2. Indicators on Education and Literary, Tana River District, CBMS-Kenya, 2008 and 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of children aged 6-12 years old who are not attending elementary school</td>
<td>18.3</td>
<td>28.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of children aged 13-16 years old who are not attending secondary school</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of youth aged 15-24 years who are not literate</td>
<td>29.9</td>
<td>31.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Water and Sanitation
The main water sources for the study areas included river Tana, boreholes, seasonal rivers, dams and ponds, piped water supply, and several shallow wells located along the river line. The decline in access to safe water for domestic use could be attributed to the severe drought that affected the country in 2008. In addition, the river Tana changed its course during the same period, which affected the residents of Garsen Division (Tarasaa and Golbanti) who rely on it for domestic use. These results confirm those from the Kenya Demographic and Health Survey 2008-2009 (KNBS, 2009) that showed that 46% of rural households in Kenya got their water from non-improved sources in the form of unprotected wells, rivers, and springs.

The study shows limited access to sanitary facilities in the study sites. However, from the two surveys, it emerged that access to sanitary facilities significantly increased from 27.8% in 2008 to 43.6% in 2009. This was mainly related to the efforts of a nongovernment organization (NGO), which is working toward improving sanitation in the project site. This intervention serves to illustrate the importance of partnership in addressing community-level problems.

Table 3. Indicators on Access to Safe Water and Sanitation, Tana River District, CBMS-Kenya, 2008 and 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of households with access to safe water supply</td>
<td>68.90</td>
<td>54.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of households with access to sanitary toilet facilities</td>
<td>27.80</td>
<td>43.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average distance covered by women in search of water less than 1 km</td>
<td>Less than 1 km</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Food Security
Food shortage remained high and there was a decrease in the number of households who had a balanced diet. This is despite a reported increase in the proportion of households that had access to farmland and those with livestock between the study periods.

The households that experienced food shortage three months prior to the census remained the same at 70.9% and 71%, respectively. Those that had a balanced diet one month prior to the census were reduced significantly from 35.7% to 25%, respectively. Meanwhile, those who experienced loss of source of livelihood (farm produce—59% and 58.5%) and (livestock—42.4% and 37.8%) remained almost the same within the study period. The main cause for the loss of livestock and farm produce was drought. The study participants noted that there is usually an increase in animal diseases when there is drought.

Table 4. Indicators on Food Security, Tana River District, CBMS-Kenya, 2008 and 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of households that experienced food shortage</td>
<td>70.9</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of households who had balanced diet</td>
<td>35.7</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of households with farmland</td>
<td>39.3</td>
<td>54.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of household with livestock</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>39.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of households that lost livestock</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>37.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of households that lost farm produce</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>58.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Health
The health indicators showed a slight improvement between the two periods of data collection. In particular, the proportion of households with women who died of pregnancy-related causes decreased by more than 2% in 2009, as well as the proportion of households with children aged 0-5 years old who died (11.4% in 2009 from 18.2% in 2008). The proportion of households with members who got sick and who suffered from preventable diseases also decreased considerably in 2009. This could be attributed to the fact that the second round of data collection was conducted during a dry season and, hence, lower incidences of water-borne diseases.

Access to Government Programs
Access to different government initiatives was low in both phases of the study with majority of households not able to access these programs, which are aimed at poverty alleviation. This shows that national level programs may not be reaching people in remote and marginalized areas thereby negating the anticipated impacts on poverty alleviation. Given the vulnerability to shocks experienced by residents in these areas, it is critical that efforts be made to build the asset base for the poor families. Emergency response, in the form of food relief, although useful as a stopgap measure, is not sufficient to cushion households from falling into deeper poverty.

continuation on page 6
CBMS Team recommends... from page 4

Table 5. Indicators on Health, Tana River District, CBMS-Kenya, 2008 and 2009

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>2008 %</th>
<th>2009 %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of households with children aged 0-5 years old who died</td>
<td>18.2</td>
<td>11.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of households with women who died due to pregnancy-related causes</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of households with children aged 0-5 years old who are malnourished</td>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of households with household members who have been sick in the last two weeks (prior to the date of data collection)</td>
<td>72.4</td>
<td>56.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion of households with members suffering from preventable conditions (e.g., malaria and diarrhea) in the last two weeks</td>
<td>65.9</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CBMS-Tanzania completes 2nd round of data collection

The CBMS Team in Tanzania successfully completed its second round of data collection in three Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS) sites in August this year. A total of 39,256 households were interviewed in all project sites—33,957 households in Dodoma; 2,876 households in Morogoro; and 3,260 households in Lushoto district.

The CBMS Team has lined up data analysis and preparation of technical reports and research papers based on the results of the data collection as among its next set of activities.

This round of CBMS implementation in Tanzania involves monitoring the impacts of the global financial crisis (GFC) on poverty and household coping strategies. A series of consultation and workshops was conducted at the community level in each sentinel site in the municipalities of Dodoma and Morogoro and in the Lushoto district in April 2010 and at the municipal level in May 2010 to introduce the initiative. Local Area Development Committee members, Dodoma Municipal Council representatives, nongovernment organizations, representatives from the Office of the District Commissioners, CBMS team members, and enumerators were among those who attended the workshops.

Data collected during the first round using Ward/Village Profile questionnaires have already been compiled and the results were presented as Ward Profiles (for 19 urban sentinel sites) and Village Profile (for rural sentinel site at Nala village).

Project Leader Rangya Muro had earlier presented his team’s research findings on the impacts of the GFC in the three project sites during the 8th Poverty and Economic Policy (PEP) Network Meeting held in Dakar, Senegal in June.

The CBMS was pilot tested in 2006 in Nala Village and K/Ndege Ward in the Municipality of Dodoma. CBMS is being implemented by the Dodoma Municipal Council.

CBMS-Tanzania completes 2nd round of data collection

The CBMS Team recommends linking future KPP or similar interventions with the CBMS efforts of NAPC in order to provide a practical, cost-effective, and standardized alternative for benchmarking, measuring performance, and assessing effects. “Otherwise, proper quantitative assessments with testable hypothesis can be very costly and complex to set up,” the authors said.

CBMS-Tanzania completes 2nd round of data collection

The CBMS Team in Tanzania noted that certain shocks—in this case, the drought that occurred in 2009—may have lasting impacts on the communities. As can be seen from the findings for the period 2009, the drought created negative impacts particularly on access to water and sanitary toilet. Meanwhile, the food shortage that followed after the drought, affected the education, income, and health outcomes of the households in the project sites. The CBMS Team thus recommended that the government of Kenya create interventions that would help mitigate the adverse affects of shocks on vulnerable communities.

The CBMS Team in Kenya noted that certain shocks—in this case, the drought that occurred in 2009—may have lasting impacts on the communities. As can be seen from the findings for the period 2009, the drought created negative impacts particularly on access to water and sanitary toilet. Meanwhile, the food shortage that followed after the drought, affected the education, income, and health outcomes of the households in the project sites. The CBMS Team thus recommended that the government of Kenya create interventions that would help mitigate the adverse affects of shocks on vulnerable communities.

Report recommends... from page 7

The projects are situated in poor communities, which were identified based on some specific criteria. A total of P90 million had already been released to NAPC from the PSF of which P79.56 million have been used to finance 237 KPPs nationwide.

Conducted by Dr. Donato Antiporta and Eleanora Tan and with funding support from the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) through the Poverty Reduction and Support for the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) Program, the study titled “Assessment of the KALAH! Prototype Projects” assessed the implementation of 15 sample KPPs through a multi-stakeholder consultative approach.

The authors of the report further recommended linking future KPP or similar interventions with the CBMS efforts of NAPC in order to provide a practical, cost-effective, and standardized alternative for benchmarking, measuring performance, and assessing effects. “Otherwise, proper quantitative assessments with testable hypothesis can be very costly and complex to set up,” the authors said.
CBMS-OPHI survey results show positive correlation between educational attainment and psychological well-being

Results of the Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS) Network’s survey initiative on the “Missing Dimensions of Poverty” suggest that there may be significant differences in the quality of work, empowerment, ability to go about life without shame, and psychological well-being among individuals with different educational attainments.

The survey is part of the network’s ongoing collaboration with the Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative (OPHI) titled “Testing the Missing Dimensions of Poverty.” The project aims to pilot test survey modules for the following themes: (1) safety from violence, (2) empowerment, (3) employment quality, (4) dignity and self-respect, and (5) meaning and value. Data collection started at the two sites—Pasay City and Batangas—last October 2009.

Among the most notable results from Barangay 8o in Pasay City and Barangay Lumbangan in Rosario, Batangas are as follows:

- Workers who are better educated are less likely to be employed in jobs that do not have employment benefits;
- Higher income is associated with having more employment benefits;
- Results suggest that individuals with higher educational attainment are more likely to be in a better state of psychological well-being;
- Better-educated respondents are more likely to have higher levels of autonomy, further suggesting a link between education and empowerment in general;
- Respondents with lower levels of education are more prone to feelings of shame; and
- The group with the lowest educational attainment experienced more disrespect and prejudiced and unfair treatment.

Other key findings are as follows:

- More young respondents reported that they can change things in their community;
- Urban respondents are more likely to see themselves as agents of change in their community or neighborhood compared to rural respondents;
- Autonomy is found to be highest with respect to religious practice;
- Respondents who are poor are more likely to report that they are not happy and satisfied with life overall;
- Poor individuals tend to be more prone to feelings of shame;
- A large proportion of employed individuals do not receive any kind of protection in terms of employment benefits;
- There were more victims of crime against property in the urban area than in the rural area; and
- More non-poor respondents experienced crimes against property while more poor respondents were victims of crimes against person.

The results were presented to local officials and members of the community of the two project sites as part of the validation activity. Based on the results of the validation activity, greater involvement from the sites’ local governments on livelihood promotion and education-related initiatives were suggested to broaden the residents’ opportunities in getting jobs and improving their living conditions.

Report recommends use of CBMS in selecting KPP villages in the Philippines

An independent external evaluation of the KALAHI Prototype Projects (KPP) commissioned by the National Anti-Poverty Commission (NAPC) recommended the extension of this poverty-alleviation effort of the Philippine government to more villages “with the choice guided by analytical assessments of the Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS)socioeconomic profiles and assessments.”

The KPPs are one-time, short-gestating, poverty-alleviation projects with implementation periods of approximately six months to less than one year and with
News Updates

7th CBMS-Philippines Conference to be held in Manila

Some 300 participants from local government units, national government agencies, academic institutions, and nongovernment and civil society organizations will converge for the 7th Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS)-Philippines Conference on February 7-9, 2011 at the Sofitel Hotel in Manila, Philippines.

The conference will serve as a venue where various stakeholders can share learnings and experiences on poverty-alleviation efforts. Among the highlights of this year’s conference are presentations on the current uses of CBMS such as in the preparation of sub-national Millennium Development Goal (MDG) reports, for monitoring manifestations of climate change, for disaster/crisis risk planning and monitoring, for program targeting, and other related applications.

In line with this, the CBMS Network is encouraging local partners in the Philippines to submit papers to be presented at the conference. Papers should tackle and discuss in detail relevant issues, lessons learned, and best practices and strategies on the use of CBMS on any (but not limited to) the following topics: local governance, gender-responsive budgeting, impact monitoring, assessment of programs and projects, monitoring and mitigating risks of climate change, disaster risk planning and management, poverty mapping, program targeting, crisis monitoring, achieving the MDGs, and monitoring child labor and poverty.

Live-out conference fee is ₱4,500 per person, which covers conference kits as well lunch and snacks during the conference dates. An early-bird conference fee of ₱3,600 per person will be provided to registered participants who will remit payment of their registration fees not later than January 15, 2011.

Interested partners may check the following website for more information: http://www.pep-net.org/events/events-pages/7th-cbms-philippines-national-conference.

CBMS Network Updates is the quarterly newsletter of the CBMS Network of the PEP Project. This work was carried out by the Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies with financial support from the Government of Canada through the International Development Research Centre (IDRC) and the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA).

The Updates may be downloaded free from the Project’s website: http://www.pep-net.org.

For inquiries, please write or call:
PEP-CBMS Network Coordinating Office
Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies
De La Salle University - Manila
10th Flr. Angelo King International Center
Estrada cor. Arellano Sts., Malate, Manila 1004, Philippines
Tel No: (632) 523-8888 loc. 274
DL/Telefax No: (632) 526-2067
E-mail: cbms@dls-csb.edu.ph
cbms.network@gmail.com

Editorial Staff

Celia M. Reyes
Editor-in-Chief

Jennifer P.T. Liguton
Managing Editor

Jeffrey G. Aceron
Marsmath A. Baris, Jr.
Steffie Joi I. Calubayan
Jeremy L. De Jesus
Novee Lor C. Legaspi
Anne Bernadette E. Mandap
Jasminda A. Quilitis
Erica Paula S. Sioson
Alellie B. Sobreviñas
Researchers/Writers

CBMS NETWORK UPDATES
PEP-CBMS Network Coordinating Team
Angelo King International Center for Economic & Business Studies
De La Salle University - Manila
10th Flr. Angelo King International Center
Estrada cor. Arellano Sts., Malate, Manila 1004, Philippines