Community-Based Monitoring System in the Philippines

Dr. Celia M. Reyes

6th PEP Research Network General Meeting
June 2007
Sheraton Lima Hotel, Lima, Peru
Outline of Presentation

- State of Poverty Monitoring and Targeting Schemes in the Philippines
- CBMS: Rationale and Key Features
- General Activities in Implementing a CBMS
- Uses of CBMS
Central Issues in Poverty Reduction

1. **The who, the where and the why of poverty**: identification and targeting of the poor to enhance the effectiveness of anti-poverty initiatives and programs

2. **The what and when of anti-poverty programs**: identification of interventions/investments that have the highest impact on poverty
The Who, the Where and the Why of Poverty: Some Issues and Concerns

1. Official statistics are reliable down to the regional and provincial levels only (i.e. the sampling design of many of these surveys provide estimates of the variables only at the provincial level.)

2. The collection of data is few and far in between, and processing adds a few more years so that its usefulness for policy design diminishes.

3. And yet, local government units, under the law, are the front-liners in the fight against poverty and are mandated to assume the primary responsibility for the provision of basic services and facilities and the improvement of the quality of life of their constituents.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Available Sources of Data</th>
<th>Implementing Agency</th>
<th>Frequency of Collection</th>
<th>Data Obtained</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family Income and Expenditures Survey (FIES)</td>
<td>NSO</td>
<td>Every 3 years</td>
<td>Family income and living expenditures and related information affecting income and expenditure levels and patterns in the Philippines including poverty incidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual Poverty Indicator Survey (APIS)</td>
<td>NSO</td>
<td>Every year wherein FIES is not conducted</td>
<td>Socioeconomic profiles of families and other information relating to their living conditions but not poverty incidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Nutritional Survey (NNS)</td>
<td>FNRI</td>
<td>Every 5 years</td>
<td>Food situation and nutritional status of the population</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Available Sources of Data</td>
<td>Implementing Agency</td>
<td>Frequency of Collection</td>
<td>Data Obtained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Census of Population and Housing (CPH)</td>
<td>NSO</td>
<td>Every 10 years</td>
<td>Size, composition and distribution of population in the Philippines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Functional Literacy, Education and Mass Media Survey (FLEMMS)</td>
<td>NSO</td>
<td>Irregular</td>
<td>Number of functionally literate population and their socioeconomic characteristics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Demographic and Health Survey (NDHS)</td>
<td>NSO</td>
<td>Every 5 years</td>
<td>Demographic, maternal and child health issues in the Philippines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Force Survey (LFS)</td>
<td>NSO</td>
<td>Every quarter of the year</td>
<td>Levels and trends of employment, unemployment and underemployment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Decentralization creates new information demands that may be best satisfied with CBMS.

Administrative Structure:
- National
- Provincial
- Municipal/City
- Village/Barangay

Information Availability:
- National surveys

CBMS can fill the gap.
Rationale for CBMS Work

- Lack of necessary disaggregated data for:
  - Diagnosing extent of poverty at the local level
  - Determining the causes of poverty
  - Formulating appropriate policies and program
  - Identifying eligible beneficiaries
  - Assessing impact of policies and programs

- Need for support mechanisms for the implementation of the decentralization policy
Key Features of CBMS

- LGU-based while promoting community participation
- Taps existing LGU-personnel/community members as monitors
- Has a core set of indicators but system is flexible enough to accommodate additional indicators
- Involves complete enumeration of households
- Database established at each geopolitical level
CBMS Core Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CBMS Indicators</th>
<th>Dimensions of Poverty</th>
<th>Core Indicators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Survival</td>
<td>• Health • Food &amp; Nutrition • H20 &amp; Sanitation</td>
<td>1. Child deaths (0-5 yrs. old)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2. Women deaths due to pregnancy-related causes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3. Malnourished children (0-5 yrs. old)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4. HHs w/o access to safe water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5. HHs w/o access sanitary toilet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security</td>
<td>• Shelter • Peace &amp; Order</td>
<td>6. HHs who are squatters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7. HHs living in makeshift housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8. HHs victimized by crimes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enabling</td>
<td>• Income • Employment • Education</td>
<td>9. HHs w/income below poverty threshold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10. HHs w/income below food threshold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11. HHs who experienced food shortage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>12. Unemployment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>13. Elementary school participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14. High school participation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
General Activities in CBMS

Step 1
Advocacy / Organization

Step 2
Data Collection and Field Editing (Training Module 1)

Step 3
Data Encoding and Map Digitizing (Training Module 2)

Step 4
Processing and Mapping (Training Module 3)

Step 5
Data validation and Community Consultation

Step 6
Knowledge (Database) Management

Step 7
Plan Formulation (Training Module 4)

Step 8
Dissemination/Implementation and Monitoring
Step 1: Advocacy/Organization

• Advocacy and preparation of workplan
  – Series of Consultation Meetings and Orientation on CBMS
    • Chief Executives (Governor, Mayors, Chiefs)
    • Vice Governor/Mayor and Councilors
    • Planning and Development Office and other Sectoral Offices
    • Civil Society: i.e. NGOs, POs and other development partners
    • Other concerned agencies /sectors

Outputs:
  – Executive Order from Governor/Mayor
  – Resolution from Local Council
Step 1: Advocacy/Organization

- Institutional arrangement
  - Designation of a CBMS Technical Working Group consisting of representatives from NGOs and government
  - Administrative and technical tasks between the collaborating agencies
    - CBMS Technical Working Group at each level
    - Provincial or Municipal/City Government
  - Coordination among departments
Cost of CBMS Implementation

- Average cost in the Philippines
  30 pesos per household \(\approx\) 0.60 US$

  covers reproduction of questionnaires \(P 3.50\)
  and training manuals
  honorarium of data enumerator \(P 10.00\)
  meals during training \(P 16.50\)

  excludes computers and salaries of government personnel

  CBMS encoding, processing and mapping softwares are free
Resource Mobilization Strategies

• **Cost Sharing Schemes**
  – Costs may be shared by province, city/municipality and barangay
  – Other target users like NGOs in locality may be tapped to share cost for specific CBMS activity

• **Cost Saving Measures**
  – Utilize existing hardware and facilities in LGU
  – Tap services of on-job-trainees, student practicumers and volunteer workers
  – Tap existing government personnel
Step 2: CBMS Data Collection

- Undertaken through a census in all barangays of a city/municipality or province

- Survey instruments used:
  1. household profile questionnaire
  2. barangay profile questionnaire

- It is recommended that the survey operation is completed within one month.

- Enumerators can accomplish about 10 household questionnaires per day
Key Players for CBMS data collection and processing

**Barangay/Village Level**
- Village Captain, Village Councilors,
- Village Health Workers, Village Nutrition Scholars
- Other Village officials
- Other volunteers: Teachers, Students, religious representatives, on the job-trainees

**Municipal/City Level**
- Municipal/City Planning and Development Office

**Provincial Level**
- Provincial Planning and Development Office
Training of CBMS Data Collection

- Trainors from the province and municipalities (3-day training)

- Training of CBMS Enumerators at the barangay level (3-day training)
Steps 3 and 4:
CBMS Manual Data Processing

• Can use tally sheets to process the data – but will be limited to simple count and proportions

• Can use spot maps to map data

• Can use drawings to display data (example: Burkina Faso) or databoards
Steps 3 and 4: CBMS Computerized Data Processing

- The CBMS data computerized encoding system (CSPRO-based)
  - A software package for entering, editing, tabulating, and disseminating data from censuses and surveys.

- CBMS STATSIM
  - An interface to generate the CBMS indicators from the encoded survey data

- CBMS-NRDB
  - The software used to store all information (spatial and non-spatial data) gathered from the CBMS survey.
• The Census and Survey Processing System (CSPro), developed by the US Census Bureau, Macro International and Serpro SA, is a software package for entry, editing, cross-tabulation, and dissemination of data from censuses and surveys.
CBMS STATSIM

Facilitate basic processing through forms with command tabs associated to some processing scheme to be clicked.
CBMS- NRDB

CBMS-NRDB is a spatial database program: Aside from holding numbers and text, it can also store polygons, polylines and coordinates. Information can therefore be displayed spatially on maps.
Training of CBMS Data Processors

- Training on encoding of questionnaires and digitizing barangay spotmaps (3-day training)

- Training on consolidation and database building (3-day training)

- Training on manual processing at the barangay level (2-day training) *(optional for LGUs)*
Step 5. Data validation and Community Consultation

- An activity to ensure that local leaders and the rest of the community are informed of the results of the CBMS survey.

- Provides an avenue for verifying the accuracy of the findings of the survey by facilitating discussions on possible reasons for said findings.

- Serves as a pre-planning activity by identifying the major problems of the community and soliciting possible interventions needed to resolve these problems.
Step 6. Database Building

• What is database building?
  – Putting processing data in access format (*.mdb)
  – Entry selected indicators in NRDB

• What does database management entail?
  ➢ Updating of encoded data
  ➢ Incorporating corrections made during the validation exercise

• Who manages the database?
  ➢ Assigned monitors at the provincial and city/municipal level
Building the National Repository of CBMS Data

• Envisioned to help facilitate data sharing across government agencies, private sector, donor agencies and other relevant stakeholders.

• Specifically, the national repository will:
  - facilitate the access and use of the integrated CBMS database by national entities in their advocacy work with key decision-makers;
  - support government and non-government funding sources in strengthening evidence-based planning and monitoring as well as alignment of their interventions to national priorities
  - facilitate implementation of targeted programs
Sample outputs
Step 7. Other Uses of CBMS

- Preparation of socio-economic profiles/developments
- For preparation of project proposals for external funding
- For formulating appropriate interventions
- For resource allocation
- For identifying eligible beneficiaries
- For impact monitoring
Training on drafting SEP/BDP

- Training on drafting socio-economic profile and village development plan (3-day training)
Step 8. Dissemination/ Implementation and Monitoring

- **WHAT? : Kinds of information**
  - Problem areas
  - Possible reasons for identified problems
  - Possible intervention
  - Eligible beneficiaries

- **WHO?: Target audience**
  - Community Leaders/Officials
  - City/Municipal Development Councils
  - Donor agencies/development partners
  - Other interest groups

- **HOW?: Dissemination tools and media**
  - Publication
  - Digitized maps
  - Online database
  - Meetings/Fora
Frequency of Data

- Every three (3) years
Lessons Learned

✓ Local poverty monitoring system is an important component of the over-all poverty reduction strategy. It facilitates the diagnosis of extent of poverty, the identification of the causes of poverty, the formulation of appropriate interventions, the targeting of eligible beneficiaries, and the assessment of impact.

✓ The chances for nationwide institutionalization are better if CBMS data are useful at both the national and local levels.

✓ Previous targeting schemes of national government agencies suffered from the lack of information to identify eligible beneficiaries. The need for household-based information by the national government agencies creates the demand for CBMS data at the national level.
Lessons Learned

- Decentralized system of governance creates local demand for CBMS data.

- It is important to work with local governments at the outset since they will ultimately bear the costs and benefits of the CBMS. Local governments are willing and able to implement local monitoring systems.

- It is important to include only a core set of indicators to make the system viable. Whenever relevant, a few community-specific indicators may be added to the core set of indicators.

- It is important to adapt the CBMS system to realities/capacities in the country. Thus, indicators, data collection methodology, data processing, and other aspects of the CBMS may be customized.
Lessons Learned

- Capacity-building of local government personnel on diagnosing poverty at the local level using CBMS data is critical. Introducing a new system requires capacity-building over a period of years.

- It is useful to incorporate new technology in the processing, analysis and dissemination of data.

- Computerized processing facilitates analysis and retrieval of data.

- The use of the GIS in presenting the data is very effective. With GIS maps, spatial disparities are readily highlighted, households with unmet needs are easily located, and projects to address unmet needs are correctly positioned.
Lessons Learned

Data on household income are difficult to collect in the CBMS partly because of the irregularity and multiplicity of sources. However, income is a very useful indicator since it is very sensitive to economic changes and shocks. One way to address this problem is to provide adequate training to enumerators to be able to collect good and reliable estimates of household income through CBMS. Other indicators can be used in combination with income to validate income-based poverty status.
Lessons Learned

✓ It takes a long time for a monitoring system that involves many stakeholders to be institutionalized. Continuing advocacy efforts are thus needed to convince national and local policymakers and program implementors to adopt a system. It is critical that a resource center for CBMS that can provide technical assistance to local government units which would like to adopt the system is present.

✓ Incentives should be developed to encourage other LGUs to adopt the system. For example, the use of CBMS data by national government agencies to identify beneficiaries of national programs will encourage LGUs to adopt the system.
Thank You!

PEP-CBMS Network Coordinating Team
Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies
Room I-1016 10th Flr. Angelo King International Center
Estrada Cor. Arellano Ave., Malate, Manila, Philippines
E-mail: reyesc@dls-csb.edu.ph
mimap@dls-csb.edu.ph
Web-site: www.pep-net.org
Tel: (632) 5262067
(632) 5245333
Fax: (632)5262067