A Proposal for Implementing CBMS in Argentina

Dr. Sebastián Auguste
Director of the Institute of Economics, UNICEN
Associate Economist at FIEL

sebastian@fiel.org.ar
About Argentina

• Upper Middle Income Country (around USD 8000 per capita)
• Population: 40.5 millions
• Urban population: 92%
  – (Buenos Aires province, almost 19 millions, Buenos Aires city: 12 millions)
  – Self-reported Amerindians, 1.6% (mostly living in the north of the country)
  – Stock of Inmigrants: 5%
• Life expectancy: 77
• Literacy rate: 98%
• Federal Government: Nation, Provinces (24), and Municipality (1000)
ECONOMY AND POVERTY

- Economy growing since 2003 (and still)
- “some” disbelief on official statistics
- No Living Condition Survey, poverty is measured though Household Surveys in large urban areas.
- Poverty rate (recomputed using official data: 25%)
Argentina, crisis and poverty generation

Unemployment and Poverty in GBA since 1980

- Poverty
- Unemployment

Hyperinflation
- Tequila
- Crisis 2001/2002

Poverty and Unemployment trends over time.
• Poverty alleviation and welfare policies:
  – national programs & national programs administered at municipal level
  – Provincial programs & provision of programs administered at municipal level
  – Municipal programs
• Registry of beneficiaries (in process, municipalities do not have access so far)
About Tandil

- Tandil, municipality of Buenos Aires Province.
- Main city: Tandil
- 120 thousand citizens (mostly urban)
- Poverty (Census basic needs) below province of Buenos Aires average.
- Growth: above Argentina average (booming in 2000s)
- Economic structure, very diversified: agriculture, mining, tourism, ICT, metal industry
• Tandil has been a success story in Argentina.
• Good governance, good dialogue between private and public sector, innovative private sector.
• Examples:
  – Metal-mechanic industry (industrial secondary school important role creating sector)
  – University UNICEN, created by initiative of private sector in 1965, public since 1974
  – ICT industry (2000 employees), began by University initiative
About local Government:

• In 2003, following the successful experience of Health Center, government wanted to create Community Centers for Social Policies (dividing the city in regions)

• Idea: to better identify potential beneficiaries and local demands

• University UNICEN (Geographic Institute) helped in the process

• City was divided in 14 regions by 2006, in 11 of them a CC was created (in poorest areas).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Centro Comunitario San Cayetano</th>
<th>Centro Comunitario Tunitas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image1.jpg" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image2.jpg" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centro Comunitario Zona 11</td>
<td>Centro Comunitario Villa Aguirre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><img src="image3.jpg" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image4.jpg" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• CC are the neighborhood presence of the Government.

• One Social Worker works permanently in each Center.

• CC are in charge of organizing informational meetings, elaborate reports (for the Municipality) that identify the local needs, provide some services, and help resolving local problems.
• University UNICEN has continued working closely to the local Government. The last contribution was a dynamic poverty map (based on Census data and other quantitative data such as electricity consumption) that has helped the Government to allocate resoures (e.g. subsidized bottles of naural gas)
Some of the programs/activities the Municipality has implemented through the Community Centers since 2004 are:

- Program for Local Self-Production of Food (Municipal Program)
- Training Courses on Food Safety
- Municipal Nutritional Program
- Development and implementation of the Provincial Program for Celiac Disease (this is an example of a provincial funded program but locally administrated).
- Program of Integral Assistance to Vulnerable Families
- Informational meetings organized by the municipality for beneficiaries of National Programs: Families (*Familias*), Unemployment Insurance (*Seguro de Empleo*) and Capacity Building (*Capacitación*)
– programs and activities in topics such as childhood, adolescence and home violence carried out through units other than those of the Social Development Secretariat of the Municipality.

– Local Program of Productive Employment (a municipal program of employment). The Community Centers have made activities to promote the program and at each Center a registry of potential beneficiaries was created.

– Conflict Resolution. There have been activities to promote the services the Municipality has for conflict resolution and for consumer protection.

– System of Environmental Safety. Community Centers are in charge of identifying problems and of communicating them to the corresponding Municipality authorities.

– Bromathologic Services.

– Safetyt Training
- The Centers have been in charge of identifying educative demands, and this information has been used to generate programs of formal education and training courses.
- Cultural and artistic activities.
- Implementation of the Register of Beneficiaries (*Registro Unico de Beneficiario*), which is a database of beneficiary families and the programs they receive.
- Monthly Meetings with beneficiaries of SECOM (*Servicios Comunitarios*—Community Services) and JJHD (*Jefas y Jefes de Hogar Desocupados* Unemployed Breadwinners), which are National Programs of the Ministry of Labor. The Municipality is in charge of controlling the normal development of the projects.
- Courses on Children’s Learning Problems, Drug Abuse and AIDS, among others.
MAPA N°4.
ZONIFICACIÓN CIUDAD DE TANDIL, 2006

Referencias:
- 1: Amarillo
- 2: Rojo
- 3: Verde
- 4: Azul
- 5: Beige
- 6: Naranja
- 7: Gris
- 8: Marrón
- 9: Verde
- 10: Verde
- 11: Verde
- 12: Verde
- 13: Verde
- 14: Verde
Barrio Santa Ana
About Implementing the pilot CBMS in Tandil

• Advantages:
  – Interest of the local government (interest on impact evaluation, better identification of local needs, to understand to what degree CC are working to capture local demands)
  – Interest of the University
  – Long history of interaction between University and Municipal Government (not subject to political cycle)
  – Reputation of the University locally, and human capital at the University that is interested in doing studies with the data
• Advantages (cont.):
  – We are not starting from zero
    • CC can be used as basis
    • Poverty maps (at Census block level, 200-300 household on average)
  – For a Pilot Survey, high chances of success.
  – Good human capital to adapt the methodology to the local conditions.
  – Experience of the university implementing surveys locally.
Disadvantages

– Tandil it is not a place of extreme poverty, although there are some poor neighborhoods.

– It is a study of urban poverty (not rural poverty) the smaller the city, the less the urban segregation, the harder to identify poors (to have CBMS internationally comparable)

– Sustainability (financing)

– Two Census will be implemented in 2010, National Population Census and the Provincial Health Census.
• We have chosen Tandil, but the area of influence of the University includes other Municipalities (Azul, Olavarría, Rauch, Necochea), which are completely different in terms of development (e.g. Rauch is a small town of 15 thousand inhabitants, mostly working in agriculture).

• We have evaluated to implement it in Salta too.
My concerns

• Census: good to identify beneficiaries, not necessary for impact evaluation or knowing the local needs.
• Census: costly to implement in urban areas
• Urban areas do not have the sense of community as small villages.
• Not many municipalities have CC in Argentina, and there are not local representatives.
• Doubts about how people would answer sensitive topics when asked by a neighbor.
• Sustainability. Census is expensive for cities. Since one of our objectives is to design an experiment that later the Municipality can reproduce with local resources, the process should be cost effective, and a Survey here has the advantage of much more coverage with the same resources. (e.g. Tandil has approximately 30,000 households).
Proposal

- Implement CBMS in Tandil
- Coverage: 2500-3000 households
- Census on selected (Census) Blocks in selected CC areas
- University Team:
  - Sebastian Auguste, Ph.D. Economics (director)
  - Ana Legato, M.A. Statistics, Lic. Mathematics and Physics
  - Cecilia Fuxman, MBA, Lic in Economics
- Municipality Team:
  - Led by Natalia Martignioni, in charge of coordinating the Community Centers (Secretary of Social Development)