Youth Employment and Entrepreneurship: A Case Study of the Punjab Province, Pakistan

Research Analytics International (Private) Limited
www.researchanalyticsintl.org
Research Paper No. 01
Second Draft (Version 0.3)

Research Team
Nadeem Akhtar
Shujaat Farooq
Fatima Yamin
Ruhma Amin
Aadil Waseem

“This work was carried out with a grant from the Partnership for Economic Policy (PEP)-CBMS Network supported by the International Development Research Centre (IDRC)”. 
# Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations .................................................................................................................. 4  
Abstract ........................................................................................................................................ 5  
1. Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 6  
2. Problem Statement ................................................................................................................ 6  
3. Objectives of the Study .......................................................................................................... 7  
4. Framework of Analysis ......................................................................................................... 7  
   4.1. Research theme ................................................................................................................ 7  
      4.1.1. Relevance .................................................................................................................. 7  
      4.1.2. Proposed Research Questions ............................................................................... 9  
      4.1.3. Policy questions ....................................................................................................... 9  
   4.2. Modelling on youth employment and entrepreneurship indicators ......................... 11  
   4.3. Planned flow of analysis ................................................................................................. 13  
5. Developing the Context of Employment and Entrepreneurship Trends in Pakistan: The Data Gap ........................................................................................................................................ 14  
6. Literature Review .................................................................................................................. 16  
   6.1. Background Information and Demographic Transition in Pakistan ......................... 16  
   6.2. Youth Bulge and Employment ...................................................................................... 17  
7. Methodological Framework and Data Collection of the Study ....................................... 21  
   7.1. Target population ........................................................................................................... 22  
   7.2. Sampled Selected Areas ............................................................................................... 22  
8. Youth Policy Examination .................................................................................................... 24  
   8.1. Punjab Youth Policy 2012 ............................................................................................. 25  
      8.2.1 Salient Features of Punjab Youth Policy ..................................................................... 26  
      8.2.2 Strategic Action Plan of Punjab Youth Policy .......................................................... 27  
      8.2.3 Skill Development and Vocational Training of Punjab Youth Policy ....................... 27  
      8.2.4 Entrepreneurship Activities in Punjab Youth Policy ............................................... 29  
      8.2.5 Internships, On Campus Job and Job Placements in Punjab Youth Policy .... 29
Research Findings................................................................................................................30
Summary of Findings and Policy Recommendations .........................................................33
9. Annexure I: List of YEE Indicators..................................................................................34
10. References.....................................................................................................................40
### List of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CBMS</td>
<td>Community Based Monitoring System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEM</td>
<td>Global Entrepreneurship Monitor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIES</td>
<td>Household Integrated Economic Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HPQ</td>
<td>Household Profile Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT</td>
<td>Information Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JA</td>
<td>Job Analyst</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KPK</td>
<td>Khyber Pakhtun Khah</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFP</td>
<td>Labour Force Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFSs</td>
<td>Labour Force Surveys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDGs</td>
<td>Millennium Development Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOS</td>
<td>Minister of State</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAVTEC</td>
<td>National Vocational and Technical Education Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non Governmental Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NIP</td>
<td>National Internship Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBS</td>
<td>Pakistan Bureau of Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEP</td>
<td>Partnership for Economic Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIHS</td>
<td>Pakistan Integrated Household Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSIC</td>
<td>Punjab Small Industries Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSLM</td>
<td>Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PYDF</td>
<td>Punjab Youth Development Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PYVM</td>
<td>Punjab Youth Volunteer Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QI</td>
<td>Qualification Inflation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RM</td>
<td>Realized Match</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMEDA</td>
<td>Small and Medium Enterprise Development Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEA</td>
<td>Total Entrepreneurship Activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPB</td>
<td>Theory of Planned Behaviour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TRA</td>
<td>Theory of Reasoned Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UC</td>
<td>Union Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNCTAD</td>
<td>United Nations Conference on Trade and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WSA</td>
<td>Workers Self Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zakat</td>
<td>Muslims’ annual giving to poor of their specified extra wealth's 2.5%.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YEE</td>
<td>Youth Employment and Entrepreneurship</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abstract

This paper is specifically focused at youth aged 15-30 in two CBMS sites in the Punjab Province. Along side implementation of core CBMS indicators, youth focused specific indicators were also collected from youth within the households. The objectives are to look at employment situation of the youth, their education, entrepreneurial activities, and competitiveness. What determines the economic participation of youth in different employment sectors, particularly in self-employment is investigated through logistic regression analysis. Since success in entrepreneurship is linked with competitiveness in the market, a comprehensive competitiveness index (CI) is also developed for youth. Results show that higher education, vocational training, ability to use computer effectively, English language communication skills, and better socioeconomic background positively influence self-employment/entrepreneurship for youth in the CBMS-Pakistan sites.
1. Introduction

Rapid population growth, poor economic performance and lack of long term policy commitments make Pakistan the most challenging country in the world in terms of long term sustainable economic development that can integrate and consume extended working age population. The population is increasing at the rate of about 2 percent per annum. According to UN population projects, Pakistan’s total population is currently estimated to be 178 million (2012) and expected to reach 240 million in 2030 and 275 million by 2050. Pakistan currently has more than 46 percent young people (aged: 15-30) of its total population.

The key important economic activities differ across the provinces and each province has different economies like Punjab is mostly the agricultural province and Balochistan is mostly arid. In Sindh province, the urban city Karachi being the major urban city of Pakistan as well is the main industrial city but day by day deteriorating security situation created havoc for the city’s economy to grow and even to sustain. Karachi is financial and commercial hub of Pakistan that constitutes about 60% of the total economy of the country (Pak Institute of Peace Studies, 2009). 18th Amendment in the constitution of Pakistan came as a bright star that may lead to prosperity led by each province. Resources, decision powers and machinery have been transferred to provincial governments. Each province has to devise its own population, development, health, education and economic policies keeping in view the grass roots situation. Unfortunately, in Pakistan, no such data exist that could lead to informed decision making at each province regarding characteristics, situation, economies and specific trends about youth bulge.

This study is aimed to develop a CBMS system at grass roots level which will guide the Provincial Governments to regularly monitor the socio-development indicators for their effective planning, development and policy making for youth bulge and working age population. It comes under PEP theme of “Youth Employment and Entrepreneurship”. Since there is no already existing CBMS system, this study will also propose to integrate MDGs indicators that effect directly or indirectly the youth population. Recent constitutional amendment, called 18th Amendment, in the Constitution of Pakistan make it obligatory for Provincial authorities to plan and implement their own policies. Every Province of Pakistan is different from other Provinces and this rationalizes for the Province-sensitive CBMS development at grass roots level, however this proposal is focused to complete a CBMS pilot project in the Punjab Province. The findings of this pilot CBMS in the Punjab Province will be shared with other provincial authorities as well.

2. Problem Statement

To study the differential aspects of youth employment and entrepreneurship in Punjab, Pakistan by critical examination of the data generated through designing and pilot testing of CBMS using
the specific indicators of employment including the labour force participation, unemployment rate, level of skills and education, their employment by type of activity, sector and occupation and their absorption in the labour market as well as the issues and constraints faced by them.

3. Objectives of the Study
The study revolves around the following three objectives;

- To critically examine the data generated by CBMS and identify the differential vulnerabilities and factors in influencing the choice or decision-making between employment and entrepreneurship amongst the youth in Pakistan.
- To analyze the household on employment and income level, generated by the CBMS, for identification of crucial gaps in youth policy implementation for involvement/participation of youth in employment and entrepreneurship. The core obstacles in the way of youth entrepreneurship i.e. lack of access to credit, poverty, need for further education and training.
- To provide recommendations for effective targeting and strategizing in policy making for increasing youth participation in entrepreneurship at the grass root level.

4. Framework of Analysis
This section deals with the key important questions that will be taken into consideration while progressing on the project. We are themed at “Youth Employment and Entrepreneurship” that best fit in the current context of demographic transition in Pakistan. Following sub-sections provide details on framework of analysis.

4.1. Research theme

4.1.1. Relevance
In Pakistan, basic literature is missing particularly on youth entrepreneurship, mainly due to a topic missing from policy documents and research agenda. There is some research that indirectly link entrepreneurship with economic growth. In case of Pakistan, there is a great need for effective policy making regarding entrepreneurship. UNCTAD (2005) document¹ says, “with technological change and intensified global competition brought about by globalization and economic liberalization, the assumption that fostering entrepreneurship means fostering a country’s competitiveness today appears more valid than ever”. According to Global Entrepreneurship Monitor (GEM) (2010)², Pakistan is less enthusiastic towards entrepreneurship and falls under the factor-driven economies. GEM laid its foundations on one of its premises, that is, “an economy’s prosperity is highly dependent on a dynamic entrepreneurship sector and this is true for all stages of development”. GEM does not provide statistics on entrepreneurship

²This report can be accessed at http://ced.iba.edu.pk/GEMPakistan2010Report.pdf
by age categories. GEM Pakistan report 2011 report the same TEA rates and reported high
gender gaps.

According G. M. Arif (2009), absorption of growing labour force in Pakistan should be an
essential policy for Pakistan. According to his research, a major rise in the young workers (both
males and females) is projected to increase to 21 million in 2030 from 17 million in 2010. He
further asserted that “if young workers are not targeted now to improve their education and skill
levels to adjust them productively in the labour market, Pakistan may miss the one major
opportunity emerging from the on-going demographic transition”. The research highlights one
among five recommendations that “Self-employment opportunities need to be created by
investing in entrepreneurial workshops, vocational and skill trainings”.

No any study is found on youth entrepreneurship in Pakistan and this CBMS pilot will prove to
be a multifaceted and multipurpose project that will produce grass roots level data on youth
employment and entrepreneurship that would provide a base for further research and policy
discussion on the topic.

Below, the key topics are discussed that could add up to effective policy making for youth bulge
in Pakistan to reap the benefits of demographic transition.

1. Inequalities in the labour force market for youth bulge in terms of labour force
participation, occupation and sector of employment selection, wage inequalities, working
hours and regional differences
2. Role of necessity based and opportunity based entrepreneurship and self-employment
practices in household social and economic wellbeing.
3. The identification of main male and female labour intensive entrepreneurship and self-
employment sectors.
4. The core obstacles in the way of youth entrepreneurship i.e. lack of access to credit,
poverty, need for further education and training
5. Strength of Agriculture Based Entrepreneurship and self-employment practices to absorb
growing rural labour force and policy issues to support the sector
6. Issues of six dimensions of decent work for youth employed in formal sector and
percentage of youth living as ‘working poor’.
7. Effect of formal and informal youth labour force participation on household poverty
dynamics
8. Issues of skill mismatch, level of satisfaction and turnover behaviour of employed youth
9. Development of youth competitiveness index
   i. Level of education (basic, advance, professional, vocational)
   ii. Computer literacy
   iii. Technical courses
   iv. Languages proficiency, and
   v. Acquisition of advance knowledge
4.1.2. Proposed Research Questions

Proposed questions that are given below are an attempt to explore the youth entrepreneurship in the Pakistani context. These and other research questions will be further furnished/developed based on the literature review and identified gaps after analysis of secondary data.

1. Meeting the Youth Entrepreneurship Challenges: What are the challenges of different categories of youth (with an enterprise or self-employed/gender wise), present and future opportunities and what are the policy guidelines to tackle these challenges?

This research question is the basic need for policy formulation at community level. This will open a closed window for adequate evidence for local, district and provincial governments to promote youth employment and entrepreneurship. No evidence exists on this topic in Pakistan.

2. Is the existing educational system rightly supporting the youth to provide them the right skills and demanded by the labour market?

3. How much local entrepreneurship and self-employment labour market is absorbing youth in decent jobs?

4. The impact of youth entrepreneurship and self-employment activities on their own educational, skill acquisition and technical abilities

5. Starting from grass roots level: How Pakistan’s demographic dividend could be reaped?

6. What are the poverty dynamics by entrepreneurship type and by gender? OR “is there any link between youth entrepreneurship, inequality and household poverty?”

From across the country studies, see, e.g. Thurik & Carree (2002) for theoretical and empirical discussion on entrepreneurship and economic growth. GEM (2002) also found correlation between overall entrepreneurship activity and economic growth. Based on the findings, we can devise a very strong hypothesis that youth entrepreneurship has contributing effect on overall poverty reduction at household level.

7. How community and household poverty is linked to entrepreneurship activities in rural and urban areas of the Punjab?

This is simply going into detail on the findings of the entrepreneurship and poverty dynamics. This research question will highlight the difference on poverty and economic wellbeing of households segregated by gender and by rural-urban residence.

8. Which necessity based entrepreneurship and self-employment sectors have the prospects and ability to become opportunity based enterprises?

Pakistan has the small and cottage industry working particularly in rural areas and mostly self-employed by women with some technical skill and education. There is a need to identify the sectors that can be taken into SMEDA’s next five year plan to support them to be part of the Small and Medium Enterprises Domain.

4.1.3. Policy questions

Pakistan has youth affairs transferred to its federating units i.e. Provinces. Punjab is the biggest province of Pakistan in terms of population. It hosts largest proportion of young people and in

---

June 2012, Punjab Youth Policy\textsuperscript{4} was launched by government of the Punjab. The salient objectives of the policy that are linked to entrepreneurship more closely are:

- Local crafts based youth enterprises for income-generation at village and urban-neighbourhood level will be established and encouraged and professional assistance for marketing of such enterprise products will be provided.
- Sectoral initiatives in livestock and dairy development i.e. Rehabilitation of Mustahqueeni-Zakat (eligible to receive alms money) by promotion of livestock keeping, training of unemployed youth as veterinary workers, replication of Idara-e-Kissan model, provision of milk cooling tanks and promotion of livestock under the Barani Village Development Project.
- Institute a programme of certification of informally acquired skills by technicians and workers.
- Arrange entrepreneurship and training programme and guide and train youth to do business, to innovate and expand business.

These all points are welcomed but they lack substantially the importance of multi-sectoral approach to tackle the problem of youth employment and to enhance youth entrepreneurship under the auspices of public governance. We believe that while policy was developed, the lack of data was a major factor providing no grounds for policy makers to integrate wide spectrum of entrepreneurship sectors. Policy succinctly accepted the data gap on youth. It says “despite much nuisance and centrality of the youth bulge issue, there is too little data available on youth issues in Punjab” (Punjab Youth Policy, 2012, pp. 13). This CBMS is one of the milestone initiatives to provide the painful data gap for effective policy making at Provincial Level.

\textit{4.1.4. National Youth Policy Reforms}

Before the 18\textsuperscript{th} Amendment, there was a Ministry of Youth Affairs at Federal Level. National Youth Policy was developed in 2008 and different national and international stakeholders were implementing programs based on that policy. During first phase of the implementation of the 18\textsuperscript{th} Amendment, all youth related affairs are transferred to respective Provinces and therefore each province worked and finalized their own youth policies and there is no follow-up on National Youth Policy.

In this regard, a youth policy reforms were undertaken at provincial level. Now each province has its youth policy that is based on its own youth profile based on statistics coming from national surveys. Since there is no grassroots level authentic data source on youth and their employment related indicators, these policies need to be fed with key data at grassroots level.

\textsuperscript{4}Some basic information on the Punjab Youth Policy are given at http://www.punjabyouthpolicy.pk/Pyp.html
4.1.5. **Hypotheses**

Since this study has objectives to design and pilot CBMS on focus study along with other objectives specified on page 7 of this proposal, we plan to test different hypotheses after complete data are collected under this CBMS pilot. These hypotheses will be further adorned/furnished during and after the briefing paper based on available secondary data is produced. Some broad hypotheses include:

1. Patronizing youth entrepreneurship can boost up micro-level economic development in Punjab
2. Reducing gender gap in the entrepreneurship would reduce gender disparities on income side particularly by promoting the female intensive entrepreneurship and self-employment sectors.
3. Community based monitoring of youth employment and entrepreneurship is only option left for Punjab to reap its demographic dividend in the next 40 years—this could be developed in line with East Asian Miracle.
4. Household poverty levels are lower and micro economic indicators are better among households with youth engaged in self-employment and entrepreneurship activities.
5. Agricultural entrepreneurship has the potential to absorb growing rural labour force.

4.2. **Modelling on youth employment and entrepreneurship indicators**

The following hypotheses/research questions are highlighted

1. The youth based entrepreneurship depends on youth competitiveness index, wellbeing of the household (wealth index), poverty levels (poverty score card), entrepreneurs in close relationship, education, employment opportunities in area, per capital income, and residence.

Variables: Input variable is self-employment e.g. if youth is self-employed (1) or otherwise (0) and independent variables include youth competitiveness index, wellbeing of household (wealth index), poverty levels (poverty score card), education employment opportunities in area, and residence.

The binary logistic regression analysis will be used to predict on the model. The equation for this model will be

\[
\ln \left[ \frac{p}{(1 - p)} \right] = B_0 + B_1 X_1 + \cdots + B_n X_n
\]

Where p is the probability that youth is self-employed and B is an odd ratio and Xi is independent variable.

2. The type of entrepreneurship i.e. opportunity based (1) or necessity based (0) depends on age of the youth, education, region, lack of skills, access to finance, poverty level of a
household, language skills, business environment in the community, per capita income, and skill mismatch for type of business they are engaged.

Binary logistic regression will again be applied to produce the results on this hypothesis. Relative risk ratios to be a necessity based entrepreneur could also be applied.


The Measurement of Education-Job Mismatch, for example: The empirical work has relied on three main methods to measure the degree of education-job mismatch which are job analyst (JA) method, worker self assessment (WSA) method and realized match (RM) method. The secondary dataset (LFSs) fulfil the requirement of only RM measure. However, the education-job mismatch in this study will be estimated by all the three measures (JA, WSA, and RM) on the basis of CBMS dataset.

If E is the actual number of year of education and E' is number of years of education required for a job, thus over-education (E°) is represented by;

\[ E^o = 1 \text{ if } E > E' \text{ and } \]
\[ E^o = 0 \text{ otherwise } \]

Similarly, under-education (E") is determined as;

\[ E^u = 1 \text{ if } E' > E \text{ and } \]
\[ E^u = 0 \text{ otherwise } \]

If E^j is the estimated required education level by JA measure and the E^r is estimated required level by WSA measure, then qualification inflation (QI) can be measured as;

\[ QI = E^j - E^r \]

A positive value of QI indicates the qualification inflation which means that due to excess supply, the employer has raised the required education level (Green et al., 2002).

4. What are the determinants of youth unemployment in areas covered under CBMS?

Qayyum (2007) has extensively studied the determinants of youth unemployment in Pakistan by using Labour Force Survey (LFS) data. LFS data is segregated up to provincial level and no district level evidence could be extracted. CBMS study on youth employment and entrepreneurship will to generate evidence of youth unemployment at grassroots level.
The dependent variable would be youth employment: Unemployment (1) and employment (0). The marginal effects of the each of the independent variables will be calculated through probit modelling.

Other questions of similar nature can also be addressed based on probit or binary logistic modelling. For example, the analysis can be undertaken for the following research questions?

5. What are determinants of self-employment and entrepreneurship?

4.3. Planned flow of analysis
The research activity is based on two types of surveys. In first round, a household census in the project villages/circles will be completed. In this round, the data on core CBMS indicators along with youth focused indicators will be collected. These youth focused indicators are based on youth who are available in household at the time of interview like youth who are unemployed, studying, employed, family helpers, working on agriculture etc. The youth who are self employed and are entrepreneurs will identified during the first survey through an employment based module in CBMS Core Questionnaire and in the 2nd round, a focus study on ‘entrepreneurship’ will be carried out in the same field areas. Figure 1 below is an attempt to show the planned flow of the analysis. Though all research hypotheses and questions are exactly reflecting in the figure; however it provides only information on key variables.
5. Developing the Context of Employment and Entrepreneurship Trends in Pakistan: The Data Gap

It is difficult to assess the employment trends in a society where policy implementation takes decades to complete let alone its consistent updating. In countries where government market regulation is minimal, a free market may not only provide easy access to opportunities but also brings out its own constraints on small and medium enterprise development. “Evidence shows that despite numerous highly attractive incentives offered to foreign investors, Pakistan’s
performance in attracting the foreign investment has been poor. Similarly, despite the intensive trade liberalization, the trade performance has been dismal (Anwar, 2002; p.1). According to Kemal (2001), the taxation policy of the government, promotion of large firms at the cost of smaller ones and the “structure of public sector expenditures especially the policy towards provision of social services and transferring income to the poorer sections of the society” are the main reasons for economic constraints in the country (Kemal, 2001; 3).

Access to reliable information and statistics is also hard to obtain. The most contrivable data available in Pakistan comes from the Pakistan Bureau of Statistics (PBS). In addition, Household Income and Expenditure Surveys (HIES) and Pakistan Integrated Household Surveys (PIHS) conducted by the FBS are also available for scrutiny. Although the data on poverty and employment trends is presented in the dichotomy of urban and rural areas, provincial data may not be significant and fully representative especially of NWFP and Balochistan where access to only major cities would be existent because of lack of proper roads to the majority of locations (Kemal, 2001). The data presented does not adhere to the presence of complex industrial employments and tends to miss out on statistics related to self employment. Despite these discrepancies, these surveys are deemed to be the most descriptive data available in the country.

In the employment sector, there seems to be a decline in labour force participation equal to 0.3% from 33.3% in 2010-11 to 33% 2012-13. Whether it is trade liberalization, globalization or insecurity and conflict, a drop of 0.3% indicates inherent problems within the industry. The drop in participation can suggest two phenomenon; either industrial development has faced the setback that was expected from the insecure infrastructure or there is an inclination in the certain age-group of the population to move towards self-employment. It can also be both the phenomenon happening at once. However, it does not indicate how this effects the youth population.

Looking at participation data from the LFP 2012-13, it indicates the sector-wise distribution of labour participation. However, there is a more generalized presentation of the sectors rather than projecting a more focused data. The statistics are divided into agriculture, non-agriculture, formal and informal with a further provincial division. Notice how the non-agricultural sector encompasses all sectors technical, financial, service-based etc. Similarly according to Afzal and Nasir (1987) there also exists discrepancies in gender sector-wise distribution of labour. For them, the bias stems from the procedures and personnel selected to conduct the interviews for data collection. Thus the census and labour force data fails to capture a) the specifics of sector-wise labour force distribution and b) adequate and accurate data on female participation in economic activity in all relevant sectors (Afzal and Nasir; 1987). However, Kazi and Raza (1991) highlight the dualities in the data as unequal distribution of opportunities for women (of all ages) in the labour market. Same rules may apply to male population as well. Unemployed male youth from ages 15 – 24, forming the largest chunk of the unemployed, fall prey to the same ethos of inequality. However, the economic penetration and access to unskilled labour tends to be more advantageous to male youth than female (Arif and Chaudhry; 2008).
Lack of data and its specificities have a substantive effect on not only employment generation schemes and entrepreneurship in the country. Rather, its adverse effects on policy making bind the population in the vicious circle of negligence where grievances of the youth are not targeted and addressed. This study, with its mechanisms of data collection in place, will not only seek to provide projection and picture to these gaps. It also will contribute to enhancing the capacity of the provincial government in better targeting of plans, schemes and subsequently policies.

6. Literature Review

6.1. Background Information and Demographic Transition in Pakistan

Demographic Transition and Labour Force Scenario: In Pakistan, the demographic transition has made it at Stage 3 as according to the classical theory of demographic transition. Figure 1 illustrates the situation in Pakistan. The key message that we are focusing on here is that in future Pakistan needs to monitor the key development and youth bulge indicators at grass roots level to make provincial level policies that are sensitive to province wise situations to better adapt policies that ensures and promulgate the social and economic wellbeing.

Currently no data are available at grass roots level about working age population, youth bulge and labour force participation. The need to collect data on grass roots level is rudimentary before Provinces are ready to launch development initiatives as a result of 18th Amendment. The proposed list of indicators underscores the need to map the data on these indicators to make it convenient for policy makers to acknowledge and rectify the grass roots level needs for social and economic development.

Figure 2: Pakistan and stages of demographic transition

![Figure 2: Pakistan and stages of demographic transition](source: Sathar et al., (2009).)
Millennium Development Goals and current scenario: Pakistan is signatory of the Millennium Declaration 2000. However, the situation is not much encouraging as on majority indicators the country is on lag. A major drawback of not achieving the goal is the concentrated monitoring system as monitoring of the MDGs was being done through federal initiatives. One important argument for the achievement of MGDs is that they should be implemented at every level because ‘unless grass roots level communities are not involved, MGDs cannot be achieved’. There should be inclusiveness. However, the current scenario permits to look at the key and selected MDGs indicators at grass roots level to suggest for their integration into the CBMS that Provincial Government should annex when they will adopt the community based monitoring system.

Every year, the progress report on MDGs is prepared. The data sources used for the monitoring and report preparation of the MDGs report are “Pakistan Social Living Measurement Survey (PSLM)”. In the recent years, there were disputes on the poverty levels that are measured from “Pakistan Integrated Household Economic Survey (HIES)” that is part of the PSLM survey. Only in 2006, district wise ranking of the districts of Pakistan based on MDGs was given (MDGs Report, 2006). We consider it in the best of the interest of the Peoples of different Provinces that their governments integrate them into the CBMS to measure grass roots level development indicators. For the list of proposed MDGs that would be monitored at community level, please refer to the below sections of the proposal.

6.2. Youth Bulge and Employment

The youth population around the world has become a force to be reckoned with. In the developing world regions like South Asia, an increasing youth population can act as a catalyst for economic growth. However, when not harnessed with incentives and opportunities, it can also result in loss of a huge human resource potential. Although the definition of youth may vary across countries and regions, according to the Global Employment Trend for Youth, InternationalLabour Organization (ILO), the youth population represents 130 million of the world’s 550 million working poor unable to sustain their families in the income scale of less of 1$ per day poverty line. In addition, the majority of this working population is women. The report also puts global youth unemployment at 13.9 % in South Asia alone. The narrative dictates that increasing levels of unemployment or poor working conditions enhance the already prevailing poor social conditions of the majority of the population. It has thus become important in global and national commitment in development to precipitate employment creation for youth with targeted education and training needs (Lyngdoh, 2005).

Employment in Pakistan has faced the similar challenges of lack of appeal to the target audience i.e. youth, as well as the struggle to cope with the new challenges of the changing financial landscape of the globe. According to Irfan (2000), in its 60 years of history, the country’s economy had to deal with the frequent changes in political governments, budget deficits, imposing conditionalities of Stabilization and Structural Adjustment Programmes, not to mention
the lack of policy consistencies and institutional decay shattering the confidence of the internal as well as the foreign investor.

Potential youth plays a very important role in the development of a country. Youth, if properly guided and provided the necessary environment that enhances their abilities, skills and capability of working in an efficient environment, can bring socio-economic revolution in the country. History is replete with such examples. While, on the contrary, youth if not directed properly, can bring hurdles in promoting the social, human and economic capital, increase the number of jobless people which increases the level of crime rate, increase in poverty etc. So this issue holds a significant place both in the public and private sectors and is a foremost challenge for any country. With the formal economy surrounded by uncertainties, the informal sector has slowly tried to increase its influence over the years. Employment being more dependent on the problems in the formal economy’s institutions and structures, entrepreneurship becomes the society’s strategy to deal with the gaps. However, it still continues to experience problems in safe and secure regulation due to the inherent uncertainties in the legal, political and economic environment of the country. The aim of this document is to explore the available literature that combined together seeks to craft a picture of the state of youth employment and entrepreneurship in Pakistan.

Literature on youth employment in Pakistan gives explicit details on the relationship between the country’s economy and gaps in youth engagement in productive activities. With financial uncertainties in the economy, youth employment is said to have suffered extensively. However, the literature on the status of youth employment and entrepreneurship in Pakistan can be put in the following categories;

- Situational analysis and determinants of employment and unemployment amongst youth
- Behavioral analysis on motivation for entrepreneurship
- The Drivers as well as Barriers to youth participation
- Analysis of policy regarding youth

When conducting a situational analysis on youth employment, it is interesting to see how many of them are willing to start their career. For Fares and Dhushyanth (2006), in 65 countries 21% of the children under the age of 15 are economically active. For Pakistan, Faizunnisa (2005) finds that 50% of the young males in lowest income quintile start working before reaching the age of 15. In Brazil, Ilahi et al (2005) indicates how boys might enter the workforce around the age of 12 and were more likely to be from lowest income households than those who started work after the age of 12. Faizunnisa (2005) however, has shown that young male and females in rural areas are more likely to start working before the age of 15 than their urban counterparts.

According to Irfan (2000), the situation regarding recording of statistics is quite ambiguous as there are very few data sources that permit such a youth specific analysis simply because the
information on age-distribution is not readily available. By focusing on the dependency of employment generation on the economy of the country, Irfan (2000) examines the growth of the economy, patterns of income distribution and poverty profile in the 90s through the Labour Force Surveys. His research is based on a national policy analysis impacted by the brunt of Structured Adjustment Programs. He attributes high unemployment to low level of investment, transition to low protection regime, overall resource crunch and worsening governance structures. Qayyum (2007) explores the work behavior of youth and indicates that educated urban youth tend to quit their jobs voluntarily in the early phases of their career. Flower and Freeman (1996) have also indicated the same for the youth in United States. Similarly, Khan and Ali (1986) explored the work behavior a bulk of educated unemployed falling below the age of 30 in Pakistan. Qayyum (2007) however, has found differences in unemployment rate and work behavior amongst the four provinces. According to him, the unemployment status of Sindh and Baluchistan is more or less the same while the rate of unemployment is highly significant for North Western Frontier Province (NWFP) and insignificant for Punjab and Sindh. Job creation, work opportunities, training and education standards and investment is far better in Sindh and Punjab as compared to others. Urban to rural figures vary as well with unemployment being high in urban areas. Qayuum (2007) and Akhtar and Lubna (2002) have explored the phenomenon of disguised unemployment in rural areas. The dependency of the country on agricultural economy, forces youth to seek farming on family leased/owned land rather than joining the formal sector thus the statistics tend to overstate employment and understate unemployment. Employment of youth from rural areas in the larger formal sector is little or diminished due to lack of standardized education and training. For both Qayyum (2007) and Gayur (1989), low education opportunities, malfunctioning training systems and flaws in the system of allocation of resources, are the main causes of unemployment in the country. For Chaudry and Hamid (1998) and Haque (1994) the instance of unemployment among youth from rural areas increases as they migrate to the urban cities because of lack of institutional basis to accommodate such migrants.

Gender-based research is also available for work behavior of youth in Pakistan. A study by Naqvi and Lubna (2002) show that the low female labour force participation rate is because of the factors like age, education, marital status, male member of the household and the status of its employment and 0-5 aged children. In addition, for Qayyum (2007) and Irfan (2000), the traditional roles defined for females make it difficult for them to attain employment even with standard educational qualifications. Although the rate of female youth employment has increased over the decade but it is mostly pertinent to urban youth than rural areas. Furthermore another study by Arif and Chaudhry (2008) indicated that the benefits of demographic transition in terms of increase in youth population, is attributed to the development in human capital and youth engagement in productive employment. In urban areas of Pakistan the rate of human capital is satisfactory while in the rural areas the results lie on the contrary for females. Additionally, the high rate of youth unemployment, at the start of their career, declines with the increase in age. The rate of unemployment of females is much higher than the male youth in the regions of the country (Ahmad and Azim-2010).
With the stagnation of mainstream employment opportunities for youth, the counterpoint suggests self-employment and entrepreneurship as the emerging trend. “Entrepreneurship is the process to create wealth for individual and group in a dynamic environment (Sathiabama, 2010)”. It is also a means for converting low productive resources into higher productive and yield (Tanveer et al, 2013). According to Tanveer et al (2013) entrepreneurship can be explained in two different ways; a) pre-birth stage which also means entrepreneurial intention or people who are motivated, b) post-natal stage or actual entrepreneurship. Entrepreneurial intention is the necessary state of mind that provides clear direction to those who want to develop a new venture. Behavioral studies have been conducted to understand both the pre-birth and post-natal behavior. According to Tanveer et al (2013) entrepreneurial intention can be explained by Theory of Planned Behavior (TPB). Ajzen (1991) states that intention is the willingness to makes plans and reach specific goals in order to perform the behavior. Tanveer et al (2013) and Ajzen (1991) indicate that “intention is shaped through an individual attitude towards the behavior, perceived behavior control and subjective norm. Attitude towards the behavior is the degree to which person has some favorable or unfavorable response, evaluation or assessment of the behavior in question”. Ajzen and Fishbein’s Theory of Reasoned Action (TRA) also states that the action of someone can be directly depended on their intention. Thus intention to take risk is the main driver for entrepreneurship.

In the study of literature on the situational analysis of youth entrepreneurship in Pakistan, several drivers as well as barriers can be seen. However it is interesting to note that the barriers to self-employment also originate from the drivers of the action. According to Haque (2007) “entrepreneurship need not always be wealth-creating and growth-inducing”. Tullock (1989) and Krueger (1974) show that unproductive enterprise can direct entrepreneurship towards accumulation of wealth. The health of the entrepreneurial activity thus is dependent on the system of incentives as well as the governance mechanism of a country. Exploring the determinants of entrepreneurship behaviour, innovation and risk-bearing seem to be the key factors in determining the intention for action. However, according to Haque (2007) rent-seeking behaviour can become an unhealthy consequence of entrepreneurship. For him, rent-seeking behaviour can be defined as a situation of manipulation of economic environment to make money, rather than profit making through trade and production of wealth. His research is significant in presenting different dimensions of entrepreneurial action. Azhar, Javaid, Rehman and Hyder (2010) found that in order to provide a better entrepreneurial environment, the already existing entrepreneurs must be encouraged and appreciated and people should be made aware of the benefits of the entrepreneurship. Not only this, a platform is required as without it the objectives and targets of entrepreneurial activities deter. Moreover, Fatoki’s (2011) study attempts to provide information about the benefits of youth entrepreneurship. It says that youth entrepreneurship promotes and boosts up the economic growth and development, national security and political stability and leads to a decline in poverty, crime and inequality.
In the gender-based analysis of youth entrepreneurship, there are both negative as well as positive aspects. Tambunan (2009) studied the development of women entrepreneurship in Asian developing countries and the main constraints faced by them. He concluded that lack of capital, and education and religious or cultural constraints hinder the women entrepreneurship due to which their representation is quite low. Also, most of the women forcefully engage themselves in entrepreneurship to avail better family incomes. Thus, educated women and availability of well paid employment opportunities for women discourage entrepreneurship in SME’s. However, the data on women entrepreneurs, according to Tambunan (2009), misses out on the motivation drivers. It has been see in this study that the drivers for women entrepreneurs are many of the times completely different from men. In the overall gender analysis, it is seen that there can be three categories of women entrepreneurs, a) chance entrepreneurs, for them intention may not be the driving factor, b) Forced, those who maybe force by circumstances of family, finances and confident peer-support networks, and c) Created, the original entrepreneur with intention. Peer-support networks were seen as differential between both male and female as the same may not exist for female. Tambunan’s (2009) study indicates that only one-fifth of the women approached were entrepreneurs because of ‘pull’ factors i.e. the need for challenge, to be independent etc. Also, the study indicates that women may have completely different interest in sectors for business than men. Roomi and Parrott (2008) also observed the trend of entrepreneurship in SME’s to be male dominant. Tanveer et al (2013) also highlights that the barriers to enter a business are associated with lack of capital, skills, assistance, and awareness, support of the dear ones and fear of future insecurity. Thus, the public and non-public sector organizations, sectors, influential institutions and universities should play a key role in providing skills, essential training, awareness and a healthy platform to start a new business.

In order to understand the state-level mechanisms available for youth participation and engagement in the labour force, there needs to be an examination of policy-based literature. For this purpose, a study Butt and Mehmood (2010) is important. It focuses on the phenomenon of youth bulge in Pakistan and addresses critical areas for increasing and integrating youth development as part of human resource development. Also, the National Youth Policy (2008) and the Provincial Youth Policy of Punjab will be included in the relevant literature.

According to Hussain (2012), the employment challenge could be met in Pakistan by creating an institutional framework for providing technical training and credit so that employed workers can increase their productivity and hence wage levels, while at same time a larger percentage of the labour force can achieve productive self-employment.

7. Methodological Framework and Data Collection of the Study
The methodology of the study involves a critical examination of both primary and secondary Datasets examined at two stages. The first phase involves examining of secondary data composed of literature review of the scholarly and policy documents on the state of youth employment and entrepreneurship in Pakistan. It will also comprise of secondary data available
in the various editions of Pakistan Labour Force Survey which will be used in conjunction with the primary data for its critical examination and cross analysis.

The second phase involves the collection and analysis of primary data based on the design and pilot testing of the CBMS conducted for the research study. The following 3 types of primary datasets will be used for this paper;

- Household Profile Questionnaire
- Questionnaire on Youth Employment and Entrepreneurship.
- Community questionnaire

A broad set of indicators have been defined for the CBMS study and is attached as Annexure A. The questionnaires developed for the study are also attached as Annexure B, C and D.

The census questionnaire will get the all household socio-demographic information including the socio-demographic profile, education status of household members, employment status, information on various assets, and information on malnutrition and food security as well as the sources of income.

7.1. Target population

The target population for youth employment and entrepreneurship were those youth who are eligible to be part of formal labour force living in the selected areas and falling within age bracket of 15-30 years. This age bracket is also taken officially by Youth Policies in Pakistan. All youth available in a household who are either working full time, part time, looking to work and are self-employed/entrepreneurs were interviewed on a specifically designed survey tool.

During the CBMS Census phase—in which data on core indicators of CBMS Pakistan is collected—youth are identified and are interviewed. A separate section is embedded in the HPQto interview member of youth community available at home during census phase, however, this section does not cover self-employed and entrepreneurs. A more detailed Rider Questionnaire is designed to cover the specific indicators that are linked to self-employment and entrepreneurship.

7.2. Sampled Selected Areas

The CBMS study is aimed to collect information about youth bulge and various socio-demographic household indicators from the two districts of province Punjab: Rawalpindi district\(^5\) (Rural Union Council) and, and Mandi Bahuddin district (Urban Union Council). The complete census will be done in all the villages of the one rural Union Council of district Faisalabad and in all the blocks of one urban union council of district Mandi Bahuddin.

Below are the chosen Union Councils along with other basic statistics and estimated population and housing units.

\(^5\)The selection of districts is random and it is ensured that youth issues are important in both of districts.
Table 1: CBMS Selected Union Council by housing and population statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Villages</td>
<td></td>
<td>1998 Census Statistics</td>
<td>2014 Projected Statistics</td>
<td>HHU*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pop</td>
<td>HHU</td>
<td>Pop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHECHI ZULFOO</td>
<td></td>
<td>253</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHOHAN</td>
<td></td>
<td>313</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>482</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KALA GUJRAN</td>
<td></td>
<td>700</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>1078</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THIKRIAN</td>
<td></td>
<td>942</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>1451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHEKKI</td>
<td></td>
<td>485</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>747</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISAR</td>
<td></td>
<td>181</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MACHHIA</td>
<td></td>
<td>1787</td>
<td>310</td>
<td>2753</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAHWLE KALAN</td>
<td></td>
<td>791</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>1218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAHWLE KHURD</td>
<td></td>
<td>708</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>1091</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KALARYALA</td>
<td></td>
<td>1252</td>
<td>221</td>
<td>1928</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PANJGRAN KALAN</td>
<td></td>
<td>1286</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>1981</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TANWIN</td>
<td></td>
<td>1175</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>1810</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOTHEH GULBAZ</td>
<td></td>
<td>1055</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>1625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TUKWAL</td>
<td></td>
<td>2491</td>
<td>445</td>
<td>3837</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total A</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>13419</td>
<td>2344</td>
<td>20670</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Circles</td>
<td>1998 Census Statistics</td>
<td>2014 Projected Statistics</td>
<td>HHU*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Pop</td>
<td>HHU</td>
<td>Pop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Circle No. 01</td>
<td></td>
<td>832</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>1128</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Circle No. 02</td>
<td></td>
<td>8026</td>
<td>1017</td>
<td>10877</td>
<td>1378</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Circle No. 03</td>
<td></td>
<td>7014</td>
<td>925</td>
<td>9506</td>
<td>1254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total B</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>15872</td>
<td>2048</td>
<td>21511</td>
<td>2776</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total (A+ B)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>29291</td>
<td>4392</td>
<td>42181</td>
<td>6379</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HHU=Household Units

*HHU: Household unit estimates can be misleading because they are estimated based on average household size in 1998. There is no any other source to estimate on average household size.

This project have done census of all households in the selected areas. This census will be done on a census questionnaire that will also identify self-employed youth population (by gender). The census questionnaire will collect all basic data on household members per household. Once census data is collected, the every identified young entrepreneur will be interviewed in the selected areas.
The questionnaire on youth employment and entrepreneurship will collect data from identified youth male and female members of the households. Male interviews will be done by male interviewer and female interviewer will interview female respondents. To get community data, a community profile questionnaire will be designed that will collect information on educational sector, main employment sectors by industry and others.

8. Youth Policy Examination
Youth Policy in Pakistan has bumped through since the independence. There has been an accepted consideration of the participation of youth in the development of the country. Yet, an official policy to oversee the development and capacity building of this precious human resource has largely been neglected from lack of commitment in terms of both serious consideration as well as resource mobilization. Recently, since the year 2000, various governments have expressed a serious inclination to the development of a youth policy in order to harness and build the largest human resource. However, a thorough examination reveals a lack of commitment in implementation as well as addressing future challenges.

Youth policy per say has passed through trials and tribulations in the history of policy development in the country. Ministry of Youth Affairs established and merged with the Ministry of Culture in 1996 was a proceeding step after the creation of the Youth Affairs Division in 1989. Its status was raised to a full Ministry in 2005 and put under the charge of Federal Minister and Minister of State (MOS) for Youth Affairs. Although largely concerned with youth camps, youth exchange programs and seminars, the Ministry, for the first time, held a National Youth Convention in July 2005. Even though it culminated into a major event, it failed to make any significant gestures in addressing the needs and grievances of the target population. However, 2009 was a noteworthy year in the history of youth policy making in Pakistan when the Federal Cabinet approved the National Youth Policy, mandating the Youth Ministry to “facilitate the stakeholders on all aspects of youth related activities”. In addition to supporting national and international Youth Exchange Program, National Youth Award etc., a more significant step has been the launching of business loans schemes and the National Internship Program (NIP). The NIP boasts to providing temporary job opportunities to 30,000 youth annually, with an allocation of 3.6 billion Rupees in the first year. The Ministry has also supported the National Volunteer Movement for involvement of young individuals in community and humanitarian work.

18th Amendment in the Constitution of Pakistan is an elemental development that may allow for a much strategized and prioritised targeting of young population in accordance with the subjective characteristics based on area, its topography and sociological anthropology in the respective provincial divisions. Resources, decision making power and machinery have been

---

6 http://www.moya.gov.pk/about.html
7 ibid
transferred to provincial government where they have gained the authority to focus on the needs and grievances of the population in the sectors of health, education and economy. It is for this reason that the provinces of Panjab, Sindh and Khyber Pakhtoon Kha (KPK) have taken the initiative each for development of a provincial youth policy. The Government of Panjab and recently launched its policy while Sindh and KPK policy documents are currently under process of the consultation and are only available in draft form. Thus in the policy-based literature concerning the engagement of youth as an important human resource, encompasses few essential documents; the National Youth Policy launched in 2008 and the Provincial Punjab Youth Policy 2012.

8.1. Punjab Youth Policy 2012

Going from national to provincial context, a more contemporary policy document, the Punjab Youth Policy 2012 comes into view. Punjab, the most populous of the provinces boasts 55% of the total population. “The land of 5-rivers, population-wise the largest, and once known as the granary of east, Punjab is the lifeline of Pakistan”. The current government in power recognizing the presence of youth population to be 30.4% of the total population of the province, have worked rigorously to formulate a youth policy that caters to the need of this growing population. What sets this document apart from its national counterpart is the sectoral focus from urban area based youth population to a guided version for rural area based young individual. One can detect after a thorough examination that this provincial document has used the national youth policy as a source of guidance. However, the Punjab policy document is accompanied by subjectivities that may be identified by the policy-makers as sensitive to the needs of the youth of the province. The salient features of the document, in the specific context of our study, focuses on reducing the differential vulnerabilities of youth by providing specific attention to:

- Identify diverse income sectors according to skills and needs of the target population.
- Giving high priority to technical education with the necessary certification mechanism.
- National and international job market analysis for policy strategy and prioritization.
- Development of a Punjab Skills Development Fund for creation of specialized institutions for targeted trainings on agriculture, labour and business.
- Developing sectoral initiatives in livestock and dairy by “Rehabilitation of Mustahqeen-i-Zakat (eligible to receive alms money) by promotion of livestock keeping, training of unemployed youth as veterinary workers, replication of Idara-e-Kissan model, provision of milk cooling tanks and promotion of livestock under the Barani Village Development Project”.
- Making arrangements for entrepreneurship trainings for the target population for innovation and expansion in business enterprises.

---

“Create a centralized “Information-System/Data base” on job opportunities for Youth in public and private sector to guide”\textsuperscript{11}.

Establishment of placement opportunities for youth in their respective universities as well as developing agencies for guidance within these institutions for enhancing employability of graduated students.

\textbf{8.2.1 Salient Features of Punjab Youth Policy}

1. The Punjab Youth Policy recommends establishing Job Bank On-Line, to conduct job market surveys and to build a database to inform the youth about potential openings and to guide the educational and vocational training institutes.

2. It also envisages establishment of Youth Venture Capital Fund by public-private partnership to support new business ideas and entrepreneurship amongst young men and women.

3. It will also start Punjab Internship Program with public-private partnership to maximize opportunities for fresh graduates.

The other measures recommended under framework of the youth policy are:

1. Launching of a ‘Punjab Youth Volunteers Movement (PYVM)’ that will start from the school level to encourage community service among youth.

2. Allocation of 5 percent quota to youth under the local government law to include them in decision making and increase leadership opportunities for youth in the Punjab.

3. Initiating National and international job market analysis.

4. Skills development through IT will be facilitated by providing laptops on merit to students.

5. Provision of stipends for technical education especially in the South Punjab.

6. Technical education to unemployed educated youth and provision of micro-credits.

7. Update curriculum of Technical education and prepare a phased expansion programme of such training facilities.

8. Local crafts based youth enterprises for income-generation at village and urban neighbourhood level will be established and encouraged and professional assistance for marketing of such enterprise products will be provided.

9. Sectoral initiatives in livestock and dairy development i.e. Rehabilitation of Mustahqeeni-Zakat (eligible to receive alms money) by promotion of livestock keeping, training of unemployed youth as veterinary workers, replication of Idara-e-Kissan model, provision of milk cooling tanks and promotion of livestock under the Barani Village Development Project.

10. Institute a programme of certification of informally acquired skills by technicians and workers.

\textsuperscript{11}ibid
11. Arrange entrepreneurship and training programme and guide and train youth to do business, to innovate and expand business.
12. Encourage large organizations, companies and enterprises to provide internship opportunities equal to at least 5% of their sanctioned/approved strength of officers to young people/graduates.
13. The government will reserve 15% quota for girls in employment.
14. The government will initiate life-skill programmes for children and youth in schools.
15. Develop and promote Punjab Internship programme through public-private partnership.
16. Re-activation of Boys Scout and Girls Guides at school level and mentoring of youth on disaster management.
17. Inter-provincial youth exchange programmes hosted by local colleges and universities.
18. “See Pakistan Programme” for youth mobility.
20. Youth exposure trips will be organized to important government institutions like the Provincial Assembly of the Punjab.
21. The government would engage youth in mass campaigns and emergencies i.e. i.e. Anti-Dengue, floods, etc.

In order to implement its objectives and plans, the Punjab Youth Policy 2012 would establish a robust and efficient institutional mechanism for implementation of programs which is called the Punjab Youth Development Foundation (PYDF).

8.2.2 Strategic Action Plan of Punjab Youth Policy
The strategic action plan provides crucial policy guidelines for mainstreaming youth in public policy making. The various characteristics of the action plan are given below;

1. Diversification of employment sectors and comprehensive awareness to youth on the available job market;
2. Mapping of skills and demands of multiple sectors in the job market;
3. Establishing a programme for certified and standardized technical training for literate and illiterate youth;
4. Encouraging youth in promotion of local crafts through exhibitions and trade fairs in a collaborative role under the flagship of concerned departments; and
5. Encouragement of entrepreneurship for youth especially vulnerable youth.

8.2.3 Skill Development and Vocational Training of Punjab Youth Policy
Skill development is viewed as a crucial factor in building the capacity of the targeted population especially in economic specific policies. The policy aims to provide role of a counselling and capacity development. Policy dictations for skill development and vocational training are;
1. It is proposed to carry out an assessment of the demand/requirements and capacity of the skill development facilities in the Punjab. Based on this assessment technical and skill development programmes will be enhanced. It is proposed that existing schools may be inducted in this programme and a substantial number of schools in public and private sector may start regular evening and weekend programmes for skill development and technical training for which funds would be provided by the government, private sector and development agencies;

2. The government intends to assign high priority to promoting technical education in the province. A crash programme would be launched to impart technical education to unemployed educated youth and then provide micro-credit to them so that they can become self-employed;

3. National and international job market analysis would be carried out to identify the requirements of skills in various target markets and our youth be trained in the relevant fields. Besides, support will be extended to our youth to seek jobs and placements locally and in foreign markets;

4. Vocational Training Institutes in the province will update curriculum in accordance with current requirements and job-opportunities in the Agriculture/Industrial and Services sectors and prepare a phased expansion programme of such training facilities in rural/urban areas keeping in view regional considerations regarding youth population, prevailing skill-levels, and unemployment;

5. Soliciting funding through public/private collaboration for human resource management;

6. Establishment of job banks to promote youth employment;

7. Fully activating the concept of “Employer on line” and “Job Bank on line;

8. Specialized institutions for providing training in area specific needs will be opened e.g. training of agriculture, labour, and business on the pattern of Punjab Skills Development Fund. Similar trainings will be developed to support tanneries, fans, cutlery, garments industries in relevant industrial areas, etc.

9. Sectoral initiatives in livestock and dairy development i.e. Rehabilitation of Mustahqeen-i-Zakat (eligible to receive alms money) by promotion of livestock keeping, training of unemployed youth as veterinary workers, replication of Idara-e-Kissan model, provision of milk cooling tanks and promotion of livestock under the Barani Village Development Project.

10. Establish and encourage local crafts based youth enterprises for income-generation at village and urban-neighbourhood level and provide professional assistance for marketing of such enterprise products;

11. Institute a programme of certification of informally acquired skills by technicians and workers to enable them acquire suitable jobs and financing; and

12. In cooperation with developing countries, develop and implement strategies for decent and productive work for youth.
8.2.4 Entrepreneurship Activities in Punjab Youth Policy

Identifying with the needs of the hour, Punjab Youth Policy seeks to induce confidence in the youth population for risk taking and small business investment. It promotes:

1. To mitigate risks in new ventures, it is necessary that the risk of trying bright ideas be underwritten by entrepreneurs and our talent is given a chance to succeed. For this purpose the programme envisages creation of a youth venture capital fund to support new developments and implementation of new ideas. This Fund can be subscribed by government, entrepreneurs, corporations, donors, beneficiaries etc.

2. Creation of small incubator offices equipped with all office facilities for young graduates so that they may work in these incubators to polish up their ideas and implement to venture activities. Such incubators may be set up in universities;

3. Support and promote Innovation Competition to attract and fund best business ideas.

4. To facilitate and guide young entrepreneurs regarding procedures for opening of new companies and provide legal advice as needed;

5. Arrange entrepreneurship and training programme to enable youth to learn from existing enterprises and the companies. Learn the art of making business plans and selling it to the venture capital and other funds;

6. Enhance the outreach of programmes of the Punjab Small Industries Corporation (PSIC);


8. Guide and train small and poor service providers to grow from small occupations into large enterprise;

9. Create respect for poor and small entrepreneurship (rag to riches empowerment).

10. Provide financial resources/loans to increase access of poor/low income family youth to training institutions and facilitate those seeking self-employment;

11. Expansion of micro finance sector in terms of outlets, products and access by the young; and

12. Create a centralized “Information-System/Data base” on job opportunities for Youth in public and private sector to guide and counsel job-seeking youth.

8.2.5 Internships, On Campus Job and Job Placements in Punjab Youth Policy

1. Developing and promoting Punjab Internship Programme through public-private partnership. It would offer maximum internship opportunities to the youth in government departments, private sector and within the civil society organizations (CSOs);

2. Reserve 15 % quota for girls in all public-sector employment to ensure that the girls can have equal opportunities of jobs;

3. In addition to Government programme, encourage large organizations, companies and enterprises to provide internship opportunities equal to at least 5% of their
sanctioned/approved strength of officers to young people/graduates with stipends equal to or more than the Government programme;

4. Require all universities to provide on campus jobs equal to at least 5% of their full time student population;

5. Encourage all universities to set up offices for awaiting graduates in job placements. The government may also support programmes for job counselling and placement services;

6. Institute Placement Bureaus through IT interface with all stakeholders and maintaining up to date, accurate and increased information flow; and.

7. Require all autonomous bodies and state owned enterprises to appoint ‘Youth Ambassadors’ on their boards.

Research Findings

Youth population in Pakistan highest among other cohorts. According to In 2013, according to PRB, youth (10-24 years) were 32% and will be 22% in 2050. This is based on estimates. According to Demographic Surveys (Arif & Chaudhry, PIDE), the 15-29 years of age population is 27.9%. According to CBMS, they are currently 26%. This shows that CBMS can be a reliable source on correct information on key indicators of development in Pakistan.

The distribution of the youth population by CBMS site is given below.
The graph shows that more than 27% youth live in urban areas while 24% live in rural areas. Youth is the most mobile population and keeping in mind the economic opportunities in urban areas, youth prefer to migrate in search of better livelihood.

Based on this population, the following research question has been investigated with the help of the binary logistic regression.

“The youth based entrepreneurship depends on youth competitiveness index, wellbeing of the household (wealth index), education, employment opportunities in area, competitiveness, residence and others (identified through modelling).”

Dependent variable is self-employment (self-employed=1, 0 ‘otherwise’). The independent variables are proxy poverty indicator (wealth index), educational levels, English Language Abilities, Competitiveness Index and locality (i.e. rural or urban).

Table 2: Modeling on Self-Employment in CBMS Sites

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Independent variables</th>
<th>Odd Ratios</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>All Areas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary Education</td>
<td>0.599**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle Education (8 Classes)</td>
<td>1.65**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate (10-12 Classes)</td>
<td>2.03**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduation (14-16 Classes)</td>
<td>1.51*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading ability (English)</td>
<td>0.11**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaking ability (English)</td>
<td>1.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Listening ability (English)</td>
<td>3.07**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Model 1

Primary Education | 0.66* |
Middle Education (8 Classes) | 1.62** |
Intermediate (10-12 Classes) | 1.87** |
Graduation (14-16 Classes) | 1.36 |
Reading ability (English) | 0.11** |
Speaking ability (English) | 1.91 |
Listening ability (English) | 3.59** |

Wealth Index—Lowest = Ref

Second quintile | 1.61* |
Third quintile | 1.88* |
Forth quintile | 2.70** |
Fifth quintile | 2.01** |

Model 3

Competitive Index—Lowest=Ref

Second quintile | 1.27 |
Above table shows that self-employment depends on many factors that are linked with better education and better communication skills. Refer to Model 1, youth with primary or less education are 41% less likely to be self employed/entrepreneurs. Self-employment/entrepreneurship is mostly an opportunity explored by youth with middle or intermediate level of education, however youth with graduation are less likely to be self-employed than youth with Intermediate level education. It may be said that this implies due to better employment, other than self-employment, opportunities are available with youth having graduate level of education. English Language Abilities: The highest predictor of self-employment is reported to be listening ability of youth.

Model 2 has taken into consideration the relative poverty level of the household. Self-employment/entrepreneurship is more likely to be a choice for youth with better economic conditions as moving from lowest to second lowest quintile, 61% more chances that youth will be in self-employment. This rate increases to 88% when youth falls in household in third quintile of Wealth Index. Falling in fourth quintile, there are 170% more chances for youth to be self-employed and fifth quintile, exactly double odds are for youth to be self-employed.

Third model is based on only three independent indicators, all taken as continuous: Competitiveness Index, Wealth Index, and Age. Since the independent indicators like education and English language abilities are part of Competitiveness Index including indicators on vocational training, computer usage abilities, ownership of computer and use of internet. According to third model, the youth in second, third and fifth quintiles of competitiveness index are more likely to be self-employed but odds are not significant, however, youth in fourth quintile are significantly 3 times more likely to be self-employed. As long as youth belong to better quintiles of Wealth Index are more likely to be self-employed with significant odds. Age of the respondents has been divided into three categories: Less than 15, 15-30 and more than 30 years of age. As it can be seen in third model that youth (aged 15-30 years) are about two times
more likely to start self-employment/entrepreneurship than youth with age less than 15, however, individuals with age more than 30 are about 48% more likely to start their own business.

Summary of Findings and Policy Recommendations

Pakistan is one of the countries in South Asia having bulk of youth population that is ready to be part of economic development. Self-employment is a way to be part of economic activities within a country without any liability on the government except to ensure optimal regulation of factors that promote self-employment and entrepreneurship. This study focused on extracting the key factors that contribute positively towards the promotion of self-employment and entrepreneurship. In Pakistan, there is a need to promote self-employment and entrepreneurship.

Policy recommendations can include but not limited to embed specifically the information, knowledge and motivation at college university level on self-employment and entrepreneurship. In Pakistan, the youth focused schemes should be sustainable and should be extended to all segments of the youth in every walk of life. According to research findings, education play key role in the overall self-employment and therefore government should encourage youth to seek higher than primary education. Quality of education matters. Since English is the official language of Pakistan, the abilities of youth in better communicating in English, particularly listening, has very good impact on self-employment/entrepreneurship. Poverty is linked with low level of self-employment. This implies that households in lowest quintile might not have enough funds to start their own business. This also implies that people having ability to invest start self-employment. Government, civil and private sector institutes should provide access to finance in order to ensure youth wishing to start their own business are able to do so.

Government should also focus on provision of basic life skills including vocational training, use of computers and its applications like MS Word and MS Excel and access to internet. These services serve as a tool to look at different informative sources, learn and understand easily and increase competitiveness of youth. Youth in fourth quintile of Competitiveness Index are the highly likely to be self-employed and entrepreneurs. Government should introduce skills that increase in competitiveness of youth in Pakistan. Youth with age 15-30 years are highly likely to start self-employment/entrepreneurship. This shows to focus on this age group to be self-employed through different schemes.
### 9. Annexure I: List of YEE Indicators

#### Youth Employment and Entrepreneurship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Questions</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Variables/Data Requirements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Youth Employment and Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>Per Approved Project Proposal</td>
<td>Reasons for economic inactivity.</td>
<td>Number of economically inactive youth, area wise economic opportunities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Number of youth working as self-employed/entrepreneurs (SEE)</td>
<td>Youth engaged in economic activities that are based on business ideals to generate income through business transactions/engagements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Segregation of SEE by opportunity/necessity based entrepreneurship,</td>
<td>Business started as by choice to generate income and profits. This activity is preferred by an entrepreneur over the other available economic opportunities like employment etc; Business started as by need to ensure living expenses are met. This choice is made due to unavailability of other economic opportunities or due to inability to grab them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. Key obstacles in the way to entrepreneurship,</td>
<td>The obstacles that hinder business growth both at start and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What are the challenges of different categories of youth (not participating and participating in labour market), present and future opportunities and what are the policy guidelines to tackle these challenges?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Obstacles to Entrepreneurship</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Youth Entrepreneurs</th>
<th>Means of Finance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social</strong></td>
<td>Social, financial, cultural etc.</td>
<td>Hurdles in the way of start and growth of the business</td>
<td>Youth education, language skills, computer skills and training etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Financial</strong></td>
<td>Financial</td>
<td></td>
<td>Different means of finance for entrepreneurship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cultural</strong></td>
<td>Cultural</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Skills and Access to Finance</th>
<th>Self-employed Youth Competitiveness Index</th>
<th>Youth Competitiveness Index</th>
<th>Means of Finance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Determine skills and ability to compete the market and access to finance that enable them to materialize their business ideas</td>
<td>Through different means</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. The ability to: supervise a group of people; practical skills to write presentations, letters etc in English; Speak English; Ability to calculate and deal with mathematical numbers/accounts; Team work; Computer literacy; thinking new ideas and do research activities; completing job assignments in time and others

- The ability of current education system to enable youth to be entrepreneurs and to enable them to be successful competitive entrepreneurs.
- Number of youth who can are good in skills that pertain to successful entrepreneurship
- Number of youth with skills that pertain to successful entrepreneurship

Is the existing educational system rightly supporting the youth to provide them the right skills demanded by the labour market?

1. The ability to: supervise a group of people; practical skills to write presentations, letters etc in English; Speak English; Ability to calculate and deal with mathematical numbers/accounts; Team work; Computer literacy; thinking new ideas and do research activities; completing job assignments in time and others

- The ability of current education system to enable youth to be entrepreneurs and to enable them to be successful competitive entrepreneurs.
- Number of youth who can are good in skills that pertain to successful entrepreneurship
- Number of youth with skills that pertain to successful entrepreneurship

How much local entrepreneurship and labour market is absorbing the youth in jobs?

1. Number of youth employed (from household questionnaire) and 2. Number of youth engaged in self-employment/entrepreneur activities. 3. Number of youth who are providing employment to others through their self-employment initiatives in local areas

- Youth who are economically engaged in different sectors of employment in area or in proximity where they are living like employment in factories, agriculture and other government and private institutes.
- Number of youth who are economically active in the different sectors/institutes in their communities/proximity.
- Local area businesses and economic opportunities and employment patterns for youth

Is the local social and financial entrepreneurship is providing significant support to youth in getting education and productive employment?

1. Number of youth who are depending on self-employment/entrepreneur activities to get their education along with satisfactory

- Youth who meet their living and studying costs through their entrepreneurship activities
- Number of youth who are self-employed and meeting their living and professional growth (studying, skills etc)
- Number of self-employed youth, Number of youth who are enrolled in studies, number of
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Starting from grass roots level: How Pakistan’s demographic dividend could be reaped?</th>
<th>A Broad Question: Multiple variables will be used on youth from both rounds to draw conclusions—a descriptive and empirically empowered narrative based on overall findings of the project on youth employment and entrepreneurship.</th>
<th>The overall potential for youth employment and entrepreneurship in the communities, obstacles, competitiveness index and poverty distribution patterns for households with youth as self-employed and households with youth as otherwise.</th>
<th>Number of youth with different characteristics that enable them to be economically active part of the overall labour force dynamics in Pakistan and in their communities.</th>
<th>e.g. entrepreneurship activity rate, percentage of youth as entrepreneurs among overall area youth labor force, poverty dynamics, knowledge and attitude towards entrepreneurship etc.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What are the poverty dynamics by entrepreneurship type and by gender? OR “is there any link between youth entrepreneurship inequality and household poverty?”</td>
<td>1. %age of household with Poverty score card/Wealth index of households with youth engaged in SEE activities (male); 2. Poverty score card/Wealth index of households with youth engaged in SEE activities (female); 3. Comparison of total SEE and non-SEE household income.</td>
<td>Different measures of poverty are estimated for youth by their entrepreneurship characteristic. This is to see if entrepreneurship by type has effect on poverty levels in a household.</td>
<td>Number of youth who are engaged in entrepreneurship and their poverty characteristics at household level. Headcount ratio could also be calculated for such youths.</td>
<td>Youth by their employment characteristics, household poverty level etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How community and household poverty is linked to entrepreneurship activities in rural and urban areas of the Punjab?</td>
<td>Different aspects of household poverty in rural and urban areas in the context of SEE and non-SEE households.</td>
<td>There is a big different between rural and urban areas of Pakistan in terms of living standards, education, health, and most importantly employment opportunities and prospects. The project will be looking to see the variations by rural and urban areas of the project sites.</td>
<td>Youth employment and entrepreneurship variation by rural and urban areas and its impact poverty</td>
<td>Employment characteristics by rural and urban areas, and entrepreneurship rate by region.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth entrepreneurship inequalities and their effect on poverty dynamics at household level?</td>
<td>Distribution of household poverty by Characteristics of youth in SEE (education, training, skills etc), income and gender</td>
<td>Entrepreneurship by necessity and by choice and its impact on overall household poverty</td>
<td>Number of households with youth in necessity based entrepreneurship and number of households in entrepreneurship by choice and its impact on household level poverty</td>
<td>Entrepreneurship by necessity and by choice, household poverty level indicators like poverty score card, wealth index and whether household is a working poor or not</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Indicators</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What do latest data show about the characteristics of the youths (e.g. in terms of sex, age, etc.)?</td>
<td>Youth background characteristics by education, employment status, looking for job, not looking for job, completed education, seeking higher education by gender etc</td>
<td>Youth profiling by their different indicators of interest</td>
<td>Categorization of youth population by their different demographic, social and economic characteristics</td>
<td>Youth population, age, sex, employment status, education, region, occupation, industry etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is the employment situation of the youths?</td>
<td>Employment situation of youth aged 15-30 years</td>
<td>Economic activity of youth by occupation and industry, employment characteristics etc</td>
<td>Economically active youth population</td>
<td>Youth population, employment statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the levels of income that youths obtain from employment (including self employment/entrepreneurship)?</td>
<td>Average income or per capital income in a household that is generated through youth based entrepreneurship activities.</td>
<td>Income generated in a household through entrepreneurship run by youth. The per capita addition of income generated through entrepreneurship.</td>
<td>Number of youth earning income through entrepreneurship</td>
<td>Youth, entrepreneurship rate, income sources etc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the multidimensional poverty/wellbeing characteristics of the individuals/household?</td>
<td>Different dimensions of poverty at household level/Head Count Ratio</td>
<td>Poverty level of households by poverty score card to determine percentage of HH below national poverty line,</td>
<td>Poverty with different dimensions</td>
<td>Poverty score card, wealth index, working poverty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the levels of educational attainment of youths in the household?</td>
<td>Youth Educational Background--Coming from HPQ</td>
<td>Different educational levels of youth in a household</td>
<td>Number of youth identified by different educational qualifications</td>
<td>Number of youth by educational levels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the available and potential opportunities for employment of the youths?</td>
<td>Employment characteristics of the communities/area</td>
<td>Employment opportunities available in project areas/sites which can be availed by youth of the same area.</td>
<td>Type of employment opportunities available in areas of the project</td>
<td>Type of opportunities, type of opportunities, part time or full time, public and private etc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How do youth access employment opportunities?</td>
<td>How do youth find employment opportunities and sought for them</td>
<td>The access to employment opportunities info and the method to apply for them</td>
<td>Ways to access the opportunities locally and nationally</td>
<td>Number of youth showing different methods to access employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are contributing factors to youth unemployment?</td>
<td>What are youth unemployment determinants?</td>
<td>Youth aged 15-30 years who are unable to find any job due to underlying factors. These factors can be said as determining the employability of the youth.</td>
<td>Youth employment status and possible factors that may be contributing towards youth unemployment like age, education, skill mismatch and other factors</td>
<td>Youth employment status, and their demographic, educational indicators etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What characterizes youth entrepreneurs?</td>
<td>Factors leading to youth entrepreneurship by type</td>
<td>Youth who are engaged in entrepreneurship activities and their specific characteristics that distinguish them from non-entrepreneurs.</td>
<td>Factors that lead the youth to start their own businesses</td>
<td>Youth entrepreneurship, demographic, educational indicators including skills and access to finance etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the factors that drive youth entrepreneurship and what measures are available to facilitate/improve/assist youth entrepreneurship?</td>
<td>Factors that need improvements to strengthen entrepreneurship</td>
<td>Factors that need policy level attention to remove barriers in terms of youth entrepreneurship. It also include business environment for youth to indulge in entrepreneurship, government schemes etc.</td>
<td>Level of support community, institutes and government is providing to improve youth entrepreneurship. Business environment, social entrepreneurship activities, government schemes, trainings etc.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
10. References


