Testing the Missing Dimensions of Poverty

CBMS-OPHI Initiative
• CBMS Methodology
• OPHI Major Findings
• Implications for the CBMS
• Conclusions and Recommendations
Background

• CBMS is an organized way of collecting household level information at the local level.

• CBMS generates a core set of indicators that are being measured to determine the welfare status of the population. These indicators capture the multidimensional aspects of poverty.

• It uses freeware customized for CBMS-data encoding, processing and poverty mapping.
Decentralization creates new information demands that may be best satisfied with CBMS.

Administrative Structure:
- National
- Provincial
- Municipal/City
- Village/Barangay

Information Availability:

CBMS can fill the gap

National surveys

CBMS
CBMS Core Indicators

**Dimensions of Poverty**

- **Survival**
  - Health
  - Food & Nutrition
  - H2O & Sanitation

- **Security**
  - Shelter
  - Peace & Order

- **Enabling**
  - Income
  - Employment
  - Education

**Core Indicators**

1. Child deaths (0-5 yrs. old)
2. Women deaths due to pregnancy-related causes
3. Malnourished children (0-5 yrs. old)
4. HHs w/o access to safe water
5. HHs w/o access sanitary toilet

6. HHs who are squatters
7. HHs living in makeshift housing
8. HHs victimized by crimes

9. HHs w/ income below poverty threshold
10. HHs w/ income below food threshold
11. HHs who experienced food shortage
12. Unemployment
13. Elementary school participation
14. High school participation
Proportion of children aged 0-5 years old who are malnourished, by barangay
Province of Marinduque, 2005

Marinduque CBMS Database

- Municipality: MARINDUQUE
  - % children 0-5 who are malnourished:
    - 0 <= n < 4
    - 4 <= n < 7
    - 7 <= n < 7.8
    - 7.8 <= n < 100

- % children 0-5 who are malnourished, MARINDUQUE:
  - 0 <= n < 4
  - 4 <= n < 7
  - 7 <= n < 7.8
  - 7.8 <= n < 100

UTM Zone 50 - Palawan
Scale 1:328331
CBMS Database and Poverty Mapping

Proportion of children aged 0-5 years old who are malnourished, by purok and location of households
Municipality of Torrijos, Marinduque, 2005

Torrijos CBMS Database

- Barangay, Torrijos
- HH with malnourished children
  - No
  - Yes
  - Not applicable
- Sibuyao Forest

% of malnourished children
- $0 = n < 4$
- $4 = n < 7$
- $7 = n < 7.8$
- $7.8 = n < 100$

UTM Zone 51 (Marinduque)

Scale: 1:20,482

0 2 4 6 8 10 km
Coverage of CBMS implementation in the Philippines as of August 31, 2010

60 provinces (32 of which are provincewide)  
698 municipalities and 45 cities, covering a total of 18,269 barangays

With Technical Assistance from:

- DILG-BLGD and CBMS Team with support from WB-ASEM
- DILG-BLGD and CBMS Team with support from UNFPA
- DILG-BLGD, DILG Regional offices and CBMS Team
- Eastern Visayas CBMS TWG and CBMS Team
- Bicol CBMS TWG and CBMS Team
- Bicol CBMS TWG and CBMS Team with support from Spanish Government
- MIMAROPA CBMS TWG and CBMS Team
- NAPC and CBMS Team with support from UNDP
- Dawn Foundation and CBMS Team
- Social Watch Philippines and CBMS Team
- SRTC, SUCs and CBMS Team
- Kagabay and CBMS Team
- SRTC, NEDA IV-A and CBMS Team
- CBMS Team
Objectives

- The CBMS-OPHI initiative builds on CBMS-Philippines’ existing relationships with local governments
- Aims to provide these governments with better data on which to base their programs, projects and activities.
The objectives of this collaboration are:

- To test the five missing dimensions of poverty in the Philippines community-based setting to allow for validation of results;
- To develop a related local government accountability exercise that replicates the CBMS and to test this exercise among CBMS-implementing countries;
- To confirm the questions in the five survey modules that work well and make suggestions and recommendations on how the modules could further be improved;
- To see which of these five modules can be of use and are of interest to local governments and actors; and
- To determine which questions will be added to the regular CBMS data collection and add them to the questionnaire that is administered by CBMS-implementing government units.
Coverage of the Study

Figure 1. Map of survey sites

Table 1. Number of households and respondents, by sex and urbanity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Households</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No.</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>420</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>178</td>
<td>42.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>242</td>
<td>57.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CBMS-OPHI Survey, 2009
Survey Instruments

- CBMS Household Profile Questionnaire
- 5 OPHI modules which were translated into the local language (employment, empowerment, shame and humiliation, physical security, and psychological and subjective wellbeing)
Survey Results: Employment

- Large proportion (62.7%) of employed individuals do not receive any kind of protection in terms of employment benefits (paid leave, health insurance, pension)
- 81% of income poor employed members had no employment benefits compared to only 53% of non-poor employed members.
- Individuals who have no formal education or only got elementary education reported the largest proportion of workers who do not have employment benefits. Results imply that workers who are better educated are less likely to be employed in jobs that do not have employment benefits.
Survey Results: Employment

- A larger proportion of male workers have no employment benefits compared to female workers. Dissimilarity in classification of work may explain the disparity between genders. Most of the females work in private establishments while most males are employed in households.

- Underemployment rate among income poor workers is 75.9% which is higher compared to 67.9% in non-poor workers.

- Underemployment is higher in workers who have lower educational attainment.
• A large proportion (i.e., 91.4%) of the respondents feels that it is *fairly true* or *completely true* that their life has meaning.

• There were more non-income poor who are in a state of subjective wellbeing compared to poor but the difference is not great (79% vs 74%).
Survey Results: Psychological and Subjective Well-being

• Individuals with higher educational attainment are more likely to be in a state of psychological wellbeing.
About 59.8% of the respondents reported being *fairly* or *very satisfied* with their lives overall.

Respondents that have at least college education reported the highest proportion of persons who are happy and satisfied (60%).
Survey Results: Empowerment

• Almost half (48.1%) of the respondents felt they have control over all their daily decisions.

• Regarding minor household purchases, 59.3% of respondents said they normally make decisions alone.

• Decisions related to work/tasks undertaken at home is made by 58.6 % of respondents alone.
Survey Results: Empowerment

• Majority (72.4%) of respondents said that they would like to change something in their life.
• Most common thing they want to change is their household’s economic situation. 46.4% of respondents thought family will contribute most to any change in their life.
• On a ten point scale, the average empowerment level is 7.04. However, 29% of the respondents rate their empowerment at 5 or below.
Survey Results: Shame and Humiliation

• Shame proneness is highest among those with basic educational levels and lowest among those with tertiary levels. This suggests that those with lower educational levels are more shame prone than those with higher educational attainment. Those with higher levels of educational attainment feel that they are respected by others more frequently than those with lower levels of educational attainment.

• Respondents from low income groups are more shame prone than respondents from higher income groups. This suggests that shame proneness increases as one moves from the highest to the lowest quintile. Poor respondents also felt more disrespectful treatment than non-poor respondents, as well as unfair and prejudiced treatments.
• Among the three forms of discrimination more respondents (29.2%) felt that economic standing, for instance, being poor, would hinder chances of getting services from public and private sectors, as well as chances of going to school and universities and getting jobs from both private and public sectors.
Sixty two households have been victims of crimes against property (15%).

Only 8.6% of the surveyed experienced crimes against person.

More often than not, culprit for crimes against property is someone victims did not see or did not know.

While for the more common culprits of crimes against person are persons considered close or familiar by the victims.
Survey Results: Security and Violence

- Crimes against person are more likely to happen in places near the victims such as the neighborhood and home (62.5% and 25.0%).
- Majority of the victims of both kinds of crimes did not report. Among those who did, they reported mostly to traditional leaders.
- More male victims of crimes against property, more female victims of crimes against person.
- More non-poor victims of crimes against property while more poor victims of crimes against person.
Survey Results: Safety and Violence

- Characteristics of groups who felt higher chances of becoming victims in the next 12 months.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Feels higher chances of becoming victims</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Educational Attainment</td>
<td>Secondary/Post Secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urbanity</td>
<td>Urban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
<td>Poor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>Males</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>Younger (teens to thirties)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Implications for CBMS

• Figure below shows the relationship among the CBMS core indicators and other indicators of the missing dimensions of poverty. Results show that poverty can be measured using these different indicators since they capture the different dimensions of poverty.
Implications for CBMS

• Although the CBMS methodology already considers the multidimensionality of poverty, it is recognized that the existing data collection instruments could still be improved by collecting additional information that would capture the “missing dimensions” of poverty.

• Pertinent questions regarding hours worked during the reference period could be included in the CBMS questionnaire.

• Moreover, aside from asking employment questions only to respondents who are employed, as designed in the OPHI questionnaire, it is recommended that these questions be asked to all employed members of the household.
Conclusion

• Determining how different indicators relate to poverty is a critical issue.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cut-off (Dimension)</th>
<th>FGT (0)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 and more</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*include underemployment and community empowerment
Source: Authors' calculations
Thank You!

PEP-CBMS Network Office (Asia)
Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies
10th Floor, Angelo King International Center,
Estrada corner Arellano Streets, Malate, Manila
Telefax (632) 5262067/ 5238888 loc. 274

Email at: cbms.network@gmail.com
Website: www.pep-net.org