Gaining from Insights on the CBMS Application: The Case of the Philippines

Proceedings of the 2004 National Conference on CBMS

September 23-24, 2004
Makati City, Philippines
Gaining Insights on the CBMS Application: The Case of the Philippines

Proceedings of the 2004 National Conference on CBMS
GAINING INSIGHTS ON THE CBMS APPLICATION: THE CASE OF THE PHILIPPINES

PROCEEDINGS OF THE 2004 NATIONAL CONFERENCE ON CBMS

September 23-24, 2004
Makati City, Philippines

The 2004 National Conference on CBMS was organized by the CBMS Network Coordinating Team of the Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies with the aid of a grant from the International Development Research Centre (IDRC), Ottawa, Canada.
Gaining Insights on the CBMS Application: The Case of the Philippines
Proceedings of the 2004 National Conference on CBMS
Copyright © CBMS Network Coordinating Team, 2005

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED.
No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means—whether virtual, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise—without the written permission of the copyright owner.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The publication of this volume has been made possible through the CBMS Network Coordinating Team of the Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies of De La Salle University-Manila with the aid of a grant from the International Development Research Centre (IDRC), Ottawa, Canada.
# Table of Contents

Preface ................................................. ix
Program ................................................. xi
Opening Remarks ...................................... 1
Keynote Address ....................................... 5
Investing in Information in the Philippines ........ 9
  *Michelle Hibler*
Community-Based Monitoring System: A Tool to
  Fight Poverty ....................................... 15
    *Celia M. Reyes, et. al.*
CBMS Experiences of Local Partners from Palawan .... 47
  The use of CBMS for Local Governance: From a
    Provincial Perspective ............................ 49
      *Joel T. Reyes*
  Profiling South Palawan Planning Area Using CBMS .... 57
      *Rogelio Abiog*
  CBMS: The San Vicente, Palawan Experience .......... 65
      *Lucylyn Panagsagan*
  Building a Profile with the CBMS Information: Barangay
  Oring-Oring, Brooke’s Point, Palawan ................. 83
      *Ibrahim Palampisi*
  Evaluating the CIDSS and Other Programs in Palawan ... 101
      *Josephine Escaño*
CBMS Experiences of Local Partners from
  Camarines Norte ................................... 117
  The use of CBMS for Local Governance: From
    Municipal Perspective ............................ 119
      *Winifredo Balce Oco*
  CBMS-GIS and Global Positioning System:
    The Sta. Elena Experience ....................... 127
      *Bimbo Doria*
Applying the CBMS in the Preparation of SEPs and Project Proposals: The Labo Experience ........................................... 133
   Evaristo Pandi
The Case of Basud, Camarines Norte ........................................... 137
   Rosalie Ocan-Lopez
The Experience of Talisay, Camarines Norte ................................. 141
   Mirian Hernandez
Mobilizing for the CBMS in Labo, Camarines Norte ..................... 145
   Jose Ramon Lagatuz
The CBMS Experience of Barangay Kalamunding, Labo, Camarines Norte ................................................................. 153
   Constancia Labios
Views from New CBMS Partners .................................................. 159
   CBMS and Pasay City: Sharing the Spirit of “Bayanihan” in Reducing Poverty ............................................................. 161
      Wenceslao Trinidad
Province of Bulacan: Learning from CBMS Experiences of Other LGUs ................................................................. 163
      Arlene Pascual
Mandaue City: Using the CBMS as a Complement to its Delivery Performance of Basic Services ........................................... 165
      Thadeo Ouano
Comments from National Government Agencies ............................ 167
   Local Governments as Champions of CBMS ................................ 169
      Oskar Balbastro
Integrating the CBMS Concept in Monitoring the MDGs ............... 173
      Maritess Balhon-Kelly
Continuing Data Generation: The heart of a Good Monitoring System ................................................................. 175
      Gil Fernando Cruz
Building a Broad Partnerships for a Successful CBMS ................. 177
      Gerardo Calderon
Better Understanding of the CBMS for a Better Evaluation of its Contributions ........................................ 181

Paul Villaret

Training as a Tool for Better CBMS Application ........................................ 185

Eduardo Youngson

Remarks from International Organizations ........................................ 183

CBMS and International Partnerships: From the IDRC Perspective ................................. 187

Evan Due

Enhancing the Presentation of CBMS Data Through Maps ................................. 193

Ronet Santos

Highlights of discussions .............................................................................. 195

Directory of the Participants ................................................................. 205
Preface

This volume contains the proceedings of the National Conference on Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS) organized by the CBMS Network Coordinating Team of the Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies of the De La Salle University-Manila on September 23-24, 2004 at the Dusit Hotel Nikko, Makati City.

The two-day conference showcased the rich and fruitful experiences of local government units in using CBMS for planning, program formulation, policy impact assessment and poverty monitoring. The first day of the conference served as a policy forum for a wide range of CBMS stakeholders including heads of national government agencies, local chief executives and non-government organization (NGO) representatives. Also featured were the experiences of the Province of Palawan, the City of Puerto Princesa (also in Palawan) and the Municipality of Labo in Camarines Norte in implementing their own local poverty monitoring systems. The second day, on the other hand, focused on technical discussions on the various applications of CBMS as well as on the best practices and lessons learned by the LGU partners of the CBMS Network Coordinating Team.

The highlights of the discussions after every session are likewise documented here to provide the reader with a comprehensive view of the wealth of ideas that emerged during the conference.

The conference, which was attended by at least 100 delegates from local and national government agencies, the academe and various international organizations, was made possible with the aid of a grant from the International Development Research Centre (IDRC) based in Ottawa, Canada.
Program

September 23, 2004

Registration

Opening Ceremony

Master of Ceremonies: Mr. Raymund Habaradas
Assistant Professor, College of Business and Management
De La Salle University

National Anthem/Invocation

Opening Remarks

Dr. Ponciano S. Intal, Jr.
Executive Director
Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies
De La Salle University

Keynote Speaker

Honorable Secretary Corazon Soliman
Secretary, Department of Social Welfare and Development

Represented by: Honorable Lourdes G. Balanon
Undersecretary for Programs and Policy Group
Department of Social Welfare and Development

Open Forum

Board Member
Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies
De La Salle University
Coffee Break

Session 1: CBMS Local and International Network Initiatives: An Overview

Presentor: Dr. Celia Reyes
PEP Co-Director and CBMS Network Leader

Session 2. CBMS and Local Governance

Case of Palawan
Presentor: Honorable Governor Joel Reyes
Governor of Palawan and Vice-President for Luzon of the League of Provinces of the Philippines

Responses
Mr. Oskar Balbastro
Director for Region IV-B
National Economic and Development Authority

Open Forum

Lunch

Experience of Municipality of Labo, Camarines Norte
Presentor: Honorable Mayor Winifredo Balce-Oco
Municipal Mayor of Labo, Camarines Norte and President, League of Mayors of Camarines Norte

CBMS: The Puerto Princesa Experience
Presentor: Honorable Mayor Edward Hagedorn
City Mayor of Puerto Princesa, Palawan

Represented by: Ms. Jovenee Sagun
Assistant City Planning and Development Coordinator
Responses

_Atty. Gil Fernando C. Cruz_
Executive Director, League of Cities of the Philippines

_Mayor Gerardo V. Calderon_
Secretary General, League of Municipalities of the Philippines and
Municipal Mayor, Angono, Rizal

Open Forum

Coffee Break

Responses from New Local CBMS Partners

_Ms. Arlene Pascual_
Provincial Planning and Development Coordinator
Province of Bulacan

_Honorable Mayor Thadeo Ouano_
City Mayor of Mandaue, Cebu and Vice President for the
Visayas of the League of Cities of the Philippines

_Represented By: Mr. Serafin Blanco_
City Administrator, Mandaue City, Cebu

_Honorable Mayor Wenceslao Trinidad_
City Mayor of Pasay and Spokesperson, Metro Manila Mayors League

Responses from International Organizations on Local Monitoring
System-Related Initiatives

_Mr. Ronet Santos_
Regional Coordinator, Voluntary Service Organization
Dr. Evan Due  
Senior Regional Program Specialist  
International Development Research Centre  
Regional Office for Southeast and East Asia

Open Forum

Closing Remarks  
Dr. Celia M. Reyes  
PEP Co-Director and CBMS Network Leader

End of Session

September 24, 2004

Session 3. CBMS Data Collection and Data Processing Techniques

CBMS-GIS and Global Positioning System  
Presenter: Mr. Bimbo Doria  
Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator  
Sta. Elena, Camarines Norte

Open Forum  
Moderator: Dr. Caesar B. Cororaton  
Senior Research Fellow  
Philippine Institute for Development Studies

Session 4. Use of CBMS for Preparation of Development Plans and Socioeconomic Profiles

Profiling South Palawan Planning Area (SPPA) Using CBMS  
Presenter: Mr. Rogelio Abiog  
Manager, Southern Palawan Planning Information Center
CBMS: The San Vicente Experience

*Presentor: Ms. Lucylyn Panagsagan*
Assistant Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator
Municipality of San Vicente, Northern Palawan

Coffee Break

Application of CBMS in the Preparation of SEPs and Project Proposals

*Presentor: Mr. Evaristo Pandi*
Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator
Labo, Camarines Norte

Use of CBMS for Program Intervention at the Barangay Level

*Punong Barangay Constancia Labios*
Barangay Kalamunding, Labo, Camarines Norte

*Punong Barangay Ibrahim Palampisi*
Barangay Oring Oring, Brookespoint, Southern Palawan

Responses

*Mr. Eduardo Youngson*
Deputy for External Affairs, League of Barangays of the Philippines

*Ms. Maritess Balhon-Kelly*
Local Government Officer IV
Bureau of Local Government Development
Department of Interior and Local Government

*Mr. Paul Villarete*
National President, League of Local Development Planners of the Philippines and City Planning and Development Coordinator-Cebu City
Open Forum

Lunch

Session 5. Program Impact Assessment and CBMS

Evaluating the CIDSS and Other Programs in Palawan

Presenter: Ms. Josephine Escaño
Chief, Research and Evaluation Division
Provincial Government of Palawan

Open Forum


Presentors:

Mr. Jose Ramon Lagatuza
LGU-Labo, Camarines Norte

Ms. Rosalie Ocan-Lopez
LGU-Basud, Camarines Norte

Open Forum

Moderator: Dr. Jose Ramon Albert
Research Chief, Statistical Research and Training Center

Closing Remarks

End of Session
**Introduction**

“Waiting for something,” reads the sign above the small waiting shed on the side of the dusty road that cuts through a rural barangay in the municipality of Coron on Busuanga Island in the Philippine Province of Palawan. “Waiting for nothing,” reads another a kilometer or so down the road.

These two signs may well describe the feelings of many Palaweños, indeed of many Filipinos. Optimism, because of the national government’s commitment, since the late 1980s, to reduce poverty. Pessimism because, as Dr. Celia Reyes, Poverty and Economic Policy (PEP)-Co Director and CBMS Network Leader based at the Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies (AKI) in Manila, says, “the performance of the Philippines with respect to poverty reduction has been very modest. While the incidence of poverty has declined over the past 15 years, the number of poor has actually increased.”

The Philippines’ lackluster performance in reducing poverty is partly due to the boom-bust cycle of the country’s economy. It is also due to the country’s poverty reduction strategies and policies, says Dr. Reyes. While poverty reduction targets were set for the first time in the 1987-1992 development plan and successive governments made
poverty reduction a central part of their platforms, “the practice of discontinuing programs associated with previous administrations has been disadvantageous to the poor.” Even before a program is fully implemented, it is scrapped and replaced with a new one, only to suffer the same fate a few years hence.

**The need for timely data**

Programs have also suffered from a lack of timely, accurate information on the nature and extent of poverty as well as on the means to monitor the effectiveness of poverty reduction programs. “We would know the impact of policies and programs only after three or four years,” Dr. Ponciano Intal, Jr., Executive Director of the Angelo King Institute at De La Salle University, explained at the first National Conference on Community-Based Poverty Monitoring System (CBMS), held in Manila on September 23-24, 2004. In fact, data on poverty were irregular, infrequent, and unmatched from survey to survey. Thus, no comprehensive profile could be drawn at any time. The data were also too aggregated to be of much use to local planners.

The CBMS was born out of that frustration. One of the tools developed in the early 1990s under the International Development Research Centre (IDRC)’s Micro Impact of Macroeconomic Adjustment Policies (MIMAP)-Philippines Project, it aims to provide policymakers and program implementors with a good information base for tracking the impacts of macroeconomic reforms and various policy shocks. Although initially designed to be implemented in sentinel sites, CBMS today is being implemented province-wide in Palawan, in seven municipalities in Camarines Norte and, more recently, in the province of Bulacan and in Mandaue City in Cebu and Pasay City in Metro Manila. In April 2003, the Philippines’ Department of the Interior and Local Government enjoined all local government units—at the barangay, municipal, city, and provincial levels—to adopt the system’s 13 core indicators for measuring poverty. From its first home in the Philippines, CBMS has also now spread, with IDRC support, to 12 countries.
The National Conference brought together 120 local, regional, and national government officials, researchers, and development workers to share their experiences in implementing CBMS and discuss its impact. “The many local government unit representatives at the conference is significant,” said conference moderator, Attorney Ricardo Puno Jr, member of the Board of Trustees of the Angelo King Institute, “because if anyone should be concerned about local populations, it’s you. And if the country is to be developed, it will be because of local people and communities.”

A tool for local governance

Indeed, if the original audience for CBMS data was intended to be national policymakers, it has proven to be an extremely useful tool for local governance, particularly as decentralization has shifted responsibilities to local government units. “CBMS gives you information about where you are now, where you should be, and how you’re going to get there,” said the Honorable Joel Reyes, Governor of Palawan and a staunch CBMS supporter. “It provides reliable, relevant and comprehensive data on the welfare conditions and development status across the province.”

The use of such data for evidence-based decision making emerged clearly in the conference presentations. For instance, in Palawan’s capital, Puerto Princesa, three areas were found to lack access to health centers. These will be constructed in the coming year. Proof of inadequate access to safe water supplies and electricity has led to programs to extend these services in many barangays, such as Oring-Oring in Southern Palawan, where CBMS data identified a number of problems, among them poverty, poor sanitation, lack of access to electricity, low school participation, and low participation in community organizations. As a result, said Barangay Captain Ibrahim Palampisi, a feeder road is being built to enable farmers to get their produce to markets, and 50 homes were provided connections to electricity/power. Increased water supplies, public toilets, new classrooms, and a day care center have also been provided. In another barangay, the CBMS
survey carried out two years ago has resulted in emphasis being shifted from infrastructure projects to social services such as a child feeding program.

The profiles of municipalities that emerge from the analysis of CBMS data also enable programs to be targeted to individual households—which ones will receive agricultural inputs such as seeds and fertilizers, which ones will get sanitary toilets, which will receive subsidized health care or educational aid. As Serafin Blanco, Administrator of Mandaue City, Cebu Province, put it, it’s a means for “development to assume a face and an address.”

Using a Geographic Information System, maps can be produced that clearly show households and facilities. For instance, in the municipality of Labo—the first municipality in the province of Camarines Norte to implement CBMS— the maps showing the location of students and the city’s 10 schools provided one clue to low school attendance. And, said Mayor Winifredo Balce Oco, when the results were presented to the community for validation, other reasons emerged. “A number of these children are expected to be economically productive to help their families,” he said. “Some households do not have enough money to pay the tuition and more so, provide for the day-to-day expenses of the children.” To address this problem, financial assistance and school supplies are now being provided to indigent households, he said.

**For and by the community**
Community participation is key to the success of CBMS. Informed from the outset about the survey’s objectives and uses, the community also provides enumerators—barangay workers, health workers, students, etc.—and data processors. Information is collected from every household and the data are tallied and consolidated manually at the village level. Municipal/city aggregates are submitted to the province for consolidation.

The processed data are returned to the community for validation and discussion. This empowers communities by providing them with information and a process through which they can actively participate
in planning, said Dr. Reyes. Barangay residents thus develop a keen sense of their priorities and are better able to articulate their needs to city planning officers. Armed with hard information on their condition, they are able to play a direct role in allocating budgetary resources. And they can demand accountability and transparency on the part of government officials. Sometimes, community members discover that the solution lies in their own hands. In Barangay Oring-Oring, for instance, a local organization and a businessman each donated public toilets to help solve the sanitation problem in two most seriously deprived communities. The households that share the toilets maintain them.

If CBMS is spreading rapidly in the Philippines, the challenges of ensuring continuity and of institutionalization remain. But the commitment of conference participants in pursuing and promoting the system is encouraging. “In my term, I will make it a law in the province of Palawan,” said Governor Reyes. Mayor Wenceslao “Peewee” Trinidad of Pasay City, Mayor Gerardo Calderon of Angono in Rizal province, and many others also pledged to implement and support CBMS in their municipalities and barangays.

The next steps are to scale up and ensure that national statistical agencies coordinate the generation of data. This would enable CBMS to go nationwide, said Dr. Reyes. Also needed is technical assistance to local government units and a central repository for the data. And as Carmelita Ericta, administrator of the National Statistics Office, pointed out, all government units need is to recognize that information gathering is not a cost; rather, it is an investment.
On behalf of the Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies of the De La Salle University and the CBMS Network Coordinating Team headed by Celia Reyes, I would like to welcome and thank you for joining us in this two-day national conference on the Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS).

We are here to share information and experiences on the community-based monitoring system. At the same time, I also consider this occasion as an opportunity to celebrate partnerships. In this regard, the CBMS Team and I would like to give special thanks to the following institutions and people, without whose help, we would not be holding this conference on CBMS today.

First of all, to the International Development Research Centre (IDRC) for helping us conceive and for continuously and patiently nurturing the Micro Impacts of Macroeconomic Adjustment Policies (MIMAP) Project, which spawned into the CBMS project that we are discussing today. Second, to the Province of Palawan and Governor Joel Reyes as well as to the town of Labo, Camarines Norte and Mayor Oco for their enthusiastic partnership with the CBMS team in testing out and applying the CBMS framework and methodology. Without their enthusiastic support, CBMS would not have gotten off the ground. And

* Executive Director, Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies, De La Salle University, Manila.
of course, now, we also have other partners — potential partners like Mandaue City, the Province of Bulacan and other local government units. I would also like to acknowledge the Philippine Institute for Development Studies (PIDS), the National Statistical Coordination Board (NSCB) and the National Statistics Office (NSO) for having been instrumental in cultivating and sustaining the fertilization of ideas during the initial years of the MIMAP and CBMS in the early 1990s.

To some extent, the MIMAP (which is a broader project under which CBMS works) and CBMS were born out of our frustration due to the lack of timely information on the impacts of structural adjustment policies on various groups of people. At that time, we, especially the staff at the National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA), were always groaning that we would only know the impacts of policies and programs after three or four years — definitely a long time for the effective redesign of programs as needed – because of the absence of timely data.

At that time, the design of policies and programs was a product of faith on economic logic rather than on hard facts. We all know how critical timely and reliable information is to good and effective management, whether at the local level or at the national level. I believe that the CBMS experiences that we got from Palawan and Labo and other local government units testify to the fact that CBMS can be a useful tool for a more effective local governance.

At the same time, the CBMS team and I believe that when properly implemented, CBMS can also be a useful tool for more timely information at the national level where it needs to be viewed as a complement to, not a substitute for, the national level surveys that are currently being undertaken by the NSO and other government agencies. Thus, the timeliness, regularity and reliability of the national surveys must also be safeguarded.

Unfortunately, whenever there is a fiscal problem, as we have right now, the financial support for even the basic information base that the country needs like the census, is in danger. Even population and family income and expenditure surveys (FIES) are always under threat.
Hopefully, our top policymakers and lawmakers would realize that such surveys are basic and therefore non-negotiable whenever a budget crunch comes along.

On that note, therefore, let me end my remarks and welcome all of you once again to this two-day national conference on CBMS.

Thank you very much.
Making democracy work and people empowerment real through the CBMS

Corazon Soliman*

Introduction
Democracy is often an overused word, bandied about in speeches, rallies, and political messages that the word has acquired an almost permanent patina of vagueness. What does democracy mean to the common man, for instance, when he cannot eat three square meals a day nor support his children to school? What does democracy mean to him when he is jobless and hungry? The common lament that people have about government is that they often do not know what is going on and worse, they do not know where their hard-earned money or taxes are going. How does one then make democracy palpable and real? How can it become a living, and not merely a rhetorical, concept?

CBMS as a people program
This is where the concept of people involvement comes in. If people, for example, are involved, especially at the community level, in a system where they themselves collect, process and use data, and which monitors the conditions of the vulnerable groups in a given area, then governance can be more empowering and democratic. This is what the community-based monitoring system or CBMS tries to address. The CBMS was developed to aid in poverty reduction by providing an up-to-

* Secretary, Department of Social Welfare and Development. The speech was delivered by Hon. Lourdes G. Balanon, Undersecretary for Programs and Policy Group, Department of Social Welfare and Development.
date picture of the poverty situation of vulnerable groups through the frequent collection of well-designed but relatively simple sets of indicators. It also involves the participation of communities in the collection and use of data/indicators, enabling it (CBMS) to be a low-cost, easy-to-maintain system. As such, it provides an answer and practical alternative to having large and costly surveys from where standard poverty monitoring systems are usually drawn. Moreover, because the CBMS data are collected on a regular basis with definite reference periods, the CBMS is able to give a comprehensive profile of various social demographic groups of interest at specific points in time.

For provincial, city and municipal planners, the CBMS equips them with crucial information that guide their decisions and with data that are used to ensure the delivery of services where they are needed most. Local capacities are also enhanced along with gender equity. Crisis impacts are likewise detected earlier. If one takes this step further, the CBMS can also be used to ensure that projects being implemented are constructed and finished within standards. In this regard, the days of ghost projects, substandard materials and shoddy workmanship may be numbered because more people are involved in the process of monitoring and checking.

**CBMS best practices/experiences**

In the next two days of this conference, the best practices and experiences of CBMS will be shared by practitioners. The transformative powers of instituting processes that are truly community-based will be shown to us. We will see how CBMS can be used as an empowering tool that equips people with the weapons to fight poverty more scientifically and efficiently. Being scientific, however, does not mean that it is less human. The human side is never taken for granted because it is inherently participatory in nature and intended to serve the poorest of the poor.

**The challenges ahead**

In sharing experiences and technologies, we shall be faced by many challenges, one of which is how to spread and replicate best practices.
How do we convince hesitant local government units who want to stay within the comfort zone of status quo and traditional politics? How do we convince stakeholders to take up the cause of development? This is where the crucial elements of leadership come in. There are hundreds and thousands of these people who are willing to lay their lives on the line for the greater good. Unfortunately, what often gets recognized are those from the flip side of the coin. We choose to harp on the negative instead of highlighting the positive. There are change agents out there who are orchestrating synergy among various sectors, bridging divides and reaching out to the most disadvantaged. The network of the CBMS has the potential to be such a change agent by providing planners and implementers with the means to properly plan, prioritize and choose higher impact projects. The network has the potential to harness resources previously underutilized and spur growth from the grassroots. May the next two days of exchanging experiences and ideas therefore lead to realizing our common objective of improving the lives of impoverished Filipinos. And may we see the fruits of the two days not ending in simply speaking but in getting translated into effective action.
Introduction
Poverty reduction remains to be one of the biggest challenges faced by the Philippines. Not surprisingly, the country has adopted poverty reduction as the main goal of all its development efforts. However, to wage a successful fight against poverty, it is important to know the nature and extent of poverty as well as who the poor are, where they are, and why they are poor.

Data relating to the different dimensions of poverty are traditionally obtained from national censuses and surveys conducted by the National Statistics Office (NSO). However, these surveys and censuses are conducted infrequently and at irregular intervals. Moreover, they are conducted at different time periods making it impossible to have a comprehensive picture of the different dimensions of poverty at a particular point in time. Thus, we do not know if the ones who are poor based on income are also poor with regard to literacy, nutrition and housing, among others.

Furthermore, data from these sources are very aggregated. The available national, regional and sometimes provincial data are not sufficient to meet the demands of local government units, particularly cities/municipalities and barangays, which need disaggregated information for diagnosing poverty at the local level and identifying

---

* Celia M. Reyes, Anne Bernadette E. Mandap, Kenneth C. Ilarde, Lani V. Garnace, Jasminda P. Asirot and Joel E. Bancolita.
appropriate interventions.

More recently, there has been greater emphasis on targeted programs because of limited financial resources to implement poverty reduction assistance programs. Several programs of national government agencies such as the Philhealth program for the indigents and of the local government units such as livelihood and scholarship programs, are intended for the poor. Unfortunately, data are not available to support such targeting schemes. Consequently, there have been difficulties in identifying eligible beneficiaries.

When disparities are large within municipalities/cities and barangays, pure geographic targeting is not enough. Geographic targeting can be used as the first step in prioritizing areas, but household/individual level targeting is needed to be able to minimize leakages and reduce exclusions.

The community-based monitoring system (CBMS) seeks to address the existing gaps in the statistical system as shown in Figure 1.

**Framework of CBMS**

**Rationale**

CBMS is an organized way of collecting household level information at the local level. However, CBMS is more than just a data collection
system. It seeks to integrate the use of data in local level planning and program implementation. It is also intended to promote evidence-based decisionmaking.

The CBMS is also a tool to support the decentralization process by providing the LGUs with a system to improve local governance. It builds the capacities of LGUs to develop policies and programs that meet the needs of the people.

With our commitment to meet the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), it becomes imperative to be able to monitor the performance of the country vis-à-vis the targets. Initial monitoring indicates that spatial disparities are large, necessitating concerted action in areas where performance is very low. The CBMS will allow the monitoring of achievements of these targets not just at the municipal level but also at the barangay level.

**History**

The development of the CBMS started in the Philippines with a design proposed by Florentino and Pedro (1992) under the Micro Impacts of Macroeconomic Adjustment Policies (MIMAP) Phase II Project in 1992. Further refinements were then done in the system in the succeeding phases of the project.

Reyes and Alba (1994) modified the proposed system in 1994. Initially designed to be established in sentinel areas, they recommended for it to be LGU-based to ensure the sustainability of the system. Afterwards, the proposed system was pilot-tested in 2 barangays in Pandi, Bulacan in 1995 and 1996. As a result of the pilot test, the CBMS design was further refined and documented in the paper by Reyes and Ilarde in 1996. A second round of CBMS survey was conducted in Pandi, Bulacan in 1999. The survey was used to look at the impact of the Asian financial crisis and the El Niño in 1997 and 1998.

The CBMS was implemented province-wide in Palawan in November 1999 (Mandap, 2001). This was followed by the

---

1 MIMAP Project Updates, June and December 1999 issues.
implementation of the CBMS survey in Puerto Princesa City in November 2001. The second round of CBMS survey in the province of Palawan was conducted in 2002.

The most recent improvement in the system is the identification of a core set of indicators in 2002 (Reyes, 2002). These core local poverty indicators were adopted during the Seventh En Banc Meeting of the National Anti-Poverty Commission through En Banc Resolution No. 7. This has been the basis for the Memorandum Circular No. 2003-92 issued by the Department of Interior and Local Government on April 29, 2003. This circular contained the policy guidelines for the adoption of the core local poverty indicators in planning. The guidelines are intended to aid local government units in assessing and understanding poverty and its dimensions at the barangays, municipalities, cities and provinces with the end in view of formulating a Local Poverty Reduction Action Plan and implementing the plans and programs that would reduce poverty.

**Features**

The CBMS has several features: (1) it is LGU-based; (2) it taps existing LGU personnel as monitors; and (3) it has a core set of indicators. These three key features enhance the capacity of local governments in detecting and reducing poverty.

**LGU-based**

The CBMS is the first poverty monitoring system that collects information on all households in the community that is LGU-based, starting at the barangay level. This means that the local government units take the lead in the data collection and processing, serve as the repository of the database and use the data in the formulation of the annual development plan and annual investment plan. Members of the community are also very much involved in the data collection and validation, processing, analysis, and formulation of the plans.

What sets the system apart from the other systems is that it builds the capacity of local governments in using poverty statistics as inputs in the formulation of development plans and as basis in the formulation of
CBMS: A Tool to Fight Poverty

poverty reduction programs and projects. Moreover, it empowers the communities by ensuring their participation in diagnosing poverty and identifying appropriate interventions.

*Taps existing LGU personnel as monitors*

The CBMS taps local personnel to do the data collection, processing and analysis of the data. As shown in the CBMS flow of information (Figure 2), coordination among the different levels of government is very important.

The CBMS utilizes household surveys to collect information at the household and individual levels. It involves complete enumeration of all households to provide information on not just how poor the barangay or municipality/city is, but more importantly, on who and where the poor are. Data are submitted to the next higher geopolitical level, allowing for the establishment of databanks at the barangay, municipal/city and

**Figure 2. CBMS Flow of Information**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LEVEL</th>
<th>DATA SOURCES</th>
<th>DATA PROCESSING/ DATA BANK</th>
<th>DATA USERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National</td>
<td>National Government Agencies</td>
<td>NAPC / NEDA</td>
<td>NAPC, DILG, NEDA, DSWD, NGOs, Other Data Users</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial</td>
<td>Line Agencies, NSO, NGOs</td>
<td>CBMS Provincial Monitors</td>
<td>PPDO Program Implementors, Other Data Users</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City/Municipal</td>
<td>Line Agencies, NSO District Offices, NGOs</td>
<td>CBMS City/Municipal Monitors</td>
<td>CPDO/MPDO Program Implementors, Other Data Users</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barangay</td>
<td>CBMS Enumerators, NGOs, POs</td>
<td>CBMS Barangay Monitors</td>
<td>BDC Program Implementors, Other Data Users</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
provincial levels. A national agency such as the National Anti-Poverty Commission (NAPC) or the National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA) is envisioned to be the national repository of the data. Such national repository can be the source of data for identifying the eligible beneficiaries of targeted programs of the national government.

**Has a core set of indicators**

There are 14 core indicators (Table 1) that are being measured to determine the welfare status of the population. These indicators capture the multidimensional aspects of poverty and have been confined to output and impact indicators. Since CBMS is designed to be LGU-based, it is important that indicators are easy to collect and process. Information is collected through surveys of all households in the community. The local people themselves are data collectors and processors.

**Table 1. CBMS Core Indicators**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Health</th>
<th>1. Proportion of child deaths</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B. Nutrition</td>
<td>2. Prevalence of malnourished children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Housing</td>
<td>3. Proportion of households living in non-makeshift housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Proportion of households who are not squatters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Water and Sanitation</td>
<td>5. Proportion of households with access to safe water supply</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Basic Education and Literacy</td>
<td>6. Proportion of households with access to sanitary toilet facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. Elementary school participation rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8. Secondary school participation rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9. Literacy rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Income</td>
<td>10. Proportion of households who eat at least 3 meals a day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11. Proportion of households with income above poverty threshold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12. Proportion of households with income above food threshold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Employment</td>
<td>13. Employment rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Peace and Order</td>
<td>14. Proportion of persons who are victims of crimes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The system is flexible and can accommodate community-specific indicators to reflect the other concerns of the community. For instance, indicators related to environmental concerns are included in the CBMS system in Palawan. On the other hand, Camarines Norte has included indicators related to natural calamities in its indicator system.

**Activities in implementing a CBMS**

Once a local government unit decides to adopt the CBMS, the following activities need to be done:

*Preparatory activities*

*Evaluation of data requirements and existing monitoring systems*

This entails a review of available sources of needed information in the locality vis-à-vis recent requirements for planning and monitoring. In particular, sources of information may be reviewed on the basis of frequency of data collection, level of disaggregation of data provided, and access to the said information. Common sources of information are administrative reports, socioeconomic profiles, national statistical yearbooks, on-line databases, and other reports on special surveys conducted by the national government as well as local and international non-government organizations.

Who will be involved in this evaluation? The initial evaluation activity shall include the planning and development office, different sectoral heads of the local government and community leaders.

Once the gaps between data requirements and available sources of information have been identified and assessed, the next step would be to assess how to incorporate these gaps to the core CBMS data collection and processing instruments.

*Setting the work plan*

A memorandum of agreement (MOA) is deemed necessary to be prepared prior to the start of the CBMS implementation. Said agreement spells out the rationale for the adoption and implementation of the activity and sets the expected outputs of the activity and the extent of work to be
done. Furthermore, said agreement specifies the timetable and resource requirements for the conduct of the activity and designates the key players and their corresponding responsibilities. More importantly, the MOA serves as a legal document that signifies the commitment of all concerned groups to carry out the activity.

The work plan is jointly drafted by the designated CBMS Technical Working Group Leader from the local government unit and by a designated staff from the partner organization that will provide the technical assistance. The draft MOA is circulated to the key persons from the collaborating agencies to ensure that corresponding administrative and technical details are included in the agreement.

Mobilizing resources for CBMS
The implementation of CBMS requires the following resources:

Human resources
The design of the CBMS entails the participation of key government personnel at the provincial, city/municipal, and barangay levels to perform critical roles in the implementation of CBMS. Depending on the level of capacities and institutional arrangements at each geopolitical level, key personnel may be designated as monitors, field supervisors, survey enumerators and data processors. In some cases, students, teachers, on the job-trainees, religious group representatives, barangay officials and other community volunteers are tapped to take part in the implementation of the system. Detailed minimum qualifications and training required of the manpower needed for data collection and processing are discussed further in the succeeding sections.

The quantity of manpower needed for the implementation of the system varies depending on the extent and coverage of the implementation of the system as well as on the desired pace of completion of work.

It is required, however, for the participants in all the CBMS trainings and activities, specifically in the survey, processing and report writing, to be literate. Officials from the village select the enumerators and other training participants in these activities with the minimum
requirement that they have the basic literacy skills. Otherwise, it would be hard for them to participate and conduct or even complete the survey and other activities. If the enumerators and processors are not properly equipped or trained, the quality of the data would suffer, thus making it impossible to get an accurate picture of the welfare situation in the community.

**Financial and physical resources**

To implement the CBMS, the local government unit needs to allot a budget that would at least cover the following expenses for the conduct of corresponding core CBMS activities:

a. Training workshops
   This would at least include payment for meals of participants in the training workshop and reproduction of training materials. Other related cost items are pen and paper for trainees, rental of equipment and training venue.

b. Data collection
   This would include fees for reproduction of the household questionnaire (CBMS Form 1) and barangay profile questionnaire (CBMS Form 2) and their corresponding manuals (CBMS Manual 1 and 2 respectively).
   In some cases, local government units provide for monetary incentives for survey enumerators.

c. Data processing/consolidation
   This would include cost for reproduction of tally sheets and manuals (if the LGU would adopt the manual data processing) and/or computer hardware for the encoding of data (if the LGU would adopt the computerized data processing).
   The computerized data processing software is provided for free by the CBMS Network Coordinating Team.
d. Validation of data
This would include cost of printing of materials, i.e., digitized maps for presentation, transportation cost of monitors in participating in validation workshops, and communication cost for coordinating the validation activity.

e. Database management
This would include cost for a computer hardware that would be used to store and update the CBMS Database.

f. Dissemination
This would include cost relating to the publication of CBMS-related reports, construction of data boards, and organization of fora to present results and recommendations to stakeholders.

The cost of a CBMS implementation may be shared by the province, city/municipality, and the barangay. In some instances, other target users of data such as non-government organizations with existing projects in the locality may also be tapped to share in the cost of implementing a specific CBMS component, i.e., data processing.

Some cost-saving measures:
- Utilize existing equipments of the local government unit;
- Tap the services of on-the-job-trainees, student; practicumers, and volunteer workers; and
- Tap existing government personnel.

Training workshop activities
A three-day training workshop on data collection is normally conducted. For data processing, LGUs have the option to go for combined manual and computerized processing or for computerized processing only. For those who will go for the former, two sets of workshops need to be conducted: a two-day workshop on manual processing, and a three-day workshop on computerized data processing. For LGUs that prefer computerized processing only, a four-day workshop needs to be conducted.

Training on data collection covers a general orientation on the background and rationale of the CBMS and lecture and hands-on exercise
on how to conduct the survey and field operations and how to administer the survey forms.

Training on manual data processing covers a lecture and hands-on exercise on how to tally data using tally sheets and generate proportions on CBMS and other related indicators using data boards. Meanwhile, training on computerized processing covers the encoding of the data from the accomplished survey forms, the consolidation of the encoded information, and the preparation of the digitized maps showing the survey results.

**Implementation activities**

**Data collection**
The collection of data under CBMS is undertaken through a survey covering all households in all barangays across localities in a particular city, municipality (town) or a province. Trained enumerators from the barangay are tapped to administer the survey. In some instances where local governments lack the necessary funds to operationalize the system, it is suggested that sentinel areas be identified and surveyed rather than undertake a sampling procedure.

**Survey instruments**
The survey or data collection is carried out using the household profile questionnaire (HPQ) or likewise referred to as CBMS Form 1. The questionnaire focuses on obtaining information on the CBMS core indicators from households. Demographic and other social characteristics can also be obtained from the questionnaire. To ensure comparability and consistency with the statistics produced by national government agencies, the concepts and definitions of the indicators are similar to what these agencies have.

CBMS Form 1 has two accompanying manuals: an enumerator’s manual and a field editing manual. The former serves as a guide for the enumerators on how to conduct the survey. The latter, meanwhile, is a guide also for the enumerators on how to edit the accomplished household profile questionnaire.
Another questionnaire that needs to be accomplished is the barangay profile questionnaire (BPQ) or CBMS Form 2. It is a six-page questionnaire that gathers data on the physical and demographic characteristics and available basic services and service institutions in the barangay. The barangay chairman or secretary is the intended respondent for this questionnaire. This form also has a corresponding manual (manual on accomplishing BPQ) that, along with the manuals for the HPQ, is given during the CBMS training for enumerators as references.

Additional modules for the household and barangay profile questionnaires can be added to get information on other indicators deemed relevant to the community. These indicators are identified by the community during the evaluation of their existing monitoring systems and information gaps.

Enumerators
The proposed enumerators for the survey are the barangay (village) health workers and nutrition scholars. Every village in the Philippines has these two officers. They perform a vital role in the care and monitoring of the nutritional welfare of children ages 0-5 years old. Other community volunteers can be tapped as enumerators depending on the need and size of the population of the community. The survey operation is under the supervision of the village head or barangay captain and other officers of the village.

A requirement for the choice of enumerators is that they should be able to write, read and do simple computations. Enumerators are tasked to completely interview all households in the assigned area or barangay.

The number of enumerators needed in a barangay can be determined by calculating the number of persons needed to finish the survey operation in one month (22-man-days) given that an enumerator can accomplish 10 household questionnaires per day. This is the standard procedure. The computation, however, may vary depending on other factors: manpower and financial capacity of the LGU, the household population and land area that will be covered during the survey operation.
From the pool of enumerators, a purok and/or barangay team leader is assigned. These team leaders act as coordinators of the survey operation at the purok/barangay level. Aside from conducting interviews, the purok and barangay team leaders act as supervisors as well.

There are assigned field supervisors from the municipal/city planning and development office (M/CPDO) and/or provincial planning and development office (PPDO). These officers supervise and ensure that the enumerators are doing the data collection activity. The duties and functions of the enumerators and field supervisors are explained in detail in the CBMS enumerator’s manual.

**Training**

Enumerators undergo a three-day CBMS orientation and training program for the CBMS survey operation. The training is intensive and technical in nature. Discussed during this training are the concepts of CBMS as well as the role of enumerators specifically on how to conduct an interview and organize themselves in the survey operation.

Participants are likewise introduced to the field enumeration forms (HPQ and BPQ) and a step-by-step procedure on how to accomplish these forms. Here, the participants are also introduced to concepts and definitions in order for them to understand and collect the needed information in the HPQ and BPQ. In administering the HPQ, for instance, the participants are taught how to collect information on income from various sources such as salary and wages, entrepreneurial activities and other sources of income, and to compute for total income of the households from all identified income sources.

The training module also engages participants in classroom and field exercises to test and hone their skills in asking the questions in the questionnaire and recording the respondent’s answers in the questionnaires. They are also trained to check their own work by doing field editing procedures so that errors and non-responses can be minimized during enumeration. During the training, participants are given manuals for both HPQ and BPQ as references.

Another important component of the training is how to construct
barangay spot maps, if a barangay does not have one yet, or to edit and update their existing barangay spot maps. The spot maps will be used to locate and plot households in the barangay. It will likewise serve as guide in planning the survey operation.

*Survey proper*

The survey operation usually starts a week after the training has been conducted. The duration of survey operations depends on the number of households in the village as well as the area which the enumerators have to cover for the survey operation. Usually, however, it takes one month, more or less, to finish the survey operation in one village given that an enumerator can accomplish ten questionnaires in one day.

*Data processing*

One of the most critical steps in CBMS implementation is data processing since results that will come from this procedure will be the basis for planning and program implementation. There are three ways of processing CBMS data: namely, (a) manual data processing, (b) computerized data processing, and (c) a mixture of both. The approach to be adopted depends on the level and extent of capacity of the local government unit.

*Manual processing*

For villages or municipalities which do not have computer capabilities or which need immediate results from the CBMS survey, data processing is done manually with the use of processing and consolidation forms. A two-day training program on the manual data processing at the barangay level is conducted to a fewer number of community volunteers although as much as possible, the same enumerators from the survey are the ones employed to do this activity. They are trained in processing the results from the survey questionnaire where, among others, they are taught how to compute proportions and rates of the CBMS core and other additional indicators. They are also trained to understand and interpret these indicators.
There are two forms that will be used in manual processing: tally sheets and data boards. The former is used to record data for households meeting the given indicators while the latter is used to record the results of computations of CBMS core and other additional indicators. The forms are translated into the Tagalog dialect for easier understanding by the data processors. Formulas and definitions of the indicators are also included for easier reference.

In terms of personnel, it is important that manual data processors should come from the pool of CBMS enumerators. This is because they are more familiar with the concepts, definitions and the accomplished household profile questionnaires, thereby making the processing easier and more accurate.

Training on manual processing, which is a two-day activity, is conducted usually after all the households in the given area, such as a municipality have been surveyed. Explanations on the importance of the data that will be processed and discussions on the concepts and definitions of the indicators are some of the topics explained during the training. Practice exercises using accomplished household profile questionnaires are also being done.

Data are considered ready to be processed manually once the data processors have been identified, the forms have been prepared and the trainings have been conducted. The first stage in manual processing is tabulation at the purok level using purok tally sheets and purok data boards. The source of information will come from the household profile questionnaire (CBMS Form 1). Selected data from all surveyed households are inputted in the purok tally sheets. It is advisable to finish the tallying of data for one purok before proceeding to the next purok.

After finishing the recording of data and checking the accuracy of all entries in purok tally sheets (CBMS Form 3), statistics can now be generated using the purok data board (CBMS Form 4). One purok data board corresponds to information from one purok.

The tabulation at the barangay level is the next stage after entries in the purok tally sheets and purok data boards have been accomplished and verified. All tally sheets from each purok will be consolidated using
the barangay tally sheet (CBMS Form 5).

After the barangay tally sheets have been accomplished and verified, barangay statistics can now be generated using the barangay data board (CBMS Form 6). After verifying the accuracy of these statistics, they can now be submitted to barangay level officials who will utilize the information for planning and program interventions.

The results will also be submitted to the municipal/city levels for encoding. Municipal/city level aggregates are then submitted to the provincial level for consolidation.

Manual processing is useful especially to barangays without the capacity to do computerized processing. It is likewise advantageous because it usually takes lesser time to finish than computerized processing. In addition, it does not require any equipment such as computers which most of the barangays do not have.

**Computerized processing**

a. CBMS Computerized Data Processing System (CDPS)

The Community-Based Monitoring System-Computerized Data Processing System (CBMS-CDPS) is used to process household-level information gathered through the CBMS survey. The processing can be done even during the data collection stage and simultaneously with manual processing depending on the capacity of local government units. The length of completion of the processing stage varies, depending on many factors such as the necessary resources, personnel/human competence, time constraints, and other pertinent factors.

Data processors from local partners should at least be computer literate and proficient in MS Excel and MS Word. They must have been involved in the implementation of the CBMS in the locality. Aside from available computers that will be used to encode household level data, it is also preferable to have a computer that will house solely all CBMS data be made available.

In terms of training, a four-day, two-part training is normally conducted. The first part is devoted to the encoding of CBMS data and digitizing of spot maps. Customized and free softwares, namely, Census
Professional (CSPro) and CBMS-Natural Resource Database (NRDB), are used to encode the data and to digitize spot maps, respectively. The second part of the training discusses how to process the encoded data and create indicator maps. A customized free software (CBMS Indicator Simulator) has been developed to come up with statistics for CBMS core and other related indicators. Meanwhile, CBMS-NRDB is used for storing and creating data maps, which are used in the presentation of data.

During the training, participants will be involved in the actual computerized data encoding and processing, digitizing of spot maps, and mapping of CBMS indicators. They are required to bring accomplished household profile questionnaires of one purok of one barangay, with corresponding accomplished barangay profile questionnaire, paper spot map of a barangay and a complete list of household heads of all the households in the spot map.

At the end of the training, the participants are expected to be competent in encoding household-level CBMS data and in processing these data to make them importable to the CBMS-NRDB. They should also be able to create a data structure for a barangay-level and digitized barangay spot map with infrastructure facilities, purok boundaries and household locations in the CBMS-NRDB. Lastly, they should be able to produce indicator maps for the CBMS core and other related indicators.

The evolution
The CBMS computerized data processing has evolved through the years and has drawn from many lessons gathered through the sharing of experiences. Improvements have been made where additional features were incorporated and disadvantages were minimized.

The earlier stages of computerized processing were implemented through the aid of Microsoft Excel, one of the most ideal softwares in encoding and generating tables, frequencies and percentages. The CBMS Coordinating Team has been sharing encoding sheets in formats that could easily be used by encoders. Likewise, processing forms with saved formulas also in Excel were distributed to automatically output the tables
and frequencies. Indicators at the different geopolitical levels are automatically brought to output so that they could readily be imported to the CBMS database. Household level indicators are also automatically displayed for importing.

The processing forms were also designed in such a way that some of the common errors could be checked and validated. In addition, the design is also made suitable for the integration of the results of manual processing.

**Problems encountered**

Based on the experiences of CBMS local partners, however, some problems have been encountered with the use of Excel-based processing. The most common ones are:

1. The Excel encoding sheets are perceived to be intimidating and less friendly.
   a. Users sometimes complain about the technical format of the Excel encoding sheets.
   b. Encoders must be very conscious about the syntaxes of questions in the questionnaires.
   c. The encoding sheet lacks directed encoding mechanism—that is, where the encoder is to encode.
   d. Perceived encoding motivation probably drops.

2. Encoder-generated figures are prone to human error.
   a. Since there are figures that need encoders’ help, motivation for data processors declines.
   b. Accuracy, in a way, has been sacrificed.

3. Excel sometimes failed to meet the demands of a household census encoding in terms of formats, generation of household information, among others.

4. The sheet has insufficient validation measures and fails to return correction messages for the accidental errors incurred.

5. Encoding seems to be slow.
   a. Several difficulties enlarge the time allotment for encoding completion.
b. File saving sometimes adds delay.

6. Several worksheets of encoded data occupy large memory space, thereby adding to the perceived inefficiency of the system and entailing higher computer specification and difficulty in file transport.

7. Users are usually not used to maneuvering across files.

More problems were likewise encountered in data processing. Some of them are:

1. Users find it hard to open the 50MB Excel processing file.
2. Outputs of most users are not in a standard format.
3. Filenames are not generated according to standards set which sometimes results to duplication.
4. Interlinkages between files and the processing form itself consume large disk space, thus requiring higher-end computers.
5. Most users are not technically oriented. Errors sometimes remained unchecked.
6. The disadvantages reduce users’ psychological motivation to process the encoded data.

**Alternative software**

Due to these problems, a new encoding system, which is more efficient and user friendly, was developed. The Census and Survey Processing (CSPro) System, a freeware from the United States (US) Bureau of Census, was recently adopted as an encoding system. The program, which is widely used by statistical offices, is specially designed for processing of household censuses and surveys. The original Excel processing forms, which usually occupied up to 50 megabytes, were reduced and reformatted for a more efficient processing. Interfaces were also improved so that the users would find it easy to output and export the indicators.

The application presents a more attractive interface in a form of questionnaire so that users will view it just like a booklet. Syntaxes of questions are held by the internal program specially designed for the
questionnaire, therefore, directed encoding is now enabled and users encode just where they have to. Encoder-generated figures are generated by the system and validation measures are imposed which induce encoding speed and accuracy. Furthermore, outputs are in text file which solves the constraints in memory space thereby allowing the use of low-end computers in encoding and the easy transport of files. Finally, there are only pre-specified files to be executed to commence encoding; therefore, users will be able to find their encoded files faster.

The counter-solution to the processing problems is the CBMS Indicator Simulator. Here, interfaces are developed to enhance user-friendliness in processing such that click boxes are provided to generate indicators and tables. Formulas are saved as programs, which reduce the memory space occupied by the file, thus reducing the hardware specification of computers. In addition, since the encoded files are stored in a standard manner, processing would become easier for the users because they would not need to open the files they encode. They only need to specify the file they encoded and it will automatically be located and imported to the Simulator. All these enhancements helped induce users motivation, processing speed and accuracy.

b. CBMS-NRDB
The conventional tools of presentation and dissemination of data have always been in the form of tables, charts and graphs. However, with the advent of the GIS (Geographic Information System) technology, data in maps have now become the popular medium for presentation.

Maps can be used to view the status of a community, e.g., municipality across villages changing their images according to severity of characteristics. Condition of a particular household vis-à-vis other households in the community can likewise be viewed. The location of these households can be displayed with different colors according to their attributes. The use of maps in presenting welfare conditions of the community has greatly facilitated the understanding of the poverty situation by the local policymakers and the communities.

However, available commercial software programs for GIS are
CBMS: A Tool to Fight Poverty

quite expensive and are not usually affordable to the local government units due to their limited financial resources.

Fortunately, in 1998, Mr. Richard Alexander² developed the Natural Resource Database (NRDB), a freeware capable of storing spatial (lines and polygons) and non-spatial (texts and numbers) data. It can also generate maps, reports and graphs ideal for presentation and analysis of poverty attributes in the community.

NRDB was originally developed for the provincial government of Bohol in the Philippines. In 2000, it was adopted by the provincial government of Palawan, Philippines as part of their community-based monitoring system (CBMS). In 2003, NRDB became a critical component of the CBMS, thus changing its name to CBMS-NRDB.

The CBMS-NRDB is a simple yet very helpful software. The installer and main program uses a minimal 11MB memory and disk space executed in the Windows platform. However, the size of the database file increases as the data inputs increase. This freeware is readily downloadable from the net (http://www.nrdb.co.uk).

Aside from Windows Operating System, CBMS-NRDB basically needs Microsoft Office, particularly MS Excel and MS Access, principally for data management. Excel and Access play a vital role in the organization of the database.

Aside from basic data such as numbers and text, the CBMS-NRDB is able to hold spatial data to form maps. These data can be acquired by manually digitizing spot maps prepared by the enumerators. Other important spatial data such as location of wells, elementary and secondary schools, health centers, halls, road networks, rivers, and other structures vital for planning can also be added.

CBMS-NRDB enables users to create themes in the maps. These themes adopt a color scheme creating a more meaningful set of data

² A British volunteer who spent three years working for the Bohol Environment Management Office through the assistance of the Voluntary Service Overseas (vso.org.uk). The project was supported by the British Embassy and the European Union.
analysis. For example, green and red colors could be assigned to households to indicate access and no access to safe water supply, respectively, in the barangay. Meanwhile, the condition of the sub-villages can be colored in different shades of blue – the darker the shade, the better is the performance of the sub-village for a specific indicator. At an instant, it enables the viewer to see the location of depressed households or puroks in terms of the specified indicator. Map 1 is a sample thematic map.

Aside from maps, CBMS-NRDB can yield reports and graphs. Basic time-series tables can also be generated. Figures such as histograms, time-series graphs and pie charts can likewise be constructed to make analysis of trends.

Map 1. Elementary school participation rate, Brgy. Oring-Oring, Brooke’s Point, Palawan, 2002

Source of data: CBMS Survey 2002
**Software limitations**

CBMS-NRDB is not a full GIS software. It is a database software with mapping tools. In view of this, analyses are limited to thematic mapping and visual analysis.

Defining the structure is a crucial step in the creation of the database. This needs to be done only once but it is very important to get the structure right to avoid redoing the whole database. To prevent redoing things, the user could configure ahead before actual construction of the database.

Although the CBMS-NRDB is able to produce maps, charts and reports, the manipulation of features of these tools are limited.

**Common problems encountered**

Training on the CBMS-NRDB was earlier designed as part of the intensive three-day training on computerized processing. However, said time proved to be insufficient for the actual preparation of CBMS-NRDB files. Thus, the program was re-designed into a four-day training workshop in order to devote more time to hands-on exercises on digitizing maps and importing and managing data in the database.

Meanwhile, while it is suggested to local CBMS partners to send trainees who are computer-literate and involved in the CBMS implementation, some LGUs find it difficult to send qualified participants because they lack the staff who suit the requirements. Due to the fast turn-over of JO (Job-Order) employees, LGUs prefer sending regular employees. However, these employees cannot commit to devote their full attention to actual processing and preparation of the CBMS-NRDB because they are loaded with a lot of other work in the office. Experiences of the CBMS partners also confirm that this endeavor needs full-time attention of the person(s) preparing the database. Thus, it is suggested that LGUs should evaluate their capacities and estimate the number of man-hours and computer units needed to ensure completion of the database. These estimates should be included in the budget proposal before the actual implementation.
Computerized versus manual processing: An evaluation

These two procedures have been previously compared and contrasted in terms of advantages and disadvantages in the cycle. This section discusses the features of computerized processing and compares them with manual processing.

Computerized operations really present a more attractive set of processing solutions through comprehensive, replicable, efficient, and controllable flow of steps and outputs given a well-tested computer-based system accompanied by a competent operator. Thus, these characteristics more or less make the CBMS Computerized Data Processing System more attractive and preferable than Manual Data Processing. However, some factors such as human and material resources make the feasibility of the system slim for some LGUs.

In the computerized processing, all the answers and entries in the household profile questionnaires are encoded. This implies that most of the information could be processed, tabulated and analyzed down to the household levels. Furthermore, as a cycle, the information could be reprocessed, retabulated and re-analyzed whenever updates or revisions in some external information attributed to the information in the questionnaire such as poverty thresholds, definitions, among others are called for. Computerized processing implies a more efficient and controllable flow of steps. Once the questionnaires are completely and validly encoded, the processing can be done much faster.

In contrast, in the manual mode, only the core indicators and some comprehensive and supplementary indicators can be drawn. Household indicators are not included in the output. In addition, once the indicators in the manual processing are submitted, they cannot be revised unless the questionnaires are to be encoded again.

Nonetheless, given the above, computerized processing still faces a big constraint due to its lack of feasibility. Everyone knows that computers are not easily required and competent operators cannot simply be picked out. Only few municipalities have automated their databases, and resorting to computerized processing will introduce another big problem--time. More time is needed in computerized processing given
limited resources of LGUs unlike in manual processing where functionally literate persons could easily be trained as processors. Thus, in general, manual processing leads to faster results than computerized processing.

Local officials usually face dilemmas and compromise between the two modes given their available resources and preferences. One dilemma is when they conduct manual processing and realize that they need other analyses in relation to their findings. Manual processing gives them limited options. Re-encoding the household profile questionnaires is not feasible. On the other hand, choosing the computerized processing mode will entail more resources and time allotment on their part.

**Validation of survey results**
This activity entails field and desk validation of survey results. Field validation involves the presentation of the processed data from the survey to the community in organized fora to elicit reaction on the data accuracy and to gather feedback on the possible explanations for specific outcomes of the survey.

In field validation exercises, the survey results are presented to and validated by the community through a one-day meeting. The key participants for this activity at the barangay level are the barangay (village) captain and development council members, barangay health workers and nutrition scholars, the enumerators themselves, other officers in the barangay such as teachers, sector representatives, indigenous leaders, and people from the community.

The validation of survey results is a vital component of the implementation of the CBMS. For one, it is an important mechanism to ensure that the local leaders and the rest of the community are informed of the results of the survey. Furthermore, it provides an avenue for verifying the accuracy of the findings of the survey by facilitating discussion on the possible reasons for the said findings. This activity is also intended to be undertaken at all geopolitical levels to be participated in by the CBMS focal persons at each level as well as community/sectoral leaders and volunteers.
The validation exercise likewise serves as venue in identifying the major problem areas of the community and identifying the possible interventions needed to resolve these problems. This then facilitates the integration of CBMS results in the preparation of the community’s annual development plan and in the drafting of the socioeconomic profile. After the validation exercise, a subsequent writeshop training program is conducted to train village officers in report and village profile writing.

**Database management**

What does database management entail?

In particular, it involves the updating of encoded data and the incorporation of corrections after the validation. Monitors at the provincial, city/municipal levels usually manage the database.

**Dissemination of findings and recommendations**

The dissemination of the findings based on the data gathered to obtain corresponding action for possible interventions is a critical component of the CBMS.

What kinds of information derived from CBMS are disseminated to the target groups?

- Problem areas
- Possible reasons for the identified problems
- Possible interventions

To whom are these sets of information disseminated?

- Community leaders/officials
- City/Municipal Development Council
- Potential donors for prospective projects
- Other interest groups

How are these sets of information disseminated?

- Publications
- Digitized maps
- On-line database
Uses of CBMS data

CBMS has a number of potential concrete uses particularly in the areas of local governance and poverty monitoring. Specifically, data gathered from CBMS can:

- Build the capacities of LGUs and communities
  
  CBMS can be used to further nourish, if not build, the capacities of local government units as well as members of communities in addressing the needs of their respective localities by maximizing the use of their existing resources. The system provides an organized process that can be used to empower communities for a more data-based and participatory approach to development planning and welfare monitoring. Through the implementation of a CBMS, capacities of LGUs and communities are enhanced through trainings on data collection, processing and validation as well as on analyzing and using the set of information that they have on hand. The administration of the process develops capacities of local and community leaders for mobilizing human and financial resources. CBMS also steers up the spirit of volunteerism among local communities and paves the way for a greater sense of accountability among them in diagnosing, addressing and monitoring their respective community’s development concerns.

- Facilitate resource allocation
  
  One the most common dilemmas among local chief executives is how to efficiently and effectively use and manage the meager financial resources of the local government unit given the many competing projects and programs that need to be delivered in their localities. CBMS tries to address this issue by providing the necessary information that would reveal to decisionmakers an up-to-date development situation of communities in terms of core areas of welfare.

  A case in point is that of the Provincial Government of Palawan. CBMS data have been used as a basis for providing a general report to provincial planners as well as to different sectoral leaders on the status
of human development in the entire province.

In other CBMS sites, local chief executives are likewise faced with simultaneous requests for funding for development projects like water project, construction of health centers and road construction, among others, from the different barangay/community leaders. In this case, the barangay/household level information that CBMS provides can help decisionmakers assess and decide on which areas should be prioritized. Information presented in Map 2 and how they helped the local chief executive in making the necessary prioritization illustrates this.

**Enrich existing databases**

CBMS can complement existing databases by providing a regular source of information on socioeconomic attributes of communities to further enrich the contents and usefulness of existing databases. A number of local government units were able to get funding support from international organizations in the past for setting up databanks containing information on children, environment and the like. CBMS can help enrich these databases by providing a complete set of household, barangay,

---

**Map 2. Proportion of households with access to safe water in two barangays in Labo, Camarines Norte, 2003**

*Source of data: CBMS Survey 2003*
CBMS: A Tool to Fight Poverty

municipal/city and provincial level information. **Serve as inputs for preparation of development profiles**

CBMS data also provide vital baseline information for the preparation of barangay, municipal/city, and provincial socioeconomic profiles, annual investment plans, land use plans, infrastructure project proposals, and other related development reports.

**Aid the design, targeting and impact monitoring of social services and development programs**

CBMS provides disaggregated information that reveal the community’s needs based on the CBMS household survey and corresponding explanations for such deficiencies as gathered during the validation forum and supplemented by information gathered from the barangay profile questionnaire. In this light, CBMS can serve as a useful tool for the design of appropriate interventions to address particular development needs as shown in Map 3.

CBMS can also facilitate targeting by providing information on who are the eligible beneficiaries for specific programs. Sector-specific indicators can be used to identify who should receive the interventions.

**Map 3. Proportion of households with access to sanitary toilet facilities, before and after intervention, Barangay Sta. Cruz, Labo, Camarines Norte, 2003**

*Before intervention*  
*After intervention*
For instance, households with malnourished children should be the beneficiaries of supplemental feeding programs. On the other hand, composite indicators (combining the different indicators using statistical techniques) can be used to rank the poorest households in the barangay or municipality. This will be particularly useful in identifying eligible beneficiaries for programs such as the Philhealth program for the indigents and the scholarship program for the poorest families.

Finally, CBMS can serve as a supplemental tool or even a main source of vital information for monitoring the impacts of development programs that have been implemented in the communities by various organizations.

Summary and recommendations
The development of CBMS generally stemmed from the need to address the lack of disaggregated information for:

- Diagnosing the extent of poverty at the local level,
- Determining the causes of poverty,
- Formulating appropriate policies and programs,
- Identifying eligible beneficiaries, and
- Assessing the impact of policies and programs.

Furthermore, CBMS strives to address the need for support mechanisms in line with the implementation of the decentralization policy.

In particular, said concerns are done through CBMS by providing an organized process for needs assessment, design, targeting and impact monitoring of interventions. Data collection and processing instruments with complete training modules have been developed by the CBMS Network Coordinating Team for this purpose. They are available for adoption by interested and committed local government units.

The adoption of CBMS requires the mobilization of human and financial resources for the conduct of specific activities as discussed in earlier sections of this paper. More importantly, the successful implementation of the process as well as the achievement of its desired
outcomes for certain localities requires an openness for continuous learning and improvement, and a firm commitment both from local leaders and members of the community to carry out their key roles and responsibilities.

In this regard, the documentation of best practices and lessons learned by the local government units in the implementation and use of CBMS should be considered as an equally important part of the process for reference in the further improvement of the system. In addition, said documentation can also be viewed as a social contribution for the benefit of other local government or non-government units as well as potential donors who may have existing and foregoing support programs for similar initiatives.
References


CBMS Experiences of Local Partners from Palawan
The use of CBMS for local governance: from a provincial perspective

Joel T. Reyes*

Introduction
Palawan is the first province in the Philippines to implement the community-based monitoring system (CBMS) province-wide. As such, it is only fitting and an honor to share the experience of Palawan in its use and implementation of the CBMS; the benefits derived from it; the help that the CBMS has provided the provincial government in its appraisal of the province’s human development index; the main strategies adopted; and the lessons gained after five years of CBMS implementation in the province.

The beginning
During my term as a vice-governor in partnership with then Governor Salvador Socrates, I posed a challenge to the Provincial Planning and Development Office (PPDO) to come up with a system for monitoring the impact of government interventions in Palawan’s barangays and municipalities and to provide decisionmakers with a tool to make a scientific and systematic appraisal of the province’s development. In other words, we need a tool that will show us where we are now as far as Palawan’s development is concerned.

In March 1999, the late Governor Socrates entered into an agreement with the Policy and Development Foundation Inc. through the MIMAP-Philippines (now the CBMS Network) for the

* Governor, Province of Palawan.
implementation of the CBMS in Palawan. In September 1999, the CBMS-Palawan Technical Working Group was created and composed of staff from the MIMAP-Philippines led by its Project Director, Dr. Celia M. Reyes; the PPDO led by Mr. Nelson Devenadera, and Mr. Dirk Heinrichs, who was then connected with the provincial government through the integrated expert program of the Center of International Migration and Development (CIM).

Two months later, the CBMS was piloted in 2 barangays in the Municipality of Taytay in the North in order to test and validate our survey methodology and instruments. The province-wide implementation of the project was formally launched the following year through Executive Order No. 15. Full implementation of the project in January 2000 was marked with a CBMS forum attended by local chief executives and Municipal Planning and Development Coordinators (MPDOs).

**What is CBMS?**

Community-based monitoring system or CBMS is a tool for collecting and processing location-specific information about human development, in shared responsibility with various local government units in Palawan on a regular basis. CBMS is not only a mechanism for social monitoring but also a tool for gauging the effectiveness of programs and projects.

**Implementing the CBMS: a review of the process**

The implementation of CBMS involves organizations and participants in the local development arena such as barangays/communities, municipalities, and provinces.

In the first quarter of 2000, four teams from the PPDO research department were briefed and trained through 24 orientation seminars on the concept and use of the CBMS by the MIMAP-Philippines Team. In addition, trainings were also conducted in 354 barangays in 21 municipalities.

Between March and September of the same year, surveys were conducted under the lead coordination of the municipalities. PPDO provided assistance to the municipalities and barangays through field
visits until the completion of the surveys and processing of the results at the purok, barangay and municipal levels.

The results were then consolidated and validated at the PPDO and in the communities. They were then presented during the provincial development council meeting in September 2000.

Results of the CBMS

CBMS findings show that human development in Palawan is significantly improving. The provincial human development index (HDI) stood at about 0.491 in 1994, 0.590 in 1997, 0.698 in 2000 and 0.721 in 2002. These figures show an upward trend in the provincial HDI.

The survey results also show that the development levels vary significantly across municipalities. CBMS points out where development is highest, lowest and which areas are occupying the median level. Cuyo, an island municipality located in the north section of Palawan, registered the highest human development index at 0.786. Its high HDI could be attributed to the high literacy index and the inhabitants’ high regard/value for education.

Human development is found lowest in the municipality of Española at 0.619. Located in the south section of mainland Palawan, Española’s low HDI could be due to ethnic and cultural beliefs and customs as well as migration whereby many of the indigenous people and migrants in this municipality do not consider formal education important. Their primary consideration is economic survival and not education nor high productivity.

In terms of life expectancy, data gathered between 1994 to 2002 show an improvement in life expectancy. The estimated life expectancy for the province in 2002 was 67 years, an increase of almost 7 years from the estimated life expectancy of 60 years in 1994.

The increase in life expectancy could be attributed to the reduced proportion of infant and child (0-6 years old) deaths between 2000 to 2002. Proportion of infant deaths declined from 30.5 in 1980 to 27.6 in 2000 and to 27.3 in 2002.

The further rise in life expectancy indicates social and economic
improvements in the living conditions of the Palaweños. It suggests the success of our health programs in responding to the challenge of addressing the mortality condition of the province. One of the flagship programs of my administration is the Lakbayan, acronym for Lakbay Bayanihan. It is basically a multi-agency participatory approach in basic services delivery in the communities. When Lakbayan goes to remote barangays, it brings health services such as medical and dental, and civic works. It also provides livelihood trainings, job fairs and other government services in cooperation with national agencies based in Puerto Princesa City. Lakbayan responds to short term needs and services while long term projects are underway.

In the field of education, the combined enrolment rate in 2002 of 75 percent is a significant improvement over the 2000 ratio of 69 percent. Our high school enrolment rate grew by 3 percent from 63 percent in 2000 to 66 percent in 2002. There was, however, a slight decline in elementary enrolment in 2002 at 83.06 percent from 84.74 percent in 2000.

This means that the province has at least coped up with growth of enrolment. Education is one of my anti-poverty measures and we try to address the need for more teachers through the provincial teacher’s pool program whereby we hired qualified teachers and deployed them to areas where there is a great demand for teachers, using the CBMS as basis of identification of these areas, and provided college education to poor but deserving students under the JTR scholarship program, to mention a few.

Through the CBMS, we have also gauged the proportion of our households with income greater than the poverty threshold. CBMS findings showed income as the weakest aspect of the human development index. This was reflected in a high poverty incidence of the province in 2002, which is a little worse than it was in 2000. This is the reason why poverty alleviation remains our major concern in the province.

**Counting the benefits**

What are the benefits drawn from the CBMS? And how have they benefited Palawan?
The Use of CBMS for Local Governance: Province

First, the CBMS provides reliable, relevant and comprehensive data on welfare conditions and development status across the province from the barangays to the municipalities.

Through the CBMS, the provincial government was able to measure the HDI as it relates to the Palawan experience.

Second, it gives direction and guidance in crafting our development agenda. Guided by said agenda, we saw the need to restructure and streamline the organizational set-up of the provincial government.

Third, the CBMS has enhanced recognition and credibility of local governance and political leadership. Before the Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG) recognized the CBMS as a local initiative for development and poverty monitoring at the national level, the CBMS was already being used as a poverty monitoring tool in the province. In fact, the local leadership had been invited to various national and regional conferences in Manila, Davao and Leyte to present to local poverty reduction action officers and planners our CBMS experiences. Vice-Governor David Ponce de Leon also represented me to share our experiences in an international conference in Morocco in 2002.

Fourth, it guides LGU and project implementors in setting project targets. Because the CBMS provides inputs in identifying the right project location, the right project beneficiaries and the type of intervention schemes needed most in a specific area are likewise identified.

Fifth, the CBMS monitors development trends. It shows the degree to which people get healthier, where access to water services and sanitation facilities are still needed and where changes/improvements have taken place, thereupon suggesting the success of certain programs or interventions.

Sixth, it is a ready-to-use source or reference for the preparation of comprehensive land use plans (CLUP) and socio-economic profiles. Because of this, LGUs are able to save on other expenses such as data collection, survey, and pre-developmental activities.

Seventh, it helps government to re-adjust goals and development thrusts. After the CBMS assessment and evaluation in 2003, Palawan’s local leadership saw the need to refocus priorities in terms of putting
more interventions in sectors sorely needing them.

Lastly, it helps in mobilizing investments. Good and relevant data help streamline local investments toward the common goals of the local government units. External support organizations value the system because it gives them the proper basis for project allocation, points of interventions, participation and/or fund contribution. Examples of this are the Barangay Environment Sanitation Project (BESP) of the World Bank, the Palawan Tropical Forestry Protection Program of the European Union, Palawan Corridor of the Conservation International, and the Energy Development Program of the provincial government of Palawan.

**Major strategies used in CBMS implementation**

*Data dissemination*

The most important strategy used is active data dissemination which refers to intensive information-sharing and dialogue with potential users. The data are openly made accessible across all LGU levels, civil society/private sector and NGOs.

Active data dissemination is also achieved through the issuance of the Palawan Human Development Report, the first such report at the provincial level in the entire Philippines. This report documents the CBMS data for the year 2000 and provides an analysis and interpretation of the information.

*Networking*

Intensive networking refers to the involvement of the LGUs and partner agencies in the process of data generation, interpretation and utilization. In this regard, an expansion of the CBMS database is done to make the system relevant for other data users.

*Integration into the regular planning process*

To enhance the utilization of the CBMS data, CBMS survey results are frequently presented and discussed with stakeholders like the local development councils, sectoral agencies and local legislative bodies.
The Use of CBMS for Local Governance: Province

Mere presentation, however, is not enough. In Palawan, we are trying to maximize the benefits of CBMS by making it part of the entire planning process. For instance, to complement the present development approach where municipalities with common development priorities are clustered by zones, the CBMS data were arranged by zone and by cluster, showing the flexibility and utility of the database. The integration of the CBMS in the planning, monitoring and assessment of the performance of each cluster leads to a more efficient governance.

Lessons learned
What lessons can be drawn from the five-year experience of Palawan in the CBMS implementation? How can other LGUs maximize the use and benefits of the CBMS? Box 1 outlines the major lessons and recommendations in this regard.

Box 1. Lessons Learned from the Palawan Case

Below are lessons gained from the CBMS-Palawan experience, which may in turn help other local government units in their CBMS exercises:

- Build a broad partnership across LGUs, civil society and private sector. CBMS cannot be implemented by just one agency.
- Delineate clearly the responsibilities across LGU levels: barangays, municipalities and province, and the partner agencies from civil society for greater multisectoral participation.
- Have a strong coordinating and integrating agency (like the provincial government) to avoid disintegration of efforts and data (kanya-kanya system).
- Localize the approach to data gathering, collection and processing. This must be done in the barangays and at the municipal levels to avoid clogging up of data at the provincial planning body.
- Share resources across all levels.
- Be creative in tapping support and assistance. A firm commitment will generate assistance and cooperation at all levels.
- Be patient: CBMS data will not be available overnight; perseverance will lead to endurance.
**Future plans**

Finally, the full realization of the benefits of the CBMS depends largely on its sustainability. In Palawan, sustaining the implementation of the CBMS is one of our priorities. In this regard, we have earmarked the updating of CBMS indicators biannually. For next year, we have plans of conducting our third round of survey which will cover all households of the province.

Hopefully, all these will lead to further improvements in Palawan’s overall development.
Introduction
One of the advantages of the community-based monitoring system (CBMS) is that it enables planners to draw a profile of a particular place on the basis of the data/information that the system has gathered. In this regard, this profile of South Palawan Planning Area (SPPA) to be outlined in the succeeding sections is based on the results of the CBMS survey for the year 2001 conducted in the five municipalities that comprise the SPPA.

Physical characteristics
The South Palawan Planning Area has a total land area of 401,907.26 hectares. It is bounded on the north by the Municipalities of Aborlan and Narra, on the east by the Sulu Sea and on the west by the South China Sea. Map 1 shows the location of the five municipalities–Bataraza, Brooke’s Point, Española, Quezon and Rizal–that comprise the SPPA.

Rizal is the largest municipality with a total land area of 125,914.45 hectares, which constitute 31.33 percent of the total SPPA land area followed by Quezon with 94,921 hectares or 23.6 percent, Bataraza with 68,689.54 or 17.09 percent and Brooke’s Point with 62,217.82 or 15.48 percent. On the other hand, Española is the smallest municipality with 50,163.45 hectares comprising 12.48 percent of the total SPPA land area.

*R Manager, South Palawan Planning Area.
Results of the CBMS survey

Demography

The SPPA has a total of 32,955 households and a population of 166,348 giving an average household size of 5.04. Based on the level of population per municipality, it shows that more reside in the Municipality of Brooke’s Point with 45,352, followed by the Municipality of Bataraza with 41,458, Quezon with 30,830, and Española with 29,845. Rizal has the least number of population at 18,863 (Table 1).

Table 1. Demographic Characteristics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Municipality</th>
<th>Total Households</th>
<th>Total Population</th>
<th>Average Household Size</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bataraza</td>
<td>7,102</td>
<td>41,458</td>
<td>5.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Española</td>
<td>5,753</td>
<td>29,845</td>
<td>5.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brookes Point</td>
<td>9,600</td>
<td>45,352</td>
<td>4.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quezon</td>
<td>6,563</td>
<td>30,830</td>
<td>4.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rizal</td>
<td>3,937</td>
<td>18,863</td>
<td>4.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPPA Total</td>
<td>32,955</td>
<td>166,348</td>
<td>5.04</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CBMS Survey 2001
Health and nutrition
Prevalence of malnutrition
In terms of the distribution of malnourished children 0-6 years old, Brooke’s Point has the largest number at 7,670, followed by Rizal with 525, Quezon, 260, Española, 249 and then Bataraza which has the least number of malnourished children at 100.

Water, sanitation and electricity
Access to safe drinking water
Out of the total 9,600 households in the municipality of Brooke’s Point, 7,633 or 79.51 percent have access to safe drinking water supply. In Española, the number is 4,087 or 71.04 percent, in Quezon, 3,626 or 55.25 percent, and in Bataraza, 2,819 or 39.70 percent. Meanwhile, Rizal has the smallest number of households with access to safe drinking water at 951 or 24.16 percent (Map 2). Water systems that are considered as safe water sources are community water systems, deep wells and artesian wells.

Most households with access to safe drinking water get their water from the community water system and deep wells. On the other hand, households with no access to safe drinking water get their water from dug wells and bodies of water like river, spring and streams.

Access to sanitary toilet facilities
With regard to sanitation, 52 percent of the households located in the SPPA have access to sanitary toilet facilities. Households with access to sanitary toilet facilities refer only to those households which own or have access to water-sealed toilets.

Looking at the conditions across the five municipalities, as seen in Map 3, the municipality of Brooke’s Point is shown to have the highest proportion of households with access to sanitary toilet facility at 67.46 percent. This is followed by the municipality of Española having 65.15 percent and Quezon, 57.73 percent. On the other hand, Rizal and Bataraza have low proportion of households that have access to sanitary toilet facility at 42.01 and 28.70 percent, respectively.
Map 2. Proportion of Households with Access to Safe Drinking Water by Municipality

Source: CBMS Survey 2001

Map 3. Proportion of Households with Access to Sanitary Toilet Facilities

Source: CBMS Survey 2001
Access to electricity
Only an average of 17.44 percent of the households located in the SPPA have access to electricity. Map 4 shows that Bataraza has only 7.1 percent of its total number of households with access to electricity. This is followed by Rizal (8.2%), Quezon (11.83%) and Brooke’s Point (30%). Española has the highest proportion of households with access to electricity at 30.19 percent.

![Map 4. Proportion of Households with Access to Electricity](source: CBMS Survey 2001)

Education and literacy
Elementary school participation
On the average, 41.9 percent of children aged 6-11 years old attend elementary school within SPPA. Most of these children come from Brooke’s Point (6,723 children) followed by Quezon with 3,911, Española with 3,684, Bataraza with 2,301 and Rizal with 2,220.

Secondary school participation
There are 7,325 children aged 12-15 years old in the SPPA who are in secondary school. Just like at the national level, the secondary school
participation rate is considerably lower than the elementary school participation rate. This is partly due to the absence of secondary schools in other barangays.

Brooke’s Point municipality has the highest number of children attending secondary school with 2,625 children, followed by Bataraza with 1,687, Quezon with 1,062 and Rizal with 621.

**Literacy**

The municipality with the most number of literate persons, 10 years old and above, is Brooke’s Point with 27,751 followed by Bataraza with 18,370 persons, Española with 16,728, Quezon with 16,514 and Rizal with 9,617.

**Poverty**

Poverty incidence

Out of the 32,955 households in the municipalities that comprise the SPPA, only 5,765 or 17.49 percent are considered non-poor as seen in Table 2. This means that 82.51 percent of the total households in the SPPA do not earn much to meet their basic food and non-food needs. The poverty threshold for Palawan is P11, 843 per capita. This was estimated for the year 2001 by adjusting for inflation the official threshold level for rural areas in Palawan in 2000.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Municipality</th>
<th>Total Households</th>
<th>Magnitude of Nonpoor Households</th>
<th>Proportion of Nonpoor Households</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brookes Point</td>
<td>7,102</td>
<td>1,744</td>
<td>24.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Española</td>
<td>5,753</td>
<td>889</td>
<td>15.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quezon</td>
<td>9,600</td>
<td>1,378</td>
<td>14.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bataraza</td>
<td>6,563</td>
<td>1,309</td>
<td>19.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rizal</td>
<td>3,937</td>
<td>445</td>
<td>11.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SPPA Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>32,955</strong></td>
<td><strong>5,765</strong></td>
<td><strong>17.49</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: CBMS Survey 2001*
Among the five municipalities, Rizal has the lowest percentage of households that are non-poor at 11.3 percent. This means that 88.7 percent of the households in Rizal have income below the poverty threshold. Brooke’s Point exhibited the highest percentage of non-poor households at 24.56 percent.

**Employment**

Farming is the main source of income in the five municipalities of SPPA. Of the total 41,967 persons who are economically active, 69.8 percent are engaged in farming activities. The major agricultural crops are palay, corn and cassava. Some are also engaged in coconut farming and other fruit-bearing plants and trees like banana, mango, *santol* and *lansones*.

Among the five municipalities, Española and Brooke’s Point recorded the highest employment while Rizal registered the lowest.

**Priority needs in SPPA’s five municipalities**

One major concern of the communities in the SPPA is the very high poverty incidence recorded at 82.51 percent. Although the employment rate seems very ideal, the underemployment rate, however, tells another story. A total of 8 out of every 10 working persons expressed the desire to do more work and earn additional income. The need for more work and income could be explained by the high subsistence incidence. More than half of the households in these communities do not meet the minimum requirement for them to sustain their food and non-food basic needs.

While agriculture remains to be the main source of livelihood in these municipalities, households have not benefited much from farming due to the low access to or lack of modern agricultural equipment and technology.

It is worthwhile to note though that majority of the poor households are still able to meet their basic food needs. This significant gap between the poverty and subsistence incidence could be attributed to other livelihood activities that households engage in. For instance, households were able to supplement their income from farming with other gainful
activities such as fishing and backyard production. Furthermore, some households are also engaged in gathering forest products.

Another major concern is the lack of access to basic facilities such as safe drinking water, sanitation facilities and electricity. The municipality of Rizal has the lowest proportion of households with access to safe water at 24.16 percent. It likewise has a very low access to sanitary facilities and to electricity.

Access to safe water and sanitation is also a major concern for the other four municipalities. Specifically, more than 46.07 percent of the total households in SPPA have no access to safe drinking water and only 52 percent of the total households have access to sanitary toilets.

**Importance of CBMS Results to the SPPA LGUs**

How does the CBMS help in this situation? The following enumerates the uses of the CBMS to the various LGUs in the SPPA:

**Municipalities and barangays**

The CBMS was implemented in SPPA’s five municipalities to facilitate effective development planning and monitoring at the grassroots level.

The CBMS results are essential in the identification of priority needs and programs to be implemented in every barangay specifically in improving the constituents’ access to basic services such as education, health, sanitation and shelter.

**The SPPA as a whole**

The South Palawan Planning Area is composed of the five municipalities located around Mount Mantalingahan. These five municipalities are currently working together for the effective planning and implementation of programs and projects related to environmental protection and economic development of their constituents.

In this regard, the CBMS database is currently being used to identify priority needs and programs to be implemented in the entire SPPA. These data also serve as a basis for the needs- and evidence-based policymaking at the local level.
Introduction
The Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS) was initiated and introduced by the Provincial Government of Palawan in 1999 through Executive Order No. 15 – “Directing the Institutionalization of the CBMS under the Micro Impact of Macro Adjustment Policies (MIMAP) Project in Palawan” – and Executive Order No. 03 in 2002 – “Enjoining the Use of the CBMS Results as Basis in the Formulation of Barangay, Municipal and Provincial Development Plans and in Redefining the Local Planning Process.”

The Municipal Government of San Vicente, in compliance with the abovementioned Executive Orders, has adopted and utilized the system since 1999. Consequently, municipal-wide household surveys had been conducted, first in year 2000 using 1999 baseline data and the second in 2002, with 2001 as the base year. These surveys were spearheaded by the Municipal Planning and Development Office (MPDO), with assistance from the Center for International Migration and Development (CIM) Integrated Experts Program and the MIMAP Project Philippines and in partnership with the Provincial Planning and Development Office (PPDO).

The CBMS is a tool that aims to gauge the living conditions of each household in the municipality using more than 20 development indicators/variables from all development sectors.

* Assistant Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator, San Vicente, Palawan.
The CBMS Municipal Report contains the history, physical features and current data of the welfare status of the ten barangays of the municipality by development sector: demography, economy, security and shelter, water and sanitation, social services, infrastructure and utilities, and political participation.

The Report uses tables for easy comprehension. It presents the distribution and disparities of the ten barangays for each indicator to show the degree of satisfaction of the household populations per indicator. Likewise, comparison using past and present data is also shown to evaluate the changes of the indicators.

The CBMS serves as a planning device to increase the level of awareness and understanding of the community, private and government agencies for discussion and identification of development interventions and policies to be used in the preparation of short term, medium and long term plans.

For more than four years, the system has been a major tool in achieving the local government’s goal of improving the economic and social welfare of the people of San Vicente through the identification of the concerns and needs of the constituents. However, with the LGU’s limited resources, not all programs and projects identified to address the needs and concerns of the community are being implemented. Nonetheless, the CBMS can still be a useful data source for the provincial, national and other sponsoring agencies to realize the needed interventions/projects.

As the planning and coordinative body at the municipal level, the MPDO is responsible for the implementation of CBMS programs. It is, after all, the primary source of data bank profile in the municipality. It is where CBMS data are prepared, analyzed and processed to be used for planning purposes. Using these data, the local government is able to design and formulate plans based on the existing situations at the barangay level. These plans include the Municipal Comprehensive Land and Water Use Plan of San Vicente which was approved in 2003, using 2000 CBMS data; the Barangay Comprehensive Land Use Plans of the 9 barangays which are currently in progress using 2002 CBMS data; other studies
such as the feasibility study on the water system project for the 4 barangays which is now operational; and the municipal and barangay profiles.

**Physical characteristics**

*Land area and location*

San Vicente lies in the northwestern side of Palawan. South China Sea bounds the municipality on the west, municipality of Taytay on the north, municipality of Roxas on the east and Puerto Princesa City on the southwest.

The municipality has legal jurisdiction over 10 barangays occupying a total area of 82,057 hectares. The 10 barangays are Caruray, Port Barton, Kemdeng, Poblacion, New Agutaya, San Isidro, Alimanguan, Sto. Nino, New Canipo and Binga.

Aside from these inland areas, 22 smaller islands scattered in the South China Sea also form part of San Vicente. Among these islands, Boayan is largest, with a total land area of 1,327.31 hectares, followed by Cagnipa with 507.94 hectares, Catalat with 261.12 hectares and Albaguen and Imuruan with 175.62 hectares and 136.05 hectares, respectively.

**Topography**

Except for some isolated areas, the terrain of San Vicente is generally rugged due to the vast Pagdanan and Central Ranges that traverse the entire municipality. Elevation ranges from zero to 703 meters, with Pinagmangalocan, Poblacion and San Vicente as the lowest part, and a portion of Pagdanan Range between New Villafria and Poblacion as the highest part. Around 18 percent of the total land area is moderately sloping, undulating and rolling land (0-18 slope) while around 82 percent is steeply sloping to hilly and mountainous (18 slope and above).

**Soil properties**

There are four major soil types in the municipality: Sibuyan Silty Clay, Silty Clay Loam, Coron Clay Loam and Mountain Soil. Sibuyan Silty
Clay and Silty Clay Loam can be cultivated safely with the application of good management practice. Coron Clay Loam, which is good enough for occasional cultivation if handled with care but best suited for pasture, can be found in areas with 18 to 30 slope and in around 7 percent of the total area. Mountain soil, found in almost 85 percent of the total area, dominates the soil type in the municipality and can be used for grazing and forestry if handled with great care and proper management. It is also suited for wildlife or recreation.

**Results of the CBMS survey**

*Demography*

San Vicente, Palawan has a total population of 21,962 as of 2002 distributed over the ten barangays and a total number of 4,318 households with an average household size of 5.09. Compared to a previous survey in 2000, the town’s population and household number increased by 12.83 percent and 13.33 percent, respectively, while average household size remained at 5 persons per household. The average annual growth rate is 6.03, with the increase due to natural fertility and migration.

The three leading barangays in terms of population are Poblacion, the urban center of the municipality, Port Barton and Caruray. These are barangays in the southern portion with a large expanse of land area and with high economic opportunities. On the other hand, the least populated barangays are Kemdeng, Sto. Niño and San Isidro. Household distribution among barangays follows the same trend (Table 1).

In terms of gender distribution, there are more males than females in the municipality with a sex ratio of 108.99. This means that there are 109 males for every 100 females in the municipality. Barangay New Agutaya has an almost equal ratio of males to females with 101.33. The highest sex ratio was in Sto Niño.

*Health and nutrition*

Proportion of child’s death in the municipality is 1.31 percent. The biggest proportion of child’s death has been noted in Kemdeng, Binga and San Isidro. The distance of barangays Binga and Kemdeng to the Poblacion,
where the Rural Health Unit is located, explains the high incidence of child’s death in these two barangays. However, San Isidro is a rare case since it is only four kilometers away from the Poblacion.

Although these areas have high rate of child’s death, it is worthwhile to note that there are five barangays with no record of child’s death at all during the survey period. In general proportion, it shows a low proportion of child’s death. The substantial decrease of proportion of child’s death from 2000 is a positive effect brought about by the marked improvement of the health services in the locality. In 2001, additional health personnel were hired. Provision of health facilities including the yearly increase of appropriation for medical supplies is also a contributing factor.

**Malnutrition**

Over the two-year period (2000-2002), the proportion of malnourished children from 0-5 years old shows an abrupt increase from 3.55 percent to 13.07 percent, which is way above the provincial average of 5.31 percent and national average of 9.2 percent. In 2003, however, the municipality achieved a turnaround with one of the lowest malnutrition
prevalence rate (MPR) at 1.4 percent. In fact, in the whole province of Palawan, San Vicente had the second lowest MPR.

Water and sanitation
Access to safe water
Based on the Human Development Report of the Province of Palawan in 2000, access to safe water is defined by the presence and use of piped water, drilled, and closed well. The first indicates the presence of community waterworks and systems, and the latter refers to the deep wells with electric or manual pumps.

The percentage of households with access to safe water rose from 58.24 percent in 2000 to 68.04 percent in 2002 (Table 2). This rate, however, is still below the national average of 78.40 percent. The proportion of households with access to safe drinking water is relatively high in the barangays of Binga, New Agutaya and San Isidro while the lowest proportion is observed in Barangay Kemdeng at only 14.17 percent. The barangays with average and high proportion to safe drinking water have their own water systems. The increase is attributed to the construction of a water system in New Agutaya and San Isidro funded under the Palawan Tropical Forestry Protection Programme (PTFPP) which was completed in March 2001. During the survey, Barangay Kemdeng had no existing water system. It was only in the latter part of 2002 when the water system project was completed in said barangay. It is thus anticipated that households with access to safe water in the municipality will definitely increase in the next survey due to the operation of the water district which shall cover five barangays, namely: Alimanguan, New Canipo, Poblacion, Caruray and New Agutaya.

Access to sanitary toilet facilities
Access to sanitary toilets can be defined as the use of a water-sealed facility equipped with a flushing device or a toilet flushed manually. Both types of toilets are connected to a septic tank or other forms of concrete depository.

Based on a 2002 survey, only 57.60 percent of the municipality’s
households have access to sanitary toilets. This is below the national level of 80.4 percent\(^1\) and a decline from 64.96 percent during the 2000 survey (Table 2). The most common type used in the municipality is the closed pit type found in 28.07 percent of surveyed households, followed by water-sealed facility with 23.44 percent. A significant number of households (32.70%) have no private toilet facilities. They either use public toilets or share facilities with some households. The decrease in percentage of households with access to sanitary toilets in 2002 is mainly due to the increase in number of households. This is particularly noted in Barangays Binga and Sto. Niño and in the island sitios of Port Barton and Caruray. Kemdeng is the only barangay with a percentage higher than the national average (80.31%). It is further observed that the higher is the number of households in a particular area, the lower is the proportion of households with access to sanitary toilets and vice versa except in the cases of Binga and Sto. Niño.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barangay</th>
<th>Total Households</th>
<th>Households with Access to Safe Water</th>
<th>Households with Access to Sanitary Toilet Facilities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Magnitude</td>
<td>Proportion</td>
<td>Magnitude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alimanguan</td>
<td>584</td>
<td>438</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Binga</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>285</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caruray</td>
<td>656</td>
<td>368</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kemdeng</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Agutaya</td>
<td>440</td>
<td>410</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Canipo</td>
<td>217</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Port Barton</td>
<td>835</td>
<td>458</td>
<td>497</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poblacion</td>
<td>821</td>
<td>544</td>
<td>509</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Isidro</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sto. Niño</td>
<td>159</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source of data: CBMS Survey 2000 and 2002

---

\(^1\) 1998 Annual Poverty Indicator Survey (APIS), National Statistics Office (NSO).
Good sanitation and a clean environment promote a healthy community. The absence of toilet facilities in many households has been a perennial problem in the health sector. However, construction of public toilets is not enough to address the problem. The community’s negative attitude aggravates the situation despite the action taken by local authorities.

Security and shelter
Makeshift housing
A household is considered living in a makeshift house when its dwelling unit is constructed from salvaged or improvised materials or in a unit where the materials are dilapidated and in need of substantial repair. Table 3 shows that around 98.01 percent of the households in San Vicente do not live under makeshift housing conditions while the rest (1.99%) are makeshift dwellers. The ratio for makeshift housing is higher against the national average of 1.70 percent.

As to barangay breakdown, New Agutaya has no households living in makeshift homes while a high proportion of households living in makeshift shelters can be found in Alimanguan with 5.82 percent followed by Port Barton with 3.35 percent.

Compared to the previous survey, the rate of makeshift dwellers decreased by 12.55 percentage points from 14.54 percent in 2000. The significant decrease is a good indicator of the improvement in the living conditions of the people in these communities.

Tenure status
The tenure status determines the security of a household in terms of house and lot occupancy.

About 54.61 percent of all households occupy their own house and lot. This figure is below the national average of 68.3 percent\(^2\). Table 3 shows the owner occupancy of the ten barangays, with owner occupancy being significantly higher in San Isidro, New Agutaya and Kemdeng.

These barangays have low in-migration population base. The proportion of households occupying their own house and lot is low in Poblacion and Alimanguan.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barangay</th>
<th>Total Households</th>
<th>Households Living in Makeshift housing</th>
<th>Households Occupying Own House and Lot</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Magnitude</td>
<td>Proportion</td>
<td>Magnitude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002 Alimanguan</td>
<td>584</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>5.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002 Binga</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002 Caruray</td>
<td>656</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002 Kemdeng</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002 New Agutaya</td>
<td>440</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002 New Canipo</td>
<td>217</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002 Port Barton</td>
<td>835</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>3.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002 Poblacion</td>
<td>821</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002 San Isidro</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002 Sto. Niño</td>
<td>159</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source of data: CBMS Survey 2000 and 2002

**Education and literacy**

**Literacy**

Literacy rate is determined by dividing the total number of literate persons 10 years and above over the total population of 10 years old and above.

In 2000, San Vicente’s literacy rate was 99.91 percent. This went down to 95.84 percent during the 2002 CBMS survey. However, despite the fact that it has declined by 4.07 percent, it is still higher compared to the national average of 93.20 percent.

Literacy rate is high in the barangays of San Isidro (100%), New Agutaya (98.56%), Binga (97.61%) and New Canipo (97.60%) while the lowest literacy rate can be observed in Kemdeng (87.41%).

---

3 1994 Functional Literacy and Mass Media Survey.
Elementary school participation
Participation rate in elementary education of children aged 6-12 years old was 88.41 percent in 2000 and then slightly decreased to 85.76 percent in 2002. Compared to the provincial average of 83.05 percent\(^4\), the municipal average is still higher by 2.71 percent.

Participation rate in barangay Sto. Niño as seen in Table 4 is very low at only 70.71 percent while the participation rates are highest in Kemdeng (98.32%), San Isidro (90.63%) and New Agutaya (89.69%).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barangay</th>
<th>Total number of children 6-12 years old</th>
<th>Children attending elementary school</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Magnitude</td>
<td>Proportion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>4783</td>
<td>4102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>4177</td>
<td>3693</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alimanguan</td>
<td>711</td>
<td>625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Binga</td>
<td>337</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caruray</td>
<td>702</td>
<td>619</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kemdeng</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Agutaya</td>
<td>456</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Canipo</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Port Barton</td>
<td>953</td>
<td>811</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poblacion</td>
<td>901</td>
<td>778</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Isidro</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sto. Niño</td>
<td>239</td>
<td>169</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source of data: CBMS Survey 2000 and 2002

Secondary school participation
At the secondary level, where the base is the age group 13-16 years old, the ratio decreased by almost 12 percent from the previous survey of 81.96 percent as shown in Table 5. Although the 70.01 percent participation rate in secondary education is higher compared to the

\(^4\)2000 CBMS Survey.
provincial average of 66.10 percent\(^5\), the rate is still below the attainable levels. The decline is attributed to various factors, including the incapacity of parents to send their children to school due to financial constraints. Other children at this age bracket are also forced to work instead of attending school due to poverty.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 5. Children Attending Secondary School, San Vicente, Palawan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Source of data: CBMS Survey 2000 and 2002</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Peace and order**

**Victims of crime**

The Municipality of San Vicente is generally peaceful as gleaned from the proportion of households with members who were victims of crime (0.94\%) in 2000 and in 2002 (2.15\%). The barangays with high proportion of persons who have been victims of crime are registered in barangays Kemdeng and San Isidro while New Agutaya has no incidence of crime.

---

\(^5\) 2000 CBMS Survey.
**Infrastructure and utilities**

**Access to electricity**

The proportion of households in San Vicente with access to electricity in 2002 stood at 32.31 percent. This shows that out of 4,318 total households in the municipality, 1,395 have access to regular power supply. This rate is lower than the national average of 72.30 percent. Households with no access to electricity make use of traditional energy sources such as kerosene, LPG, wood or charcoal. Barangay Poblacion, being the urban center, has the highest proportion of households with access to electricity at 51.89 percent while the lowest is found in Binga with only 10.74 percent (Table 6).

There are only four barangays served by a 24-hour power supply, namely: Alimanguan, San Isidro, New Agutaya and Poblacion. These areas display a high proportion of households with electricity over other barangays.

**Table 6. Households with Access to Electricity, San Vicente, Palawan**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barangay</th>
<th>Total number of households</th>
<th>Households with electricity</th>
<th>Magnitude</th>
<th>Proportion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>4318</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>3810</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alimanguan</td>
<td>584</td>
<td>200</td>
<td></td>
<td>34.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Binga</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
<td>10.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caruray</td>
<td>656</td>
<td>152</td>
<td></td>
<td>23.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kemdeng</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
<td>27.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Agutaya</td>
<td>440</td>
<td>174</td>
<td></td>
<td>39.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Canipo</td>
<td>217</td>
<td>32</td>
<td></td>
<td>14.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Port Barton</td>
<td>835</td>
<td>227</td>
<td></td>
<td>27.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poblacion</td>
<td>821</td>
<td>426</td>
<td></td>
<td>51.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Isidro</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>68</td>
<td></td>
<td>37.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sto. Niño</td>
<td>159</td>
<td>49</td>
<td></td>
<td>30.82</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source of data: CBMS Survey 2000 and 2002*

---

Participation in community development
Membership in community development organizations
People’s organizations such as cooperatives and other socio-civic associations are primarily organized to provide households with better access to livelihood opportunities. Participation rate in people’s organizations in the municipality stood only at 13.43 percent in 2002 down from 17.61 percent in 2000. Compared to the national average (15.99%), the municipal rate is lower by 2.48 percent. People’s participation in community development is high in the barangays of New Canipo (19.94%) and Kemdeng (19.90%). On the other hand, it is found to be low in Sto. Niño and Binga, with the same rate at 6.09 percent. These two barangays with low community participation rates are also the barangays with high poverty incidence as can be gleaned in the section on poverty incidence.

A number of organizations and cooperatives operating in the municipality in 2000 were already inactive in 2002. The local government should therefore intensify its campaign in establishing, reorganizing and strengthening cooperatives, associations and other organizations at the barangay level. It should likewise provide technical assistance for various livelihood activities suitable for the barangay.

Waste disposal and management
The various methods by which households in the municipality dispose of their garbage include burning and dumping in closed or open pits. Burning is the most common type averaging 77.48 percent of households practicing it, followed by closed pit dumping at 9.99 percent and open pit dumping at 8.27 percent. Meanwhile, the garbage disposal system of San Vicente is very limited. The garbage truck service is only provided in the Poblacion where a landfill site is available.

Though garbage disposal is not a primary problem in the locality, the local government is nevertheless concerned with environmental protection. At present, the municipality is in the process of formulating the Barangay Comprehensive Land Use Plan of nine barangays. The plan is expected to set guidelines in the identification of landfill sites and
the development of an effective solid waste management geared towards a clean and sanitary environment.

**Employment**

The labor force in the municipality, which consists of individuals 15-64 years old, has a total of 7,562, composed of 5,340 males and 2,222 females in 2002 (Table 7). Out of this figure, 6,274 or 82.96 percent are employed. Compared to year 2000, this employment figure was an increase from 77.13 percent. This may be indicative of the efforts of the LGU under the present administration in providing employment through cooperatives. Barangay Sto. Niño has the highest employment rate with 92.5 percent while Barangay Kemdeng has the lowest at 75.41 percent.

Meanwhile, in 2002, there were twenty-seven (27) cases of children 14 years old and below reported to be working. Most of these children are boys who are engaged in fishing to help augment their families' income.

**Economic activities of household members**

On the whole, agriculture is the most engaged-in economic activity at 32.63 percent or a total of 2,150 workers. Second is fishing wherein 31.82 percent or 2,098 workers are employed. Mining and quarrying is the least engaged-in activity with only 5 people or .07 percent. Employment in agriculture, fishery and forestry in 2002 reached 68.75 percent or 4,314 workers while in 2000, it was only 64.78 percent or 3,527 workers.

**Poverty and subsistence incidence**

Poverty is characterized by the inability of households to afford subsistence needs such as food, clothing and shelter to support life. In the year 2000, only 30.97 percent had income greater than or equal to the poverty threshold level (Php 11,735.00 per capita income). It slightly decreased to 26.47 percent in 2002. This may be caused by the increase in population and the cost of living. The poverty threshold (per capita
Table 7. Labor Force and Employment, San Vicente, Palawan, 2002

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barangay</th>
<th>Labor force</th>
<th>Magnitude of employed persons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alimanguan</td>
<td>730</td>
<td>348</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Binga</td>
<td>381</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caruray</td>
<td>864</td>
<td>261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kemdeng</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Agutaya</td>
<td>490</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Canipo</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Port Barton</td>
<td>1039</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poblacion</td>
<td>1003</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Isidro</td>
<td>209</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sto. Niño</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>5340</td>
<td>2222</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source of data: CBMS Survey 2002

income) in 2002 increased to Php 15,000. This is one of the major areas where the local government of San Vicente is focusing its development projects and programs in order to attain poverty alleviation and self-sufficiency for all households in the municipality.

As seen in Table 8, Barangay Kemdeng may have the lowest in employment rate but its income is relatively high considering the bigger proportion of households (51.18%) with income greater than or equal to the poverty threshold level. Barangay Binga has the least number of households (5.03% or 15 HHs out of 298 total HHs) with income above the poverty line.

Meanwhile, there is a bigger proportion (42.82%) of households who have income greater than the food threshold level of Php 10,171 for 2002.
Projects and programs implemented based on CBMS study

**Economic sector**

Employment and household income

Since employment generation/poverty alleviation is a continuing goal of the municipality, programs were implemented to attain this goal. As a result, employment improved based on the survey conducted in 2002. Likewise, the proportion of households with income greater than poverty threshold has likewise decreased. Strengthening of cooperatives in the municipality was initiated by the present administration in an effort to help improve the living conditions of households as well as to generate employment. About 26 of these cooperatives are being assisted by the LGU.

**Social sector**

Health

As gleaned in the previous section, the proportion of child’s death decreased by 2.89 percent from 2000 to 2002. It is expected to decrease
CBMS: The San Vicente, Palawan Experience

further with the implementation of the *Botica sa Barangay* project which aims to address the medical and health needs of households in the community. A number of *Botica sa Barangay* have already been established in most barangays to provide better access to medicines aside from the yearly appropriation for medical supplies in all health centers/stations.

**Education**

In both elementary and secondary levels of education, there has been a decrease in children’s school participation. To help improve the participation rate in both levels, improvement of schools was implemented. Worth mentioning is the establishment of a high school in Barangay New Canipo to accommodate the increasing number of school children.

**Infrastructure**

**Electrification**

In response to the need to increase access to electricity, electrification projects were implemented in 2003 in Barangays Binga, New Canipo and Caruray as indicated in the Annual Investment Plan to increase the number of households with access to electricity. In 2004, households with access to electricity increased in these barangays. Almost 50 percent of households in the whole municipality now have access to electricity.

**Water**

The increase in the number of households with access to safe water in San Vicente is attributed to the construction of Level II Water Systems in New Agutaya and San Isidro funded under the Palawan Tropical Forestry Protection Programme (PTFPP) in 2001 and to the completion of the Level II water system in Barangay Kemdeng in 2002. It is also anticipated that households with access to safe water in the municipality will increase to 75 percent due to the operation of Water Districts covering five barangays, namely, Alimanguan, New Canipo, Poblacion, Caruray and New Agutaya.
Conclusion and recommendations

As experienced in the Municipality of San Vicente, the CBMS, which was implemented twice, proved to be a useful data-gathering system. For the barangays and municipality as a whole, the accurate and updated results became the bases for situational analysis where problems and needs of households in the particular area were identified. The CBMS data results also helped the Municipal Planning and Development Office (MPDO) and the LGU in the preparation of Barangay Socioeconomic Profiles. These, in turn, were consolidated into a municipal profile which serves as a guide for planners and policy makers in the formulation of multi-sectoral development plans.

In conclusion, therefore, it can be said that CBMS makes planning and programming effective since the projects and programs that were identified and implemented are guaranteed to properly address the needs and problems based on the information/data gathered. If implemented regularly, the CBMS results can serve as a yardstick of the impact of the development programs initiated by the LGU.

The LGU of San Vicente is willing to regularly implement the system and will try its best to improve the process at its level. Only those who have undergone CBMS training shall conduct the survey and processing to make it faster and to obtain more accurate data. The LGU also committed to accommodate the CBMS and allocate funds for the project during the municipal budgeting process for the year 2005.
Introduction
On the basis of the results of the community-based monitoring system (CBMS) survey conducted in April 2003 at Barangay Oring-Oring, Brooke’s Point, Palawan, the following profile and needs of the barangay have been drawn. This will thereupon serve as the basis for identifying programs and interventions to improve the living conditions in the said barangay.

Demography
Barangay Oring-Oring has a total land area of 1,456 hectares. It has a total of 277 households distributed in the following zones (sitios), namely: Cadjasan, Matangkay, Panamoton, Taking and Venturanza (Map 1). The Barangay has a population of 1,322 individuals, 51.29 percent or 678 of whom are males and 48.71 percent or 644 are females.

More households (101) reside in Sitio Taking, followed by Sitio Cadjasan with 84 households, Sitio Venturanza with 41 households, Matangkay with 32 households and Panamoton with 19 households.

Population distribution also shows that more people are located in Sitio Taking with 37.60 percent (497 persons) of the total population living in the area. Sitio Cadjasan has 30.33 percent (401 persons), Sitio Venturanza has 13.69 percent (181 persons), Sitio Matangkay has 11.27

* Barangay (Village) Captain, Barangay Oring-Oring, Brooke’s Point, Palawan.
percent (149 person), and Sitio Panamoton has the least population with 7.11 percent (94 persons).

**Health and nutrition**

*Malnutrition among children 0-5 Years old*
CBMS results show a 2.24 percent rate of malnutrition among children. Five malnourished children out of 228 children aged 0-5 years old were identified and found in Sitio Taking and Sitio Cadjasan at 4.08 percent and 1.49 percent, respectively.

Results of the survey show that out of a total of 38 infants (children less than 1 year old) born in the barangay in the past year, there were 2 cases of deaths, both of which came from Sitio Cadjasan.

*Child deaths*
Out of the total 222 children aged 1-6 years old residing in the barangay, there was only 1 case of child death in Sitio Taking.
Access to basic services

Access to safe water

Of the total number of households in the barangay, 88.81 percent have access to safe water supply. As can be gleaned in Map 2, all households in Sitio Matangkay and Panamoton have access to safe water supply while in Sitios Venturanza, Taking and Cadjasan, 95.12 percent, 88.12 percent and 79.76 percent, respectively, of the households enjoy access to safe water.

![Map 2. Households with Access to Safe Water Supply](image)

Source of data: CBMS Survey, 2003

Access to sanitary toilet

With regard to toilet facilities, only 9.4 percent of the total households in the barangay have access to sanitary ones (defined as water-sealed toilet facilities). Sitio Panamoton has better sanitation with 21.1 percent of the total households in the area having access to sanitary toilet facility (Map 3). This is followed by Sitio Matangkay with 12.5 percent, Sitio Cadjasan with 9.52 percent and Sitio Venturanza with 7.32 percent.
The households in Sitio Taking have the least access with only 6.93 percent of them owning sanitary toilets.

**Access to electricity**

Out of the 277 households living in the barangay, only 20 households or 7.22 percent have access to electricity. Again, Sitio Panamoton is better off with 26.32 percent of the households having access to electricity. This is followed by Sitio Matangkay with 12.5 percent and Sitio Cadjasan with 8.33 percent. Sitio Taking and Venturanza have the lowest at 3.0 percent and 2.44 percent, respectively (Map 4).

**Shelter**

*Makeshift shelters*

Out of the total 277 households living in the barangay, 234 or 84.5 percent were not living in makeshift homes. No household lives in a makeshift shelter at Sitio Panamoton. On the other hand, 90.63 percent of Sitio
Matangkay’s households were not living in makeshift shelters followed by Sitio Taking with 85.15 percent, Sitio Cadjasan, 82.14 percent and Sitio Venturanza with 75.61 percent (Map 5).

Ownership of house and lot
With regard to tenure status of housing units, 99.3 percent of the total households of the barangay either own their house and lot, own their houses on rent-free lots with the consent of the lot owners, and live on rent-free house and lot with the consent of the owners.

All households in Sitio Matangkay, Taking and Venturanza are living as formal settlers while majority of households living in Sitio Cadjasan and Panamoton, 98.8 percent and 94.7 percent, respectively, are living as formal settlers.

There are only 2 households that are informal settlers and they can be found in Sitio Cadjasan and Panamoton.
Peace and order
Crime incidence for the whole barangay is relatively low at 0.3 percent. Only 4 out of the 1,322 barangay residents were victims of crime during the past year.

Two incidences of murder were reported in Sitio Cadjasan or 0.6 percent of the total persons living in the area while 1 incidence of murder and 1 incidence of theft happened in Sitio Taking.

Income and livelihood
Poverty incidence
Of the total 277 households, there are 201 or 75.60 percent with income less than the poverty threshold. Only 76 households or 27.44 percent have income greater than the poverty threshold which is P 15,001.00.

Sitio Panamoton had the highest number of households with income greater than poverty threshold, which is 36.84 percent, followed by
Sitio Matangkay with 34.38 percent. On the other hand, Sitio Taking has 26.73 percent, Sitio Cadjasan, 25.0 percent and Sitio Venturanza, 24.39 percent (Map 6).

**Map 6. Proportion of Households with Income Greater than Poverty Threshold**

Source of data: CBMS Survey, 2003

**Subsistence incidence**

Of the total 277 households, 163 or 58.84 percent have income levels below the subsistence threshold. On the other hand, 114 or 41.16 percent of the total number of households have incomes greater than the subsistence threshold, which was P 10,171.00.

Again, Sitio Panamoton with 52.63 percent had the highest number of households with income greater than subsistence threshold while Sitio Venturanza, Matangkay, Taking and Cadjasan have 46.34 percent, 40.62 percent, 39.60 percent and 38.1 percent, respectively (Map 7).
Food shortage

In terms of food shortage, only 15 households or 5.42 percent of the total households in the barangay had experienced food shortage.

As shown in Map 8, Sitio Cadjasan had the highest number of households that experienced food shortage which is 9 or 10.71 percent of its total households. Sitio Panamoton had 5.26 percent and Sitio Venturanza had 4.88 percent. Sitio Matangkay and Taking have 3.13 percent and 1.98 percent, respectively.

Employment rate

The main sources of income in the barangay are farming and fishing. The predominant agricultural products are rice, corn, coconut, root-crops and vegetables. Livestock and poultry raised in the barangay include cattle, goat, chicken and swine. There are also several cottage and small industries in the barangay such as nipa and coco-leaf shingles making, mat weaving and soft broom-making.
Data in map 9 show that the employment rate of the barangay is 83.64 percent. Sitio Matangkay has the highest employment rate of 86.21 percent while sitio Venturanza has the lowest at 81.97 percent. Sitio Cadjasan, Panamoton and Taking have 84.33 percent, 83.78 percent and 82.67 percent, respectively.

**Underemployment rate**
Out of the 368 employed residents of the barangay, 248 individuals or 67.4 percent are underemployed. They are persons who have expressed the desire to either have additional hours of work in their present job, an additional job or to have jobs with longer working hours.

Among the sitios, Sitio Venturanza has the highest underemployment rate at 80.0 percent followed by Sitio Matangkay which stood at 74.0 percent. Sitio Cadjasan and Taking have 65.49 percent and 63.71 percent, respectively. The least is in Sitio Panamoton with 58.01 percent (Map 10).
Map 9. Employment Rate

Source of data: CBMS Survey, 2003

Map 10. Underemployment Rate

Source of data: CBMS Survey, 2003
Basic education and literacy

Elementary school participation rate
There is an existing school facility right in the center of the barangay. The facility, however, is only for elementary level students.

The barangay records a 68.04 percent school participation rate in the elementary level or 149 out of the 219 children aged 6-11 years old are currently in school. Among the sitios, Map 11 shows that Sitio Taking has the lowest elementary participation rate at 62.35 percent while Sitio Panamoton has the highest at 90.91 percent. Sitio Matangkay, Cadjasan and Venturanza have 76.19 percent, 70.13 percent and 64.0 percent, respectively.

Map 11. Elementary School Participation Rate

Secondary school participation rate
Secondary school participation rate is 27.5 percent or 33 out of the 120 children aged 12-15 years old. The lowest is recorded in Sitio Venturanza with 9.09 percent while the highest secondary participation rate is in
Sitio Panamoton with 42.86 percent. On the other hand, Sitio Matangkay has a secondary school participation rate of 35.00 percent followed by Sitio Cadjasan with 32.43 percent and Sitio Taking with 26.47 percent (Map 12).

**Map 12. Secondary School Participation Rate**

*Source of data: CBMS Survey, 2003*

**School participation rate**

School participation rate for children aged 6-16 years old is 67.30 percent. The highest is recorded in Sitio Matangkay with 81.82 percent, followed by Sitio Panamoton and Cadjasan at 76.19 percent and 65.83 percent, respectively. The least school participation rate can be observed in Sitio Taking at 63.91 percent followed by Sitio Venturanza at 63.27 percent (Map 13).

**Literacy rate**

Barangay Oring-Oring has a literacy rate of 87.88 percent. Sitio Panamoton has the highest literacy rate among sitios at 97.30 percent. On the other hand, Sitio Matangkay has a literacy rate of 95.04 percent.
followed by Sitio Venturanza with 91.18 percent and Sitio Taking with 85.04 percent. Sitio Cadjasan has the lowest literacy rate at 84.21 percent.

**Community participation**

*Membership in community organizations*

Only 31 out of the 1322 total persons residing in the barangay are members of community organizations.

Sitio Panamoton registered the highest participation rate at 9.6 percent and the lowest was recorded in Sitio Cadjasan with 1.3 percent. Sitio Venturanza has 2.2 percent and the Sitios of Matangkay and Taking have 2.0 percent each.

**Priority needs**

Based on the CBMS results and validation exercise, the following problems were identified:

- Poor sanitation
• Low access to electricity
• High poverty incidence
• Low participation of children in school
• Low participation in community organizations

Programs/projects implemented in the barangay
Based on the priority needs identified from the CBMS survey, the barangay was able to identify and implement programs that would address some of these needs. These include the following:

Construction of a feeder road at Sitio Venturanza
The barangay was able to construct a 1.2 kilometer feeder road at Sitio Venturanza. The opening up of this access road would help farmers to transport their goods to nearby markets.

Expansion of electrification to Sitio Taking
The barangay used funds provided by the National Government (share from the Malampaya Fund) to finance the electrification of its sitios. The program was able to provide electricity to 50 households along the national highway.

With the electrification project, the proportion of households with access to electricity rose to 15.2 percent this year from 7.2 percent in 2002 as shown in Map 14.

Water system project at sitio taking
The barangay was also able to install pressure pump and jetmatic pump in Sitio Taking which provided safe water sources for 30 households (Map 15). The fund cost of P100,000.00 for the program was given by Congressman Mitra.

Construction of public sanitary toilets
A 2-door public toilet was constructed in Sitio Cadjasan and Sitio Taking. The public toilet in Sitio Cadjasan was donated by the Islamic World Committee and it is being used and maintained by 10 households in the sitio.
The public toilet in Sitio Taking, on the other hand, was donated by Mr. Jake Abdurahman. It is being shared and maintained by 10 households in the sitio.

With public toilets installed, the proportion of households with access to sanitary toilets increased from 9.4 percent in 2002 to 24.9 percent this year (Map 16).

**Construction of a 2-room school building**

The barangay was able to add two new classrooms in Oring-Oring Elementary School. The 2-room building with toilet facility was constructed with the fund support of P720,000.00 from Congressman Mitra.

**New day care center at Sitio Taking**

In Sitio Taking, the barangay constructed a day care center building with a comfort room. The project was funded by Congressman Mitra with the fund support of P150,000.00. The barangay gave a counterpart fund of P16,600.00 for the construction of the comfort room.
Map 15. Access to Safe Water (After intervention)

Map 16. Access to Sanitary Toilet Facilities (After intervention)
Irrigation facility in Sitio Venturanza
An irrigation facility was installed in Sitio Venturanza with funds coming from the National Irrigation Administration (NIA) and Department of Agrarian Reform (DAR) covering about 20 hectares of agricultural land. Eight households benefited from the program.

Priority projects for 2005-2006
Finally, Table 1 enumerates the projects and programs identified by the barangay LGU for 2005-2006. Again, these projects and programs were developed in response to the needs identified from the results of the CBMS survey conducted in Barangay Oring-Oring. The targeted beneficiaries of these projects include the entire constituents of the barangay.

Table 1. Priority Projects 2005-2006

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROJECTS</th>
<th>UNITS</th>
<th>COST</th>
<th>SOURCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. Construction of:  
  a. Public market  
  b. Public toilets  
  c. Museum building | 1/unit/sitio | P350,000.00 | National |
|  | | P25,000/sitio | National |
| | | P200,000 | National/Local |
| 2. Delineation of alternative Port Area and Development | | P200,000,000.00 | National |
| 3. Development of: Sea Spring | | P150,000.00 | National/Local |
| 4. Expansion of Electrification to Sitio Cadjasan | 2kms | P60,000.00 | National/Local |
| | | | | |
| 5. Opening of Brgy. Road at Sitio Venturanza | | P2,000,000.00 | ARISP-DAR |
| 6. Tribal Hall | | P350,000.00 | National |
| 7. JAMA-MAPON Cultural Center | | P350,000.00 | National |
Evaluating the CIDSS and other programs in Palawan

Josephine Escaño*

Why this study?
Over the years, the Provincial Government of Palawan has focused its attention on the upgrading of the quality of life of every Palaweño. When Governor Joel T. Reyes assumed the governorship in 2000, he pursued poverty alleviation as the major thrust of his administration. In order to gauge the extent to which provincial projects have contributed to this vision, Governor Reyes directed the Provincial Planning and Development Office (PPDO) to undertake a project impact assessment to determine the effectiveness of said projects in reducing poverty in the province.

To demonstrate the success of these initiatives and to find out which strategies work and which do not, mechanisms to monitor poverty impact are needed. In Palawan, such documentation is done at the general level using the Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS) welfare indicators and at the level of project input and output using the Project Management Information System (PMIS). No attempt has been made so far to study the link between the two in order to understand the impact of interventions on the welfare conditions of households in Palawan. In recognition of this, the Governor ordered the PPDO to develop strategies and tools for the conduct of regular project impact assessments.

* Chief, Research and Evaluation Division, Provincial Planning and Development Office, Provincial Government of Palawan.
In consultation with the CIM Integrated Expert Program, a project team was formed in April 2002, consisting of staff from the PPDO Research Division and the Provincial Social Welfare and Development Office (PSWDO) to conduct an impact assessment of the Comprehensive Integrated Delivery of Social Services (CIDSS) program, a strategy to alleviate poverty through community empowerment. Research was done in 4 CIDSS project barangays using the Participatory Impact Monitoring (PIM) approach, which is also known as Participatory Learning and Action (PLA) approach. The objective was to assess whether the CIDSS implementation in Palawan indeed serves as a mechanism to alleviate poverty through community involvement and empowerment. At the same time, this pilot study is also expected to provide a basis for the province-wide institutionalization of project benefit monitoring.

This paper summarizes the results of the said research work. It first gives some basic background on the CIDSS program in Palawan and the research approach and methodologies of PIM. It then presents the major findings of the impact of the CIDSS, after which it outlines the recommendations of the study team.

A backgrounder

The PIM concept

Participatory Impact Monitoring (PIM) is a research concept characterized by an applied, holistic and flexible way of progressive learning. It is conducted by multi-disciplinary teams focusing on community participation. The PIM methodology generates information from the different organized beneficiaries of the CIDSS known as Community Welfare Structures (CWS). For the Palawan study, workshops with the CWS were done to assess the “Empowerment Index” or EI.

CIDSS

Comprehensive Integrated Delivery of Social Services (CIDSS) is a poverty alleviation initiative that goes back to the Social Reform and Poverty Alleviation Act of the Ramos Administration. It builds on the
full and meaningful involvement of community members in development. In the CIDSS program, involvement of communities is regarded as the key to uplifting welfare conditions and meeting minimum basic household needs. It is thus a grassroots-level development strategy that starts with the family and community organizations as basic movers of change and progress. For this purpose, inter-agency committees are being created, starting at the barangay level all the way up to the national government. At the level of the implementing agencies, it emphasizes convergence or team effort of government at the national and local levels with non-government and basic sector organizations.

The CIDSS is a database- and information-driven strategy. At its core is the Minimum Basic Needs (MBN) approach to service delivery. Under this approach, communities and local governments undertake the annual MBN survey (now integrated to the CBMS survey), using a checklist of 33 indicators corresponding to 10 basic needs. The presence or absence of any of these indicators among surveyed families would tell the barangay and eventually the municipality and province what the focus sectors are and what households to target for interventions. Thus, the CIDSS synchronizes the targeted efforts of local communities and assists agencies in their poverty alleviation work.

In Palawan, the CIDSS has been implemented in 37 barangays of 13 municipalities since 1998. The projects implemented under the Program include livelihood assistance, day care center construction, social housing, water projects and others.

The process
As already mentioned, PIM is a research concept that is characterized by an applied, holistic and flexible way of progressive learning. It focuses on the community’s perception for gaining insights on project impacts. Besides the traditional ways of data gathering, PIM facilitates effective dialogue between beneficiary groups and research teams. Thus, it enables a communicative learning on project impact and underlying factors for both researchers and the communities. The “toolbox” of PIM for information gathering contains a wide range of instruments ranging from...
interviews and focus group discussions to interactive diagramming, mapping, role play and others. It also involves a review of secondary sources and direct observation / site inspection of project facilities.

The PIM study focused around three research questions:

1. What is the degree to which the implementation of CIDSS has empowered local communities and their welfare structures to take development in their own hands?
2. How has CIDSS led to a positive change in the welfare status of beneficiary households and communities? In other words, has CIDSS contributed to poverty alleviation?
3. Was CIDSS done in a cost-sharing effective way?

The PIM adopted a case study approach for research. Four CIDSS barangays were selected where a total of 14 CIDSS interventions are being implemented.

**The impacts of CIDSS: summary of findings**

*Empowerment index*

In this section, the four cases (barangays) are assessed as to the average aggregate degree to which the CIDSS has successfully empowered community groups in terms of capability-building, localization and convergence. The success is described in the form of the Empowerment Index (EI). This index is based on the aggregate performance rating of the CIDSS barangays. It is measured as the average score that the CIDSS barangays have attained for the 51 indicators used in the research. In order to make the cases comparable and to operationalize the assessment of the relative success of CIDSS, a scoring range from 1 to 4 was adopted, with 1 being the minimum and 4 as the maximum.

The findings on the whole reflect a high impact of CIDSS on capability-building. For example, an average index of 2.84 shows that the communities have reached the stage of functional participation where local organizations participate throughout the stages of the project, from situational analysis (through the MBN survey) to implementation and
maintenance. As such, the CIDSS is generally successful in empowering local communities.

Meanwhile, localization, which refers to the capabilities of local groups to internalize or absorb a project including financing its subsequent operation, has turned out to be the weakest aspect in CIDSS so far. In all instances, it has been shown that the communities would not be able to sustain the projects entirely from their own resources. Surprisingly, though, Pasadeña is a case where the livelihood project has particularly been localized quite successfully. However, with the absence of a functional BIAC or MIAC, there are no redistribution effects to non-project participants or the entire community. An interesting observation is that there is no clear correlation between project duration and degree of localization. In other words, the degree of success of communities on localization is not necessarily higher in barangays where the CIDSS has already been operating for a longer period of time (like Bono-Bono).

Convergence, known as the pooling of resources and initiatives of supporting agencies focused on poverty alleviation, is critical to empowerment. Local communities can only empower themselves if there are opportunities (projects, resources, among others) to build local expertise and capacities to address top unmet needs. Yet, it is observed that convergence has not yet been achieved so far. In some of the surveyed barangays, the number of assisting agencies could be increased during the years of CIDSS implementation. Even those agencies working in the barangays have not fully complied with the concept of convergence and total community approach. Their understanding is not far-reaching enough. While they converge to the extent of implementing projects in the same location, other convergence aspects, particularly the harmonization of project content and utilization of local structures, are still left out.

Together, limited localization and lack of convergence may pose a threat to the sustainability of the CIDSS efforts. Thus, continuing education and efforts for communities and local organizations to work together must be pursued.
The barangay of Igabas is the most successful case based on the EI measurement (3.44). The community is on the edge of the stage of self-mobilization. It is observed that the local groups there have already started to take initiatives independently and have full control over the resources available to them. CIDSS implementation is indeed a vehicle to community-building and strengthening in the barangay where ownership over the projects involves substantial mobilization of local resources toward project completion (see section on the cost and benefits of CIDSS implementation). Under these circumstances, the role of external agencies can be increasingly focused only to the provision of technical and resource assistance. The communities of Bono-Bono (with an EI of 2.9) and New Agutaya (with an EI of 2.68), meanwhile, have reached a stage of functional participation where members of the community organizations participate in the project preparation and take an active role in implementation such as contribution in the form of labor.

Based on the analysis made, it shows that CIDSS has been successful in empowering local communities. The average EI of the communities in the barangays covered in the pilot study shows that the communities have reached a stage of functional participation in project implementation. This means that local organizations participate throughout the stages of the project from situational analysis (through the MBN survey) to implementation and maintenance. Barangay Igabas, considered the most successful case, has in fact even surpassed this stage and has achieved a certain degree of self-mobilization, which can thus describe it as an efficient and well-coordinated community that can sustain its activities.

**Impacts of CIDSS on human development**

The assessment of the human development or welfare impact of a program or project is the most important aspect when assessing project success. Any intervention is expected to bring an improvement in the living conditions of beneficiary households. The CIDSS is not an exception. The program is a good case for making a welfare impact assessment because of the MBN that explicitly states the welfare indicators to be addressed and of the fact that CIDSS targets the poorest households.
It is observed that community empowerment has positive effects on welfare conditions and poverty reduction. These effects are measured in terms of the (a) magnitude of beneficiary coverage, (b) poverty target efficiency, and (c) degree of poverty reduction brought about by CIDSS interventions.

Three key questions for the analysis of the human development impact of CIDSS are applied. First, what is the impact of CIDSS in terms of magnitude of household coverage? Second, to what extent does CIDSS really succeed in targeting the poor? And third, what is the extent of improvement in the quality of life indicators in the case barangays? With regard to the latter, the analysis is limited to the immediate effect of the service provided. For example, day care services are assessed in terms of the increase of households with children aged 3 to 5 utilizing the services. It does not examine the effects in terms of improved nutritional status or the rise of women in gainful employment that would greatly enhance the analysis. While such interpretation is intended by the project, the necessary data from the CBMS survey conducted in 2002 are not yet available.

**Magnitude of program**

This measurement of effect looks at the proportion of beneficiary households to total households in a community. The more households that directly benefit from an intervention are and the higher the proportion is, the better. For the purpose of this study, it is measured as the ratio of beneficiary households to total households (BPR), using the following calculation:

$$\text{Beneficiary-to-Population Ratio (BPR)} = \frac{\text{Number of beneficiary households}}{\text{Total number of households of the Barangay}}$$

The data show that project impact varies by type of intervention and location. In general, the magnitude impact is high in water and day care projects. This confirms that water and day care services are good
‘community’ projects that have the potential to benefit and mobilize a larger portion of households. Looking at water projects, there is an average BPR of 0.64, which means that 64 percent of all households in Bono-Bono and Igabas are included in the projects. In Igabas, household coverage is almost all-inclusive with 90 percent coverage. For day care services, CIDSS serves an average 34 percent of all households with children aged 3 to 5 years of age. Impact is much lower for housing and livelihood interventions while for livelihood projects, the ratio varies from 0.13 in Igabas to 0.02 in Bono-Bono. On average, 6 percent of the total number of households in the case barangays benefit from the project. Thus, the livelihood project type is an approach that generally targets a smaller number of beneficiaries.

**Poverty target efficiency**
The poverty target efficiency measures the degree by which a project reaches the poor members in a barangay. It answers the question of whether a specific intervention indeed alleviates poverty or benefits the more affluent community groups instead. It is calculated as the proportion of poor project beneficiary households to total number of beneficiary households.

\[
\text{Poverty Target Efficiency} = \frac{\text{Number of poor project beneficiaries}}{\text{Total number of project beneficiary households}}
\]

The case studies confirmed what CIDSS claims to be: a program that is directed toward the poor members of the communities. The field surveys revealed that the beneficiaries from the 12 projects belong to the group of households that had been identified as having the least access to the corresponding services that a particular project aims to deliver.

**Poverty reduction**
As a final measure, the research looked into the degree of poverty reduction or, to put it positively, into the improvement of the welfare
condition in the case barangays. This is done by looking at the changes in the respective welfare indicators over time, i.e., the situation prior to the start of the project vis-à-vis the present. A poverty reduction index (PRI) was constructed that indicates the difference in the proportion of households with met needs at present and proportion of households with met needs at project start. It is calculated as follows:

$$\text{Poverty Reduction Index} = \frac{\text{HH with needs being met (present)} - \text{HH with needs being met (at project start)}}{\text{Total number of households}}$$

The data confirmed that in most projects and case barangays, the CIDSS had a positive effect on welfare. In other words, the program reduced poverty over the 2 to 3 year period of implementation. There are, however, differences by the type of intervention. On aggregate, the highest impact on poverty reduction was brought about by the water projects with a PRI of 0.38. This means that the average level of household access to safe water could be improved by 38 percent. Improvements are almost as significant in the case of day care services with a PRI of 0.33, equivalent to 33 percent improvement in the welfare conditions in this particular aspect.

Impact is lower in the case of the housing project with a PRI of 0.19, equivalent to 19 percent reduction in makeshift housing. Livelihood projects yielded the lowest impact with an average PRI of 0.01, equivalent to only a 1 percent improvement in employment.

Poverty impact also varies across location. The increase in access to safe water, for example, is solely due to the construction water system in Bono-Bono. In Igabas, the wells constructed do not yet provide safe water; thus, the impact on poverty alleviation remains zero. A substantial difference in impact on access is also observed in the case of day care. While in Igabas, almost all households with children aged 3-5 could be provided with day care services (94%), the impact in Bono-Bono is much smaller (21%). The impact of the livelihood project is highest in Igabas with an improvement of 6 percent in employment but negative in
Bono-Bono. This means that the benefits from the interventions were not enough to outweigh the rising demand for employment due to population growth.

The cost and benefits of CIDSS implementation

The consideration of the economics of service delivery plays a vital role for assessing program success.

For the purpose of this analysis, three questions were raised. First, to what extent are local communities contributing from their own internal resources for project implementation? Second, how much government resources are needed per unit of service or good? And third, how much external resources are needed to deliver a standard service per direct beneficiary?

The information on the internal resources mobilization in economic terms provides insights on the potential and success of CIDSS as a cost-sharing strategy. Unit cost and per beneficiary unit cost are useful bases to compare the economics of CIDSS vis-à-vis other modes of delivery for the same service, e.g., the construction of day care centers by the Department of Public Works and Highways (DPWH).

Mobilization of internal (community) resources

To determine the degree of internal resources, the Internal Resources Mobilization Ratio (IRR) is used. The IRR represents the internally raised resources (expressed as a monetary value of the various kinds of support provided) to total cost of project implementation of CIDSS projects.

\[
\text{Internal Resources Mobilization Ratio} = \frac{\text{Internal resources}}{\text{Total project cost}}
\]

Internal here refers to the contribution of the local communities, i.e., the barangays. It is calculated as follows:
An IRR of 1 represents a situation where all project costs are shouldered by the communities while an IRR of 0 indicates that no resources were generated internally.

On aggregate, around P3 million were spent for 12 projects in the four case barangays. Out of these, around 750,000 came from internal resources of community members. The aggregate IRR is 0.25 which means that a remarkable 25 percent of the funds were raised in the communities.

With community empowerment being achieved, positive changes in the welfare condition and poverty reduction were noted in the covered areas. The study shows that through CIDSS, interventions and services not only went directly to the poor but delivery of goods and services also proved to be cost-effective for government. CIDSS is highly supported by locally generated funds making CIDSS a less costly approach than other development strategies because of community members’ contributions, shared responsibility and initiative. In a real sense, interventions through the CIDSS approach lessen the cost of development programs and government interventions.

Despite these encouraging results, though, the PIM study could not clarify questions regarding the effectiveness of particular kinds of interventions. For example, it could not show that the construction of day care centers has led to an increase in female employment due to the fact that their children are now being taken care of during certain hours of the day.

The barangays of Igabas (0.22), New Agutaya (0.27) and Bono-Bono (0.28) have the highest IRR. This confirms a correlation between the internal resource mobilization and the level of community empowerment which shows that the higher degree of empowerment (expressed as the empowerment index) is in a community, the more community members contribute from their own internal resources. In other words, it makes not only social but also economic sense to invest in community-building and strengthening of efforts.

A comparison of the IRR of different project types reveals the expected observation that more capital-intensive projects have lower
IRR. This is documented by a comparative low IRR of 0.20 in the case of water and sanitation. With a ratio of 0.31 (31% of the total resources), livelihood projects yield the highest IRR. This shows the attractiveness of the project type, indicated by the willingness of beneficiaries to raise significant internal resources.

A look at the changes in the IRR over time is useful to assess whether localization is taking place or not. In cases where the share of internal resources is increasing over the years of project implementation, a trend toward localization can be confirmed. In fact, this is the case in a majority number of projects, particularly the livelihood and day care type.

**Government expenditure per unit of service**

The project cost per service unit (CS) measures the effort of government under the CIDSS approach to provide a standard unit of service like a day care center or one unit of socialized housing. This ratio provides useful information and basis for a comparison of CIDSS service delivery with other modes of service provision. It is calculated as the ratio of government expenditure (excluding the locally raised resources) over the number of service units provided.

\[
\text{Cost per Unit of Service} = \frac{\text{Government expenditure}}{\text{Number of units of service delivered}}
\]

However, some caution is needed in interpreting the resulting figures. As documented in the case of the water project in Igabas, the CIDSS projects are not rewarded at all instances with success. After two years of project existence, the dug wells in Igabas are not yet providing safe water. This suggests that the CIDSS efforts need to be tied up with technical expertise to ensure a feasible project implementation.
Conclusions and recommendations
This paper examines the effects of CIDSS intervention on community empowerment and welfare conditions of households in four case barangays. It also looks into the economics of CIDSS service delivery.

The findings point out the relative success of the program in bringing about positive changes in the capability of local communities and in their welfare conditions. However, the impact varies by project type and location thereby showing that there are important conditions that need to be observed to ensure that benefits are maximized.

In sum, the assessment confirms that:

1. CIDSS implementation in Palawan is generally successful in bringing about positive changes in the welfare conditions of households and communities in the province.
2. It is also a successful strategy in channeling benefits to the poor members of the community. In terms of assisting the households that previously lacked access to certain services, facilities and opportunities, the CIDSS is an effective poverty reduction strategy.
3. The delivery of goods and services under CIDSS is implemented in a way that is cost-effective for government. This is because of its ability to harness local resources for project implementation.
4. The ‘vehicle’ for cost-effective delivery of services and focused improvement in human development is empowerment and building of ownership in the communities. There is a clear link between the degree of empowerment and the mobilization of community resources. And with few exceptions, the presence of capable community structures is the main guarantor of human development.
5. The success of CIDSS depends on a set of determining factors. These are, among others, a local culture of mutual support and responsible leadership; the presence of functional local inter-agency committees at the barangay and municipal levels; and
the implementation of technically feasible projects that address locally perceived significant needs.

6. Municipal Social Welfare Workers play a crucial role in the CIDSS project. In most instances, their active involvement ensures that things would move. However, their active involvement also creates dependency on the part of the communities. As such, their function should focus more on an enabling role, i.e., encouraging local groups to take over responsibilities.

7. It is of crucial importance to ensure the technical feasibility of project designs. Community involvement and ownership must be matched by technical and engineering knowledge. As seen in the case of the water project in Igabas, the impact remains zero because the project relied solely on community enthusiasm without ensuring the presence of technical expertise. Such a situation should be avoided.

8. There should be a mix of community projects that focus on the breadth and depth of participation. While a livelihood project is suitable to solicit ‘deep’ participation from a few beneficiaries, water or day care services are very suited to involve and strengthen entire communities.

9. If the objective is to achieve the highest possible reduction in poverty, a project should focus on aspects that ensure breadth of participation (involving ideally the entire community). The intervention should also focus on human welfare aspects (needs) that are currently unmet by a significant number of households.

10. Choosing the right location is also very important to ensure human development impact. A good choice of a facility site can increase household access, thereby bringing about a higher impact. The selection should be part of the project design and not left alone to the decision of the communities.

11. In order to have a human development impact, the project should exceed a minimum size. For example, 10 beneficiaries in a
barangay with a population of more than 2000 is too small to provide tangible improvements.

12. Finally, the progress and benefits of CIDSS should be regularly documented. There are existing forms and procedures which are already acceptable. It is recommended that these be done regularly, making sure that the quality of data is high and making use of them for analyses.
CBMS Experiences of Local Partners from Camarines Norte
The use of CBMS for local governance: from a municipal level perspective

Winifredo B. Oco*

Introduction
The Municipality of Labo is one of the 12 municipalities in the province of Camarines Norte in the Bicol region. In terms of land area, it is the biggest in Camarines Norte and is approximately 15 kilometers from the capital town of Daet and 325 kilometers from Manila. Fifty-two barangays comprise this first class municipality where agriculture is the most dominant source of employment with copra, abaca, palay and pineapple as the major crops.

The implementation of the community-based monitoring system (CBMS) in our municipality helped bring about several changes in the way we plan and prioritize programs in the municipality. Today, after two years of having the CBMS, we are working toward having the system institutionalized in our local set-up. Certainly, this speaks of the sense of satisfaction and gratification that we have at Labo for the experience we have had in the implementation of the CBMS. It is therefore my honor to share with you this experience along with the lessons that we have learned in the process.

Before the CBMS information system was implemented, very few information were available to comprise the statistical profile of the municipality. When the CBMS was set up in our municipality, we were able to gather the updated information from the 52 barangays. At the same time, the results of the CBMS survey enabled us to identify and

* Local Chief Executive, Municipality of Labo, Camarines Norte.
determine basic conditions in our municipality.

These additional information gathered helped us see the extent of certain conditions in our municipality. Nonetheless, they only gave us a general picture. What allowed us to take a deeper look was the use of a more innovative tool, shared with us by the CBMS team as an integral part of the CBMS process. This is the use of geographic information system (GIS) maps that assisted not only policy and decisionmakers like me but also program partners and stakeholders in planning the appropriate interventions needed to respond to the requirements of our constituents. With our resources quite limited, the GIS maps helped us maximize what we have and utilize them to the fullest.

With the use of the maps, for example, we are able to see at one glance the households who had access to sanitary toilet facilities before the distribution of toilet bowls was made and the households who have access to such facilities after the intervention.

The same case of determining how an intervention program had assisted in addressing Labo’s concerns, as gleaned in the CBMS survey results, can likewise be seen in the areas of access to safe water supply and improvement in household incomes.

**Top unmet needs**

The results of the CBMS survey revealed that the municipality is performing well in some dimensions of well-being but performing poorly in others. Among the areas where the municipality is doing well are in health and nutrition, housing, peace and order, basic education and food sufficiency, as shown in Table 1.

What the municipality should be concerned about based on the survey results, meanwhile, is the very high proportion of households who are poor even though a high employment rate was registered. This indicates that the income of those who are working is not sufficient to meet other basic needs. Low access to safe water and sanitary toilet facilities as well as low secondary school participation rate were also identified as problem areas.
The Use of CBMS for Local Governance: Municipality

Table 1. CBMS Core Indicators, Municipality of Labo, Camarines Norte, 2003

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Health</td>
<td>1. Proportion of child deaths</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Prevalence of malnourished children</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Nutrition</td>
<td>3. Proportion of households living in non-makeshift housing</td>
<td>94.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Proportion of households who are formal settlers</td>
<td>95.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Housing</td>
<td>5. Proportion of households with access to safe water supply</td>
<td>64.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Proportion of households with access to sanitary toilet facilities</td>
<td>65.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Water and Sanitation</td>
<td>7. Elementary school participation rate</td>
<td>79.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8. Secondary school participation rate</td>
<td>67.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9. Literacy rate</td>
<td>97.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Basic Education and Literacy</td>
<td>10. Proportion of households who eat at least 3 meals a day</td>
<td>97.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11. Proportion of households with income above poverty threshold</td>
<td>32.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12. Proportion of households with income above food threshold</td>
<td>48.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Income</td>
<td>13. Employment rate</td>
<td>88.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Employment</td>
<td>14. Proportion of persons who are victims of crimes</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Peace and Order</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Interventions

With the problems identified through the CBMS data, the next step taken was the identification of programs and projects to address them.

In the area of health, the criteria for choosing beneficiaries of an ongoing program of the Municipal Health Office (MHO) on the provision of toilet bowls had been improved with the incorporation of the results of the CBMS. The program is carried out as a partnership between the MHO and the barangay government units, whose counterpart is the provision of cement and hollow blocks needed for the construction of the toilet facilities in the households. A total of 900 toilet bowl units were purchased for this program benefiting 295 and 403 households in 2003 and 2004, respectively, with priorities given to needy households. There are still 202 units of toilet bowl left to be distributed to needy households this year.

Figure 1 shows the extent of improvement on the households’ access to sanitary toilet facilities in one barangay after such intervention.

Figure 1. Proportion of Households with Access to Sanitary Toilet Facilities, Before and After Intervention, Brgy. Sta. Cruz, Labo, Camarines Norte, Philippines, 2003
For the problem regarding the lack of access to safe water, the improvement of several barangay water systems was identified as the appropriate response. As such, my office allocated a certain amount for this. Another program proposed is the Integrated Rural Accessibility Program-Infrastructure for Rural Productivity Enhancement Sector (IRAP-INFRES) to be implemented in priority barangays. This project is a national program wherein program beneficiaries are given financial support for water system improvement.

In the area of education, results of the CBMS validation exercises revealed that distance and/or non-proximity to school facilities is one reason for the low participation rate of children. Another reason cited was the lack of financial means of parents to send their children to school. Their incomes are not enough to pay for the tuition and other day-to-day expenses of the children.

To address this problem, the Sangguniang Bayan passed a resolution granting educational aid in the form of financial assistance and school supplies to deserving students as identified in the CBMS survey results. The students belonging to the top 10 percent of their class will be prioritized as beneficiaries. They also have to belong to low-income and large-sized households. An initial fund of P50,000 was allotted for this program. Target beneficiaries will receive P500.00, with P200.00 for financial assistance and P300.00 allotted for school supplies for the school year.

The construction and improvement of farm-to-market roads was likewise identified as a priority program in response to the results of the validation exercises which showed that one of the reasons for the low income of those who are working is the inability of farmers to transport their goods, mostly copra, palay, pineapple, cassava and banana, to markets because of the poor condition of the roads. An amount was thus allocated for this project. Road openings for many inaccessible barangays in the municipality were also identified.

**Other uses of CBMS data**

Apart from helping identify or strengthen intervention programs in Labo to address problems previously indicated, the CBMS data were also
useful in other aspects of development programs both at the municipal and barangay levels.

At the municipal level
Foremost is the utilization of the CBMS data in the preparation of the Municipal Socioeconomic Profile and municipal annual investment and development plans.

One illustration is the use by the Office of the Municipal Social Welfare and Development Office (MSWDO) of the CBMS data to identify the poorest households in the barangays on the basis of their income levels and on whether they are within the poverty or food threshold limits. The MSWDO also used the CBMS data as basis for selecting Philhealth beneficiaries to whom national government-supported health cards are to be given.

The CBMS data are also useful in the determination of priority needs in the municipality. The adoption of Municipal Ordinance No. 188-2004 dated March 2, 2004, which granted educational aid in the form of financial assistance and school supplies to indigent households in response to the problem identified through the CBMS survey results, is a case in point.

Corollarily, the CBMS results were utilized in identifying the barangays with critical water supply systems. With the use of the maps prepared in the CBMS process, the office of the Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator was able to easily identify the barangays that were in dire need of the water facilities. With such information, the municipality of Labo was considered for inclusion in the national government program IRAP-INFRES for water supply.

Moreover, the CBMS survey results provided additional data in the preparation of the municipal land use plan as well as inputs to the GIS-based socioeconomic database of the municipality.

At the barangay level
Similar to the municipal level usage, the CBMS data have been useful in the preparation of the barangay annual investment and development
The Use of CBMS for Local Governance: Municipality

plans as well as the Barangay Socioeconomic Profile. They were also used in preparing the barangay poverty maps which show the most depressed areas in the various barangays in terms of the different dimensions of poverty.

More important, the CBMS information proved to be helpful in determining priority needs and priority programs and projects in the various barangays. In this regard, all 52 barangays of the municipality of Labo drew up their list of priority programs like the allocation, for instance, of Barangay Tulay na Lupa of specific amounts for its supplemental feeding program and educational assistance program. Relatedly, Barangay Tulay na Lupa’s use of the CBMS survey results in analyzing the educational and health status of its children won for it the coveted “Child-Friendliest Barangay” award in a province-wide search/contest.

What’s the cost?

Any undertaking has a corresponding cost in terms of monetary expenses. In the case of the CBMS implementation, it may perhaps be said that the benefits and rewards far outweigh the expenses involved. Consider the following amount incurred during the first round of the CBMS implementation: P 431,523.00 or P 27.18 per household.

For the subsequent implementation, meanwhile, an estimated cost of P 224,503.34 or P 14.14 per household is anticipated. This sum, however, excludes training costs since the same enumerators are assumed to be tapped for the next round of survey.

All in all, the costs of implementing the CBMS are minimal when compared to large surveys which have interval periods in-between.

As such, it may be considered as a low-cost technology or procedure.

A commitment for institutionalization

Because of its proven benefits and advantages, the usage of CBMS data will be the basis of future development initiatives in Labo, especially in its poverty reduction-related programs, projects and activities.
In view of this, we commit to support new CBMS undertakings such as the expected new round of survey activities that would evaluate the effects of the development programs in the municipality. We also commit to promote the awareness and use of the CBMS as a tool for poverty monitoring and local governance, and vow to help institutionalize the CBMS as an integral component of development planning and programming in the municipality of Labo.

With the institutionalization of the CBMS, the municipality of Labo therefore looks forward to having a “Well-Balanced Outlook for Opportunities and Change Onwards!”
Introduction

The Municipality of Sta. Elena lies at the frontier of the Bicol Region and is aptly dubbed as the “Gateway to Bicolandia”. It is situated in the northernmost part of the Bicol Peninsula adjacent to the province of Quezon. To its west is the Basiad Bay of the Pacific Ocean. The town proper (Poblacion) is 263 kilometers from Metro Manila.

Sta. Elena is relatively young. It was created on June 21, 1969 by virtue of Republic Act 5480 and was the eleventh of the 12 municipalities of Camarines Norte created. Initially, it had 10 barangays but recent developments involving a provincial boundary dispute, wherein the Supreme Court ruled in favor of Sta. Elena, led to the inclusion of another nine barangays.

The town is a 4th class municipality with a population of 38,000 covering 19 barangays. Its topography is characterized by rolling hills to rugged terrain with fertile plains and small valleys rolling down the Pacific Ocean where 11 of its coastal barangays form its periphery. The main agricultural industries are coconut and fishing.

The CBMS experience

An opportunity is presented

The Municipal Planning Development Office (MPDO) of Sta. Elena

---

* Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator, Sta. Elena, Camarines Norte.
Proceedings of the 2004 National Conference on CBMS

has always been at the forefront in developing programs, projects and activities that will effectively benefit the locality. Because of meager resources, however, we have to carefully evaluate, plan and prepare programs and projects that will provide the best value for our resources. Doing so requires gathering data on all aspects of the municipality. The more comprehensive the data, the better. The validity or reliability of the gathered data serves as basis for a well prepared development plan. Because of this, when we first had the opportunity to work with the CBMS Network Coordinating Team in March of 2003, we decided soon enough then to implement the CBMS in Sta. Elena. More specifically, we made our decision on the basis of three reasons. One was to establish a database (in our case, a social sector database) that is best suited to our needs and comprehensive enough to be expandable to other sectors. Two was because the CBMS has a Geographic Information System (GIS) component that is more readily appreciated by our decisionmakers. And three was due to the complimentary provision by the CBMS of a software called the CBMS-Natural Resource Database (NRDB). Given that commercial GIS softwares offered today in the market are very expensive, this was indeed a welcome development.

Training on data collection
Training for the data collection commenced in May of 2003. We utilized more than 50 enumerators coming from the ranks of barangay workers and officials picked by the barangay captains. By the end of August 2003, the process of data collection was completed.

Training for data processing, meanwhile, was held on June 10, 2003. An orientation on computer data processing as well as an introduction to the GIS software of the CBMS were included in the training. Our computers at that time were unable to process the data due to the specification requirements of the software. To address this problem, we procured a computer from our savings from municipal capital outlays.

The data encoding for the CBMS database was completed in April 2004 with 7,521 household information encoded. We could have finished
it earlier but we were able to utilize only two encoders with two computers. Moreover, said encoders and computers were not exclusively utilized for the program but for other office work as well.

**Spot maps and GIS**

Aside from data collection and processing, the enumerators were also tasked to prepare their barangay spot maps because they already knew the number of households, the location of infrastructure and other facilities such as roads and buildings, and the purok boundaries. Most of them experienced difficulties though in accomplishing this task due to their lack of adequate skills in mapping. As a result, most of the submitted maps needed to be redrawn and validated since the preparation of said maps focused more on the features (household, facilities, roads, rivers). Furthermore, most of the spot maps were not similar to the barangay maps released by the Bureau of Lands.

Local government units (LGUs) regularly make decisions on geographically-related issues ranging from land development to environmental health, peace and order or basic service delivery. For LGUs, the GIS is increasingly becoming an important tool because it combines geographic data (locations of man-made and natural features) and information like names, addresses, classification, and coordinates to generate maps for visualization and analysis. Moreover, GIS-generated reports and digitized map presentations are readily appreciated and better understood by both decisionmakers and laymen.

At that time, there was no available digitized map of our locality so we had to create one. With the CBMS program utilizing the NRDB software (mapping software), the challenge was to create a map of our municipality which is reliably aligned with the global coordinates.

Even with limited knowledge of this software, we decided to create digitized maps based on existing paper maps. We tried different methods and eventually had a respectable output utilizing a copying machine. By photocopying a topographic map, a coordinate or geo-reference can be established on the duplicate. Political boundaries can then be manually drawn on the duplicate using the barangay index maps as another
reference. It is also important to place 4 cross hairs with corresponding coordinates on the duplicate. Once completed, the size of the map was reduced to fit a single page for scanning. Grid lines were then drawn and distributed evenly which served as reference for overlaying other features once the object has been digitized. To get better results, it is advisable to clean or erase other unnecessary contour lines by utilizing other softwares like Paintbrush.

Again, after some trials, we were also able to digitize the municipal political map by overlaying it in the NRDB software. We achieved a fairly respectable composition of the digitized map using drawing grids as basis for manually adding features such as political boundary, roads and rivers.

**Global positioning system**

To enable us to have a more accurate representation of our municipality complete with its various landmarks and resources, we also made use of the so-called Global Positioning System (GPS). GPS is a system for providing worldwide velocity information and extremely accurate three-dimensional positioning. It is a system of satellites and receiving devices used to compute positions on the earth. GPS is used in navigation and its precision supports cadastral surveying.

A coastal municipality such as Sta. Elena has municipal waters as part of its territory. A task force composed of deputized fish wardens popularly known as *Bantay Dagat* is in charge of patrolling these waters and in apprehending illegal fishermen. During instances where illegal fishermen are caught, it is necessary to establish that the location where they were apprehended is within the territorial water boundary of the municipality. A GPS receiver unit is therefore useful for them and was in fact provided to the task force to assist them in establishing their location.

In addition, we gathered GPS readings to establish the location of landmarks in the municipality particularly roads that intersect the municipal boundary. In utilizing GPS readings, we were able to improve the accuracy of our digitized map by comparing the coordinates of
municipal boundaries crossing the national road and the map overlay that we did manually. By continuously compiling GPS readings of existing known landmarks and roads by barangay, we will be able to edit and correct our digitized map to include purok boundaries and households.

**CBMS status in Sta. Elena**

And what is the current status of the CBMS work in Sta. Elena? At the moment, the municipality has already completed the computer data processing of the results. Validation of the outputs is ongoing. The CBMS database is currently being used as reference for ongoing programs such as the Fifth Country Program for Children (CPCV), a child-friendly movement. The municipality uses the database not only for development planning but also for updating its Municipal Socioeconomic Profile.

In the meantime, the digitized mapping for three barangays has already been completed. The rest of the barangays will soon finish their digitized mapping of household, roads and purok boundaries.

There are also plans to conduct a CBMS survey for the municipality of Sta. Elena in 2005 which will include other sectors, particularly agriculture.

**Concluding remarks**

In view of the scarce resources available to LGUs, it becomes all the more important for them to have access to the best available tool that will maximize their output. We have to learn to maximize our available resources and to be creative and resourceful in achieving our goals by taking advantage of available opportunities such as the CBMS program.

We expect to use the CBMS-generated data – which will be validated from time to time – in projecting trends in development as well as in optimizing the utilization of resources to achieve a marked improvement in the welfare status of our constituents.
Introduction
Having the distinction of being the first municipality in the province of Camarines Norte to have used and implemented the community-based monitoring system (CBMS), I am happy and honored to share with you our municipality’s experience on the application of CBMS data, in particular, in the preparation of the socioeconomic profile of the municipality of Labo and of project proposals. I shall, likewise, share some of the lessons that we have learned from such experience.

Applications of CBMS
The general objective of the CBMS is, of course, to provide our policy/decisionmakers with regular and frequent information on the possible impacts of policies on the welfare of households, especially those belonging to the vulnerable groups. In addition to this, we have the more specific objective of having the CBMS provide a tool in the monitoring and evaluation of the impact of projects and programs as well as for better local governance. Its use in the preparation of socioeconomic profiles (SEPs) and project proposals is related to this specific objective.

Since I started working as a planner, there had been various tools, systems, formats and presentations used in the preparation and presentation of municipal socioeconomic profiles. In recent years, too,
there had been significant changes in the tools used for presentation. For example, previous SEPs had more tables and graphs in terms of presentation but with the use of the CBMS, new features have been introduced such as the GIS-based mapping wherein data and information are graphically presented in maps. The difference between the presentation of the results using the previous tools and those using the CBMS tools may be seen in these data taken from a Minimum Basic Needs (MBN) survey in Labo. Using the previous tools of presentation, the data based on thirty-three indicators are shown in tables through columns of “unmet needs” and “met needs”. With the use of the CBMS MIMAP tools, however, the intensity of each indicator or concern is reflected as the distribution of the population with said unmet or met needs is shown with the use of maps and color codes.

Moreover, in the CBMS MIMAP presentations, the thirty-three indicators were organized and presented by Poverty Core Indicators as indicated in the DILG Memorandum Circular No. 2003-93 where, for instance, in health, we only concentrated on the child mortality rate for children ages 0-5 years old; in nutrition, only the prevalence of malnutrition for children ages 0-6 years old; in housing, the proportion of households living in non-makeshift housing; and so on and so forth.

With CBMS, therefore, the preparation of Municipal Plans is more focused in addressing the issues and concerns relative to the results of the data and information generated by the activity. Thus, as the results show, objective-setting in program planning becomes easier, not only during the planning period but also during the implementation and monitoring/evaluation phases of the development plans.

It is also easier for every office to make and defend its own proposals because the data and information gathered are based on the actual and up-to-date survey results. Prioritization of programs and projects is also facilitated with the use of maps. For instance, in terms of the situation relating to various municipalities’ access to safe and clean water, as shown through the colors in the map, those municipalities shown in red mean that they are the very problematic areas with very minimal or no access at all to safe water. And it is easy to validate the
data because one needs only to go to the area concerned and check and interview the people/residents. The process thus becomes even more participatory in nature.

This is all very useful for the project proposal preparation phase because the data on hand are dependable, up-to-date and can easily be validated. Accordingly, the implementation and monitoring thereafter of the projects and programs are made easier as well. In the case of the municipality of Labo, we can cite a number of examples such as the identification of certain road construction projects in specific areas to provide access for farmers to certain markets where they can take and sell their goods and produce. This contributes to the alleviation of poverty in areas clearly identified as poor as shown in the maps and where causes of and probable solutions/assistance to the situation were determined through the results of the CBMS data and information.

**Lessons learned**

Of course, there are many other areas where the CBMS MIMAP data and information can prove to be very useful such as in the areas of Family Planning Program, Basic Education Development Program, Health and Nutrition Development Program, Housing Program, Peace and Order Development Program and others. We have the information that are needed. However, there may also be certain factors that could serve as constraints and may in turn limit the range of possibilities for the use and application of the CBMS. As such, let me take this opportunity to cite the lessons that we can gather from our experience in Labo in the use of the CBMS so that whatever potential constraints that may crop up, may easily be anticipated and addressed.

One important lesson is the significance of *training*. Granting that the information are available, they may just be rendered useless, however, if the ability to analyze and interpret their meaning and implications is missing or inadequate. That is why it is very important to have the appropriate training. Technical assistance from the CBMS team and other relevant agencies is therefore very important especially in the use and application of the GIS-based maps. Every map can be
generally useful in every aspect of planning because it can show the real situation and status of the area being presented.

Another critical lesson learned is the need for a strong political commitment by the local government leadership at all levels —purok, barangay and municipality. This is especially crucial given that local elections take place every 3 years and leaders may change and the continuity of programs may at times be compromised. As such, it becomes a challenge to have a program whose applications and impacts are recognized to be useful not only in the present time but also in the future such as in the preparation of future development plans. The CBMS and its results are recognized to be useful not only for present purposes but also for future undertakings. As such, its institutionalization as a tool for planning and project prioritization and proposal preparation aside from being a tool for profiling may go a long way in ensuring continuing commitment by the local leadership. The Department of Interior and Local Governments should play a key role in this.

Finally, funding for the continuing implementation of the CBMS as well as the allocation of funds to finance the interventions required to address the concerns identified through the CBMS has to be ensured. While certain political and socioeconomic conditions sometimes tend to put the conduct of surveys in a lower rung of priorities in terms of funding, the importance of having accurate, timely and up-to-date data and information must be stressed to approving budgetary bodies as basic requirements in planning and program prioritization. Otherwise, the whole CBMS activity may just be an exercise in futility.
The MIMAP-CBMS Network Coordinating Team has chosen a perfect time to introduce the Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS) to the local government units in Camarines Norte sometime in October 2002. Without any knowledge on the existence of MIMAP and the Community-Based Monitoring System as a mechanism in data gathering, planning and targeting programs for the poor, the Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator of Talisay, Camarines Norte was initially hesitant to adopt CBMS in the municipality for two obvious reasons: (1) the municipal officials might not positively respond to the program; and (2) the funds available to implement the program are limited. Nevertheless, the local chief executive scheduled a meeting between Dr. Celia Reyes of MIMAP and the Sangguniang Bayan members and other heads of local government unit (LGU) offices who showed interest in the program.

From the moment the Sangguniang Bayan resolution was approved and the local chief executive signed the memorandum of agreement to provide technical assistance to the CBMS project sometime in June 2003, the office of the Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator (MPDC) has never been busier preparing the documents needed to ensure that the LGU provided the funding as well as selecting qualified counterpart personnel who will handle other aspects of the CBMS implementation.

* Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator, Talisay, Camarines Norte.
The CBMS implementation stage started in Talisay with a training of community volunteer enumerators on July 7-9, 2003. This was participated in by barangay officials and health workers from 15 composite barangays of the municipality. This was followed by a joint Manual Data Processing training with enumerators from the municipality of San Vicente. The two LGUs pooled their resources for the August 18-19, 2003 training, with the MIMAP-CBMS Network Coordinating Team as resource persons.

Although the deadline for the submission of the accomplished and tallied survey questionnaires was scheduled three months after the Manual Data Processing training and the LGU managed to provide barangay enumerators with honoraria, three barangays were late in their submission. It was only in April of 2004 when all 15 barangays completed all documents, including the barangay tally sheets. The MPDC office retrieved the unfinished questionnaires from the three barangays and handed these over to students hired for the summer job project, “LGUs Special Program for the Employment of Students (SPES).” These students eventually completed the survey and tally sheets.

At present, all 15 barangays have also completed the spot maps and have undergone validation of the documents and data gathered in preparation for the “Training on the Preparation of the Socioeconomic Profile” on September 9-10, 2004.

The CBMS has so far been very useful to the LGU, especially to the office of the MPDC. For instance, information on population, education, health and sanitation were submitted as the municipal’s entry to the Provincial Search for Child-Friendly Barangays.

Now that the LGU has also applied and qualified for the Infrastructure for Rural Productivity Enhancement Sector (InfRES) Project—a government project with funds coming from the Asian Development Bank and the Department of Agriculture, and focused on poverty reduction and improvement of agriculture—the CBMS data have likewise become handy. The MPDC is thankful for the updated data on the number of households below poverty threshold level,
demographic data, households with access to potable water, per capita income of households and many more.

The LGU is also currently updating its Socioeconomic and Physical Profile (SEPP), which will be submitted to the National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA) and to the Regional Development Council. Once again, the CBMS data will be very useful.

Other useful data already gathered are those on Persons with Disabilities as well as on graduates of medical courses such as doctors, midwives and nurses in different barangays who could help in the LGU programs, “Home Help for the Aged” and the “Home Treatment for the Seriously Ill”.

The CBMS Team also established an information databank for the youth (aged 0 to below 17 years old) on vaccination received, pre-school education, youth disabilities, out-of-school youths and working children. There is also a separate databank on different occupations, employment status, available manpower and other industry-related labor and employment information useful to the Public Employment and Service Office (PESO) in the municipality.

All in all, there are a lot to gain from the implementation of the CBMS. Since foreign and locally funded projects oblige the LGU to comply with rigid and time-bound requirements and documentations before the latter could avail of such programs, the LGU is thankful for the presence of the CBMS data as a source of countless reliable information. With all records of the LGU gone when a fire razed down the municipal building in April 2003, the CBMS data are indeed a blessing from heaven.
Introduction
The Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS) was introduced in the Municipality of Basud, Camarines in the year 2003. Information about it first came from the Provincial Planning & Development Office where the wife of our Local Chief Executive is working. The mayor then instructed his Municipal Planning & Development Coordinator (MPDC) to see whether CBMS would have a significant impact on the socioeconomic development of the municipality. Soon after, the LGU of Basud signified its intention to the CBMS International Network to adopt the CBMS in its municipality. The project was envisioned to provide an organized set of information for policymaking and program implementation at all geopolitical levels and to update information on the welfare status and needs of the community to effect good governance.

The municipality started the activities of CBMS in August 2003, with the CBMS team providing training to enumerators of the 29 barangays of Basud. The Basud local government unit provided the supplies and materials used during the training period. After the training, survey activities started simultaneously in the 29 barangays.

Best practices
Among the challenges – and accordingly, the best practices – experienced by Basud from the CBMS exercise are:

---

* Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator, Basud, Camarines Norte.
1. **LGU partnership between the municipal and barangay governments**
   The CBMS work led to a closer working partnership between the municipal and barangay governments. The Municipal and the Barangay Development Councils both provided human and financial resources with the Municipal Planning & Development Office (MPDO) and the community leaders and volunteers acting as key players in the implementation of the project.

2. **Full support from the municipal and barangay officials**
   The Sangguniang Bayan and Barangays appropriated counterpart funds for the conduct of CBMS activities. The municipality appropriated almost P100,000.00 at the start of the project while each barangay appropriated P5,000.00 which was charged from its respective Barangay Development Fund. From the appropriated amount, supplies and materials, honorarium of enumerators, purchase of one (1) unit computer and other operating expenses were disbursed.

3. **Liga ng mga Barangay as co-partner of the project**
   The Liga ng mga Barangay is one of the key players in the implementation of the project. The amount of P145,000.00 (P5,000.00/barangay) barangay counterpart was lodged to the Liga through the Liga Treasurer. Disbursement of funds for the project depended on the activities. The MPDO served as the requesting official in every transaction. The Liga Board approved the program of works presented as basis for the implementation. No problems were encountered and the project is being smoothly implemented today.

4. **Barangay consultation and field validation**
   The CBMS was introduced to the community through an assembly. The Municipal Technical Working Group (MTWG) of CBMS discussed to the public what the project is all about
with a short presentation made followed by a dialogue. After the survey was conducted, field validation was made to confirm whether or not the data are true and correct.

5. **Support of National Government Agencies**
   The Department of Education through its school head, the Department of Health through its DOH representative, the TESDA, PNP and other entities extended full support to the project by providing technical assistance. They served as members of the Technical Working Group to facilitate the smooth implementation of the project. The teacher who was assigned in the project also helped the Barangay Secretary in formulating the narrative report of the survey which resulted in the barangay socioeconomic profile.

6. **Regular conduct of monitoring & evaluation**
   The MTWG conducted regular monitoring of the project. The MPDC also rendered a report to the Municipal Development Council and to the Liga ng mga Barangay to update them on the status of the project.

**Lessons learned**
The CBMS experience taught us a number of lessons, both on the positive and negative perspectives. Hopefully, these will help us and other LGUs be better prepared next time to cope with whatever possible difficulties that may be encountered.

The two key lessons gathered are:

1. **Lack of participation of a number of the community residents (in the negative aspect)**
   Some interview respondents did not fully cooperate with the enumerators. Most of the time, they were hesitant to answer some questions particularly those that inquire about their income thinking that the Bureau of Internal Revenue (BIR) might go
after them if they are not declaring the right income. This problem was encountered in all barangays of the municipality.

2. Very useful and informative (in the positive side)
   The municipal and barangay government found the project very useful and informative, particularly to their legislative and policymaking functions. It creates and maintains a databank in all levels which could be used as reference in planning and budgeting. Results were used in day-to-day transactions such as in the issuance of certificates of residency and poor income level, and other purposes. Results could also be used by our political leaders for their own consumption and reference.

   In the preparation of the annual development and investment plans, CBMS was used as the basic reference of all planners at all levels. The Municipal Development Council (MDC) and Barangay Development Council (BDC) formulated plans, programs and activities based on what is really needed by their constituents.

   In summary, utilizing the CBMS for local governance is a great help to all LGUs that are always looking forward to their socioeconomic development. Special thanks is therefore being fully extended to the CBMS Team who shared their precious time and talent to the municipality of Basud, Camarines Norte for the realization of this project.
Introduction
The Municipal Planning and Development Office (MPDO) is responsible, among others, for the implementation of various national, provincial and municipal programs. Thus, when the CBMS, as a tool in planning, prioritization and monitoring, was implemented in the municipality of Labo, Camarines Norte, the MPDO was ready to respond to the needs in the implementation despite its (MPDO) limited human and financial resources.

Today, the community-based monitoring system (CBMS) activities in Labo are ongoing and running smoothly. In this regard, I am happy to share with you the various steps and strategies that we put in place for the implementation of the CBMS in our municipality.

The beginning
The most critical factors in the CBMS implementation are the human and financial requirements. When we started the CBMS project in Labo in 2003, we had to maximize our available resources in order to sustain and facilitate the smooth implementation of the project. We would like to thank our Local Chief Executive, Mayor Winifredo B. Oco, the Sangguniang Bayan of Labo, Camarines Norte and the CBMS-Technical Working Group for giving their all-out support for this project. Indeed,
our efforts were fruitful as the CBMS proved to be very useful as a management tool for local governance.

After a series of consultations with members of the Municipal Development Council, the Sangguniang Bayan passed a resolution authorizing Mayor Oco to sign a memorandum of agreement (MOA) with the CBMS Network Coordinating Team represented by its Network Leader, Dr. Celia M. Reyes. Thereafter, Mayor Oco issued Executive Order No. 04-2003 “Directing the Institutionalization of the CBMS under the MIMAP-CBMS Project in Labo, Camarines Norte, Elaborating the Coverage, Functions and Responsibilities of Each Level from Purok to Municipal and their Expected Output.” He also signed Memorandum Circular No. 023-2003 creating the CBMS Technical Working Group (CBMS-TWG) and its working committees for the implementation of CBMS. The members of the TWG were composed of different personnel from the different offices in the municipality. They also served as district supervisors and monitored the CBMS data collection at the barangay level.

The following are the CBMS-TWG’s key functions:

1. Monitor the progress of the CBMS data collection on a weekly basis;
2. Assist the barangay CBMS team leader in resolving problems encountered;
3. Always remind enumerators about the importance of barangay spot maps during the field data collection;
4. Cross-check the entries in the questionnaires weekly;
5. Submit the results of the survey weekly to the municipal level; and
6. Other administrative functions such as reproduction of forms and provision of supplies and materials for training programs.

Activities in CBMS implementation

Enumeration and data collection

The next step was to assign and train enumerators for the data collection process. There were 223 enumerators assigned to the 52 barangays of
Labo. The number of CBMS enumerators per barangay varied according to the number of households residing in it. For example, 5 to 8 enumerators were assigned to 7 barangays with more than 500 households. On the other hand, 3 to 4 enumerators were assigned to three barangays which have 400 to 499 households. Eleven barangays with 300 to 399 households were assigned 3 enumerators each. Fourteen barangays with 200 to 299 households were allocated 2 to 3 enumerators each. Lastly, 17 barangays with less than 200 households were given 2 enumerators each.

**Who were the CBMS enumerators?**

The enumerators who were tapped to do the survey were barangay officials and resident volunteers from the barangays who are familiar with the communities and their residents. These include Barangay Councilors, the Secretary, and members of the Sangguniang Kabataan (SK) as well as key leaders in the community like health workers, nutrition scholars, day care workers and purok officials.

Forty beneficiaries of the Special Program for the Employment of Students (SPES) were also tapped to help. Their involvement was very timely because the SPES is an annual program implemented during the months of April and May which coincided with the data collection and processing activities of the CBMS.

**Training on data collection**

Training was an essential component for the success of the data collection. There were two batches of training for data collection. A total of 138 participants attended the first batch of training on March 24-26, 2003 while 164 enumerators attended the second batch of training on March 27-29, 2003.

**CBMS data collection strategies**

To facilitate a smooth data collection process, we adopted various strategies, to wit:
1. An open letter signed by the Mayor was given to every household soliciting its full cooperation.
2. Identification cards signed by Mayor Oco and Dr. Celia Reyes were provided to CBMS enumerators.
3. Division of the 52 barangays into 8 Districts and assigning of a member of the Labo CBMS-TWG in each district to oversee and monitor the progress of data collection were effected.

The data collection was completed in one month, from March 28-April 30.

Data processing
After the collection of data was completed, the data had to be processed. The local government of Labo adopted both manual and computerized processing of CBMS data.

Manual data processing
The manual data processing was crucial in order to come up with preliminary data for the set of 14 CBMS core indicators. There were at least 2 data processors from each barangay composed of barangay volunteers and 1 SPES beneficiary. A total of 140 processors from 50 barangays underwent a two-day training on data processing of completed questionnaires on May 8-9, 2003.

Computerized data processing
Meanwhile, on April 23-26, 2003, five members of the CBMS-TWG were trained to be trainors on computerized data encoding and processing of CBMS data. Likewise, training on digitizing and creating indicator maps using CBMS-NRDB, were also conducted.

These trainors, together with the CBMS Coordinating Team, were able to train the remaining 2 barangays that opted for immediate computerized processing since they have computers in their respective barangays. The office of the MPDC also utilized 30 practicum students in data processing. Their tasks included the re-checking of the results
of the manual data processing submitted by the barangay, encoding of accomplished questionnaires, and digitizing of spot maps.

**Validation of CBMS data at the barangay level**

The processed data were then validated by the staff of the MPDC and the members of the CBMS-TWG in all the barangays of the municipality. Maps and summary tables were used to present the data and the participants from the barangay validated whether the results indeed showed the true situation of their barangay. Explanations for such conditions were discussed and interventions were suggested to address the identified problems.

**Preparation of the Barangay SEPs**

The last training conducted was a two-day writing workshop wherein the validated CBMS data were used to draft the first barangay socioeconomic profiles. The training was held on Sept. 29-30, 2003 and participated in by 3 persons per barangay. The draft SEPs also included the major problems identified in the barangay, alternative courses of action, notes on development planning and existing projects and programs. Practicum students were also tapped to encode the draft barangay SEPs.

**Documenting the financial resources requirements**

And how much was involved in all these activities? A series of consultations with the Municipal Budget Officer and the Sangguniang Bayan Committee on Finance Budget and Appropriations were held prior to the CBMS implementation. These resulted in the budget allocation of P263,824.00 for the CBMS implementation in the municipality.

Box 1 is the summary of actual expenses incurred during the first round of CBMS implementation. The total cost of P 431,523.34 or P27.18 per household for the implementation of the CBMS was shared by the municipality and the barangays.

Apart from the abovementioned expenses, we made use of whatever other available resources that we already had and were needed. For instance, there was no allocation for computers to process and encode
the CBMS data. However, we utilized existing computers available in different offices in the municipality. Aside from the three computers in the MPDC office, we also utilized the computers from the following offices: the budget office, the agriculture office, the MSWD office and the mayor’s office. We also utilized three computers from barangays San Francisco, Gumamela and Tulay na Lupa.

At the same time, we tapped graduating practicum students to encode the data from CBMS questionnaires during their available days, mostly Saturdays and Sundays. We also assigned two computer technicians who were responsible for trouble-shooting and maintenance of computers.

### Box 1. Summary of Actual Expenses During the 1st Round of CBMS Implementation in Labo, Camarines Norte

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Municipal Counterpart</strong></th>
<th><strong>(Average = P4,245.64/brgy)</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training on Data Collection and Processing</td>
<td>P155,020.00*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Validation Exercises</td>
<td>2,168.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reproduction of Forms (questionnaire/manuals)</td>
<td>61,985.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traveling Expenses</td>
<td>1,600.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>P220,773.34</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Barangay Counterpart</strong></td>
<td><strong>(Average = P4,052.88/brgy)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allowance for enumerators (P10.00/hh)</td>
<td>P158,750.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training on Drafting SEP (P1,000.00/brgy)</td>
<td>52,000.00*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sub-Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>P210,750.00</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Grand Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>P431,523.34 or P27.18 per household</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: The cost of the subsequent implementation of CBMS will be approximately P224,503.34 or P14.14 per household assuming that the same enumerators will be tapped for the next round of survey.*
Advocacy and Information Dissemination

The results, no matter how well-documented, analyzed and processed they are, will be rendered useless if they are not properly disseminated to potential users. In this regard, the LGU-Labo, Camarines Norte used five major strategies to reach and regularly update the stakeholders in CBMS institutionalization, to wit:

1. Presentation of CBMS and its results during the Municipal Development Council (MDC) meetings.
2. Consultation/lobbying with the local chief executive and legislative body during its committee meetings.
3. Appearance and interview at the local community radio (DWLB-FM 89.7 Mega Hertz) located at the 3rd floor of the Municipal Building.
4. Regular updates of CBMS activities in “BALITANGLAW”, a local publication of the LGU.
5. Information dissemination during the regular information service of the municipality including a caravan to 52 barangays, a year-round activity of the LGU-Labo.

Capacity-building in Local Governance

Finally, as the pioneer municipality in the province to implement CBMS, the Labo CBMS-TWG had been invited on several occasions by other municipalities to share their experiences in the CBMS implementation. Some members of the Labo CBMS-TWG had also been invited as resource speakers in other municipalities during their trainings on CBMS data collection and processing (Sta.Elena, San Vicente, Talisay and San Lorenzo). In addition, the Barangay Captain of Brgy. Kalamunding was also invited to share their CBMS experience in the seminar on Participatory Local Governance hosted by the Social Development Research Center of De La Salle University on December 3, 2003. And Mayor Winifredo Oco himself was invited to share his experience as a policymaker in using CBMS as a tool for governance at the Poverty and Economic Policy (PEP) conference in Dakar, Senegal on June 16-20, 2004.
As far as the data are concerned, meanwhile, the final CBMS results were presented in the Participatory Planning Workshop for the formulation of the MTMDP & ELA CY 2005-2010. The CBMS data were also used by other accredited NGOs and POs in the municipality as reference materials in crafting their project proposals.

All these further helped in building the capacity of the local governments in Labo for greater governance and service delivery to their constituents.
The benefits of the Community-based Monitoring System (CBMS) at the barangay level can be shown in the experience of Barangay Kalamunding in Labo, Camarines Norte. Below is a brief description of the results of the CBMS survey and some of the improvements in the welfare status of the barangay residents as a result of the interventions set up in response to the needs and problems identified from the CBMS survey results.

**Health and nutrition**

The results of the CBMS survey helped in identifying the critical areas for intervention in the health and nutrition area. As such, a number of employment and livelihood opportunities were made available to household heads in the community. This brought about a decrease in the number of households that experienced food shortage.

Barangay Kalamunding was also able to establish a *Task Force Clean and Green* as well as a *Health Patrol* headed by the Barangay Chairman and other officials of the barangay to address the other identified health and nutrition problems.

The number of malnourished children in the barangay also appears to be declining as a result of the Supplemental Feeding Program.

---

* Barangay Chairman (Village Captain), Barangay Kalamunding, Labo, Camarines Norte.
implemented by the barangay. The results of the CBMS survey also prodded the parents in the community to attend to the health needs of their children such that more children aged 0-5 years old are no longer malnourished.

Day Care enrollment has also increased. The barangay was also able to construct a Health Center with the assistance of Congressman Renato Unico, Jr.

**Water and sanitation**

In terms of access to safe drinking water, the barangay did not seem to have a problem as all households in the barangay had access to it. However, the number of households that do not have access to sanitary toilet facilities was considerably large (Figure 1). Because of this, the Sangguniang Bayan spearheaded the distribution of toilet bowls, thereupon leading to a decrease in the number of households without access to this facility. The Sangguniang Barangay also passed a resolution enjoining the residents to participate in the cleanliness campaign of the barangay.

**Literacy and education**

The CBMS data showed that participation in elementary and secondary education is considerably low. In response to this problem, scholarship programs are now available for deserving residents of the barangay who were not able to finish their education. This has encouraged the youth in the barangay to participate in the activities of the Sangguniang Kabataan.

In terms of literacy, even though the barangay registered a high rate, they still implemented a Literacy Training Service that has benefited the elderly in the community who do not know how to read and write.

**Income and employment**

A significant percentage of residents in the barangay are unemployed as shown in the CBMS survey results (Figure 2). Related to this, a low proportion of households with income greater than the poverty and food thresholds was registered by the barangay.
This has prompted the barangay government to initiate livelihood programs in cooperation with the municipal government and other government agencies. A number of residents of the community were also employed under the *Kalsada Natin, Aalagaan Natin (road maintenance) Program* which was launched by President Gloria Macapagal-Arroyo in 2003. This has helped in increasing the number of employed persons thereby resulting in a decrease in the number of poor households.

**Housing**

The barangay registered a very low proportion of households living in makeshift housing. Likewise, it also registered a low proportion of households who are squatters.
Peace and order
The results of the CBMS survey showed that only one household in the barangay fell victim to burglary and theft during the previous year. This and other problems were immediately referred to the Lupong Tagapamayapa.

Programs implemented
The following programs were implemented in response to the issues and concerns shown in the CBMS results:
1. Establishment of a barangay cooperative;
2. Establishment of Task Force Clean and Green, Health Patrol and implementation of “Tapat Ko, Linis Ko” program;
3. Implementation of a supplemental feeding program;
4. Provision of scholarship grants to deserving students;
5. Financing program;
6. Housing Program for the informal settlers in the barangay; and
6. Construction of a health center in the barangay.

Aside from helping identify programs, the implementation of CBMS in Barangay Kalamunding has also brought many benefits to the community including helping the barangay win several awards, among which are:
1. Child-Friendly Barangay Awardee (2nd Place, Municipal Winner);
2. Katarungang Pambarangay (Municipal Winner); and
3. Katarungang Pambarangay (CY 2004 Regional Winner and currently competing at the national level).

**Conclusion**
The results of the CBMS implementation in Barangay Kalamunding, Labo, Camarines Norte helped to document the development and welfare situation in the said barangay. They also proved to be very helpful in diagnosing the extent and causes of poverty in the area, thereby enabling the local leaders to come up with appropriate interventions. Moreover, the CBMS became instrumental in the barangay’s victory and selection as winner of several local-level competition awards.
Views from New CBMS Partners
Everyday, we are faced with the perennial problem of poverty. In our city of Pasay, it is sad to note that a high percentage of our people are poor. The most basic problem of providing food on the table is the daily battle being fought by the residents. While it is true that most of our predecessors have already identified the depressed areas in the city, the approach used, however, to address the concerns of poverty has mostly been the “shotgun approach” where they aim the shotgun, pull the trigger, then pull the trigger again and cross their fingers with the hope that at least one shot hits all targets.

When I assumed office in 2000, all the officials and department heads in Pasay crossed all political alliances and buckled down to work to formulate our vision together. We assessed and mobilized our existing resources, including the human and technical resources. Since then, we have been implementing a consistent platform of government that centers on a six-point agenda namely: health, education, peace and order, employment, housing, and good governance. These 6 major thrusts are all aimed at alleviating the plight of our people. All six major services are tied up towards our goal of poverty reduction and of empowering our Pasay residents.

In one of our regular executive planning workshops where we do visioning and come up with various ideas to study or adopt programs

---

* Local Chief Executive, Pasay City.
and projects, one of our department heads, Rolando Londonio, who has been instrumental in reaping awards for our city such as the Gawad Galing Pook Awards for our city-wide Bayanihan Banking Program, presented us with the idea of the CBMS. Right there and then, we knew that the CBMS will be good for Pasay. Not only will we be able to determine the actual number of our poor people; we will also be able to diagnose the extent of poverty and determine its causes and formulate appropriate and relevant policies to address it.

I believe CBMS is very timely and we have agreed with the CBMS coordinating body to implement the program in Pasay beginning 2005 onwards.

As of today, we have created a technical working group, in coordination with the CBMS team, that is finalizing the survey instruments. The training on data collection and data processing will commence in October and will be pilot-tested in selected strategic barangays. We hope to partner with church-based NGOs (as what we did for our Bayanihan Banking Program) to preserve the integrity and transparency of the data collected. The full implementation will be in 2005.

We acknowledge the urgent need to keep our barangays informed; thus, to adopt this program, we shall be providing each barangay with an information board. The information board will display each barangay’s vicinity map and the vision of the city will be highlighted. Likewise, through the information board, barangay officials will be reminded of their responsibilities and families will be encouraged to have their own and participate in the developmental programs. The information board will also showcase inspiring stories of community leaders and outstanding citizens of the barangays.

We had a successful bayanihan program in Pasay. The adoption of the CBMS is aimed at this same spirit in our Pasay barangays. Thank you for sharing that spirit with us.
There are three key reasons why the provincial government of Bulacan has decided to adopt the community-based monitoring system (CBMS) province-wide. One is to ensure the availability of up-to-date, relevant and accurate data from all its constituent units as basis in making development plans, measuring development outcomes and monitoring welfare status. Two is to maintain the overall high quality of life in Bulacan as measured in terms of the human development index. One of CBMS’ advantages is its capacity to pinpoint where the gaps in terms of access to services and facilities are. And three is to help improve the tax base in Bulacan. While the provincial government of Bulacan had been using a satellite-based geographic information system (GIS) in enhancing its property tax-information system, what it lacks is the so-called ground level information or “house-tagging” set of information. We believe that this can be provided through the application of the CBMS, thereupon becoming very instrumental in improving our tax base.

Because we believe that the adoption and use of the CBMS will truly be beneficial, we have convened the municipal mayors to brief them on the system and to get their commitments for an agreed-upon 50-50 percent sharing of the costs of implementation of the CBMS. For

---

* Provincial Planning and Development Coordinator, Provincial Government of Bulacan.
we believe that the principle of sharing in terms of costs and rewards should be the spirit by which our programs ought to stand on.

To date, we have already finalized our survey instrument. One good thing about CBMS is we were able to customize our questionnaires depending on our needs. That is why we have inputted tax base information so that we could get what we really need when it comes to household tagging.

One good thing about this conference is that we will be able to learn from the experiences of other local government units that have implemented the CBMS ahead of Bulacan. Their experiences will guide us so that we will not repeat the same mistakes as well as provide some inputs on how we could further facilitate the smooth implementation of CBMS in our province. With the aid of CBMS, we hope to live up to the expectation of being one of the provinces in the country that has the lowest poverty incidence.
Last September 21, my department heads and the Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG) were discussing the results of the Local Governance Performance Management System (LGPMS) as contained in the draft State of Local Governance Report. Inspite of a series of consultations that were conducted in coming up with an acceptable assessment, some of Mandaue City’s department heads did not agree with some of the findings of the LGPMS.

The LGPMS measures the performance levels of local government units through pre-selected development indicators in five service areas, namely, social services, economic services, environmental protection services, legislative services, and governance and administrative services. The disagreement over the ratings came about due to the absence of reliable primary data disaggregated at the city level.

The lack of a databank containing primary data at the LGU level is a common obstacle among local government units in formulating development plans. This has hampered the formulation of strategies for the effective and efficient delivery of basic services and usually results in hitting the wrong clientele and having unresponsive priorities.

The lack of benchmark data to measure performance levels is also a stumbling block to the advocacy of transparency and accountability. While the LGPMS of the DILG is a good tool in performance

---

* Local Chief Executive, Mandaue City, Cebu. The speech was read by Mr. Serafin Blanco, City Administrator.
measurement, the quality of its outcomes depends on the quality and reliability of the inputted data. This is where the CBMS can resolve and close this gap. It will complement the LGPMS initiative.

The act of governing becomes meaningful only if there is a point of departure from where development outcomes are measured at the end of the line. Success in governance does not take place by accident. It is a product of well-planned actions based on given development indicators and success indicators.

In a recent gathering of financial executives all over the country, where I represented Honorable Jerry Treñas, our President in the League of Cities in the Philippines, the theme “LGU Performance Benchmarks: Bridges to Good Local Governance” reflected the importance of establishing benchmark data at the LGU level as a foundation to the establishment of a realistic and credible performance measurement system.

We definitely need reliable data to have this and thus, our entry into the community-based monitoring network speaks of our desire to be able to know where we are in terms of performance in the delivery of basic services and to determine who the poor are among our constituents and where they are located. In the process, we hope to be able to rationalize our strategy in the delivery of basic services, giving more priority to where basic services are more needed.

The CBMS is part and parcel of our desire to let development assume a face and an address and to deliver services where they are needed. More specifically, too, the CBMS complements many of our ongoing projects and will allow us to see where government intervention is and has been most responsive. In this regard, we are ready to start the implementation of the CBMS in Mandaue City next month.
Comments from National Government Agencies
Local governments as champions of CBMS

Oskar Balbastro*

Introduction

A major effort behind development in the context of the Philippines should be the fight against poverty. The fight against poverty should take prominence over that of other crises because poverty and its attendant debilitating conditions of helplessness and malnutrition are already staring at us in the face.

Within the framework provided by the Local Government Code (LGC), the fight against poverty increasingly takes the form of local government intervention which in turn calls for additional local budget support to local government units (LGUs).

At the same time, the delegation of government functions to the local government units increases the demand for regular, up-to-date and more disaggregated information essential for development planning, policymaking, projects development and impact monitoring at all levels. The importance of having accurate information becomes even more pronounced during times of fiscal difficulties in view of the need to balance between resources and needs to determine where the meager resources ought to be invested in.

In this regard, it is good to note that some LGUs like Palawan are on the right track. Through the assistance of the MIMAP Project-Philippines, the provincial government of Palawan, for instance,

---

*Regional Director, National Economic and Development Authority (NEDA) Region IVB.
released its first human development report in 2001. Aside from containing updated basic demographic information about the province, the report also assesses the condition of Palaweños across municipalities in terms of income and livelihood, sanitation, health, nutrition, security, shelter and education. The preparation of the provincial human development report for Palawan has undoubtedly provided reliable information on the current living conditions and facilities available in the province. These information are critical in undertaking various development activities, both at the regional and local levels.

**Benefits of having good baseline data and the CBMS**

Coming up with baseline data allows for a more accurate picture of the human development condition of a particular locality, as shown by the province of Palawan experience, enabling a more realistic setting of goals, targets and objectives aimed at improving the present situation. The information also enables the critiquing of existing policies and the formulation of more strategic policies aimed at a better utilization of resources and targeting of programs and project beneficiaries. The availability of information on various indicators likewise allows for a more efficient allocation of resources by being able to pre-qualify areas and target beneficiaries that satisfy specific development needs and criteria. It also allows for the monitoring and evaluation of the impact of implemented programs and projects according to their objectives. Thus, the information generated by the system lends itself the more effective governance at the local level.

Because of all these, Palawan recognizes the importance of and the benefits from the CBMS. The CBMS is also now considered by the Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG) as a local initiative for development in poverty monitoring as well as a potential catalyst in mobilizing investments.

**Involvement of stakeholders at all levels**

The success of the system’s implementation in Palawan is largely due to the proactive role of the province in disseminating data to various
Local Governments as Champions of CBMS

stakeholders in the development process. It has conducted intensive information sharing campaigns and dialogues with potential users. Intensive networking also enhanced and expanded the data system utilization. The flexibility of the system has also allowed for the incorporation of local specific indicators such as environmental concerns that were widely shared with and disseminated to all the local levels in the province. This in turn facilitated the solicitation of their support.

Thus, the experience of Palawan and the implementation of CBMS is commendable because of the fact that the province has managed to reap the benefits that the system has to offer with minimal support from the national government. The basic strategy adopted by the province in its implementation is based on the principle of resource sharing, coming as it did from a fully engaged local government, including the barangays. The municipal units were encouraged to take the lead in coordinating the implementation while the survey enumerators were recruited from their respective barangays. The province has trained and equipped the implementers with the skills on all aspects of the survey and provided assistance during the various stages of the systems implementation.

There is a lesson for all of us here, especially for national government agencies. The provincial government of Palawan championed the implementation of the CBMS all the way. That is the critical role that a major program implementer should play. In this case, the system also happens to be a good tool for planning, programming and budgeting at various levels. It is also good for monitoring poverty and is by itself an anti-poverty intervention. CBMS can be further utilized through a wider dissemination of data and its users. This means replicating the experience of the province of Palawan to the other provinces of the country as well as streamlining the existing databases on poverty. There may also be a need to incorporate indicators of income and productivity as part of the system to provide further insights not only on the level of welfare but more importantly, on the level of productivity as affected by various external factors. After all, macro economic factors or shocks were the original reasons for the
development of CBMS’ precursor project— the MIMAP— and these shocks will be with us for a while.

As shown by the CBMS experience in Palawan, the sharing and cooperation among the local governments and local communities should be how these continuing shocks ought to be monitored and evaluated.
On the part of the Department, we realize, of course, the realities of election and the turnover of officials and people that takes place in the course of elections. As such, the Department tries to focus on functionalities rather than personalities as the core of its program in empowering local communities and their citizens.

It is in this regard that the Department supports the adoption of the community-based monitoring system (CBMS) in helping the local government’s planning and monitoring systems and in coming up with a set of core indicators for measuring the welfare and development status of local communities. For the objectives and rationale of the system are fundamentally in line with our monitoring of the attainment of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) set for different aspects of development.

The guidebook that was earlier developed in another program for LGUs to determine indicators in monitoring the MDGs can thus be combined or integrated with the concept and mechanics of the CBMS to allow for a better streamlining of the monitoring system. On the whole, the efforts should concentrate on capacity-building for communities that are shown to be in need so that the local people can be truly empowered in improving their lives.
The presentations of Mayor Winifredo Balce-Oco of Labo, Camarines Norte; Ms. Jovenee Sagun of Puerto Princesa; Gov. Joel Reyes of Palawan; Mr. Antonio Gonzales of San Vicente, Northern Palawan; and Mayor Edward S. Hagedorn of Puerto Princesa City, Palawan are whetting the appetites of other mayors in the Philippines on the relevance of the CBMS. Their presentations demonstrate that local government really works in the Philippines. Thus, instead of giving a critical appraisal of their case studies, allow me to just give my brief personal commentary on the presentations.

Despite the many challenges of local governance amidst the national fiscal crisis, the five presentations tell us some very good stories about exemplary practices in Philippine local governance in the area of community-based monitoring system. The case studies properly document the process by which CBMS was used for existing planning and monitoring exercises in various areas.

I am grateful that the Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies, an academic-based policy think-tank, is assisting some local governments in the Philippines to promote the significance and usefulness of CBMS in the country.

I have been informed that CBMS work has also been ongoing in other countries like Bangladesh, Burkina Faso, Nepal, Senegal, Sri Lanka, and Thailand.

* Secretary-General, League of Municipalities of the Philippines and Municipal Mayor, Angono, Rizal.
Lanka and Vietnam. Based on my little research, CBMS is being adopted in the Philippines as part of the development planning exercise of government planning bodies as well as non-government entities in selected localities in the country.

I am very happy to see that the municipalities of Labo and San Vicente as well as the city of Puerto Princesa have pursued this worthwhile project. As the saying goes, many are called but only a few are chosen. I share the pride of these local government units for having been chosen in this project. My only concern is: why is CBMS being implemented only in Palawan and Camarines Norte?

Since the CBMS Network generally aims to provide the national and local governments with up-to-date information for policymaking and program implementation through the development and institutionalization of a CBMS, I hope to see other municipalities in the Philippines as recipients of this project.

We have 1,500 municipalities nationwide. Majority of these municipalities are classified as 3rd, 4th, 5th and 6th class. It is therefore my ardent desire to see other municipalities taking part in this project to improve the quality of municipal governance in the country as a result of having better statistics or benchmark information for evidence-based policymaking through the CBMS.

There is a need to take into account, however, that CBMS is not a panacea to the many challenges of local governance. The valuable lessons from Palawan and Camarines Norte, for instance, point to the fact that any project, including the CBMS, cannot be implemented effectively and efficiently by just one agency. There is a need to build a broad partnership with other LGUs, local government associations, civil society, private sector and non-governmental organizations. Thus, the League of Municipalities of the Philippines (LMP) will be more than willing to establish a close partnership with the CBMS Network of the Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies to promote and apply the value of CBMS in various municipalities.

I find the CBMS an important tool in the promotion of more transparent, accountable, responsive and participatory municipal
governance in the Philippines. As such, the value of CBMS must be properly disseminated and eventually applied to various municipalities in the country. The LMP can help facilitate this endeavor. As mandated by the 1994 Local Government Code, the LMP has the primary purpose of ventilating, articulating and crystallizing issues affecting municipal government administration. The CBMS is one of these issues; hence, I hope to see the CBMS Network strengthening its link with Philippine municipalities through the LMP. I am very confident that the strengthening of this network will advance our common aspirations for better local governance in the Philippines.
First of all, I am happy to have been invited to this conference where the discussion is focused on something that is community-based. For anything that relates to a community is close to my heart especially because I believe that if it is community-based, then it is “of the community, by the community and for the community.”

However, based on the presentations made earlier, I am having a difficult time aligning the community-based monitoring system or CBMS to my understanding of the concept and components of a community-based program.

First is partly because of the touted participatory feature of the project. Community-based means that the ones involved in the implementation of the project are the people themselves because they are primarily its beneficiaries. From the examples presented, though, it seems that the ones heavily involved are either the mayors or the governors and other government officials.

And second is related to monitoring. Monitoring implies that there is a regular updating of data and information so that they become timely for deliberation and decisionmaking. Regular updating, however, entails cost and I wonder exactly how much the implementation of this program will cost all in all.

* National President, League of Local Development Planners of the Philippines and City Planning and Development Coordinator, Cebu City.
Having said these, I therefore think that it is important for us – especially for us in the League whose composition totals 1,725 members who are in the forefront of implementation of almost all development programs for local government units – to really know more about the CBMS, evaluate it and calculate its costs and contribution to the entire country.

And if it is a good program – as many of my colleagues in this League of Local Development Planers attest to – then I enjoin all the members of the Lesague to be one with me in asking the Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG) to issue a directive that will call for the immediate implementation of the CBMS nationwide.

With that, I look forward to seeing the CBMS take off on a national scale and to working with the CBMS team more closely in the near future.
The League of Barangays, composed of all the 41,939 barangays in the Philippines, represents the smallest vision of local government in the country. It was set up to address three issues, namely: (a) exchange of information, (b) human resource development, and (c) technical assistance. All of these are aimed toward the enhancement of the barangay leaders’ capability to effectively govern and manage the public affairs of the barangay.

The presentations articulated by the speakers gave us a glimpse of how the various sites have been able to apply the tool of the Community-based Monitoring System (CBMS) in their regular governance and monitoring functions. This is, of course, of great interest and importance to us because we, at the barangay levels, are the ones implementing programs like the different anti-poverty programs and we have to come up with reports showing percentages, indicators and other data, even charts with colors. Unfortunately, because of the political timetable of our terms of office, many of us are not able to have adequate time to really internalize the meanings of the information in these reports, much more, put them into proper application to help in our planning, prioritization and implementation functions.

That is why we are hoping that the CBMS trainings (not just for the local executives but more important for the community residents and volunteers themselves) will be able to provide them with ample

---

* Deputy for External Affairs, League of Barangays of the Philippines.
understanding of the mechanics of the system and the knowledge of its proper application and uses so that the system may be institutionalized.

As such, we look forward to having a strong collaboration with the CBMS team so that we can really put the CBMS into full use and application, thereby helping the barangays.
Remarks from International Organizations
Introduction
First of all, let me explain what the institution that I represent – International Development Research Centre (IDRC)-is. The IDRC is based in Canada. It is a Crown corporation which means that it was created under our Parliament. It is not a line ministry or a bilateral aid agency but it finances research for development and it has an international board of governors. Half of the members of the board are from outside of Canada. Thus, the IDRC is accountable internationally. We have a number of regional offices and we finance research networks like the Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS).

There are CBMS initiatives in a number of other countries and they are all part of a network led by Dr. Celia Reyes. CBMS-Philippines is a flagship for CBMS initiatives worldwide. The Province of Palawan as well as other local government units have in fact been featured in meetings internationally. I therefore want to congratulate all those who are working so hard and diligently with CBMS not just here in the Philippines but internationally.

Another aspect that I want to emphasize and which is important is about building partnerships. Building partnerships here would refer to not just between government and civil society or among different line ministries in order to become more effective but also internationally.

* Senior Regional Program Specialist, International Development Research Centre (IDRC), Regional Office for Southeast and East Asia.
And IDRC’s mandate in fact is building partnerships or using empowerment through knowledge. And this is really the heart of CBMS.

**Building capacities: the CBMS genesis**

IDRC is also financing research not just to enhance knowledge but also to build capacities on various different levels. If you visit our website, you will see the different types of programs that we do.

Let me mention about the genesis of the CBMS in this regard. CBMS started from a broader initiative called the Micro Impacts of Macro Adjustment Policies (MIMAP). It was out of that, that CBMS and some other pieces of work here in the Philippines had its genesis and then spread worldwide. It grew into a network that consists of components on econometric modeling and on poverty analysis and monitoring. And it is on a *mesa* level that we are working here at CBMS where we get real time and reliable data for analysis.

What is very important here is the poverty focus. The whole MIMAP initiative had that focus. It was really to better understand the multi-dimensional nature of poverty and to be able to measure and analyse it, something that one cannot do unless one has the lowest level of disaggregated data along different categories. This is why this CBMS network is extremely important.

I am absolutely delighted to hear today about the various interventions because it strikes me that we are getting now at the real heart of this type of work. And this is putting evidence-based knowledge into the hands of the people who are in the position to make better informed decisions. Whether it is at the barangay level or moving upwards in terms of being able to allocate resources more effectively or being able to do any type of public action or public decision, it has to be based on localized knowledge inasmuch as contexts are different. What is striking with CBMS is its efforts to enhance LGU capabilities from the bottom level up in order to have better informed decision-making.

This kind of initiative is also taking place in a number of countries like Bangladesh, Nepal, Sri Lanka, Lao, Cambodia, Pakistan, Vietnam, Benin, Burkina Faso, Ghana, and Senegal. I should say though that all
of these countries are very interested in what is going on in the Philippines and learning from the lessons of the Philippines. Thus, the work that is being done here, the documentation of that work, the partnerships that are created and the information that flows back and forth through the CBMS network have been very important for these countries in building up.

**Prospects of scaling up**

At this point, let me talk about the prospects of scaling up the CBMS experiences. I will focus on two big concerns, a) the budget and b) empowerment through verification.

The budget is a key policy instrument in any country, and CBMS as a system for planners to make the budget an effective policy instrument for poverty reduction is probably one of the most critical dimensions in the scaling-up process.

The other aspect is in terms of not only having timely and accurate information, but ensuring the whole empowerment process of local people through the verification process. In other words, it is not just collecting data but going back to the people who are giving those data and confirming or checking them. The fact that CBMS works at the local government level where the common denominator is knowing the people’s condition is very important in having an impact on policies upwards. Politicians—and with due respect to anyone who may be in this kind of office—are often knowledge proof (i.e., “I know everything.”) The CBMS is a way to really show the evidence and bring it up.

I once accompanied a minister of health in his visits to various hospitals. Although he was not a doctor, he began telling patients on what should be done and what medicines to take even without having that level of information. So this is quite important. The application of evidence-based results is extremely powerful and important. The challenge here is scaling up of what have been discreet policy experiments. In other words, the need to scale up nationally the kind of work that had been done at the barangay or provincial level.
The political leadership will play a crucial role in this kind of institutionalization. I think that the Philippines is well on the road to this, from what we have heard this morning. This is very encouraging. Thus, if something becomes an ordinance and then a law, one can see that it has gone through a systematic process. This will certainly give some important lessons worldwide.

**The role of IDRC**

What is the role of IDRC in all of these? I like to think of ourselves as a friend, a philosopher and a guide. We are delighted to be partners with the Angelo King Institute and with all the others in the local governments and other associated institutions. IDRC’s value added here is being a bit of a knowledge-broker, in terms of bringing the networks to do this type of work internationally. And CBMS as a local-level knowledge and instrument of monitoring is not something that was just initiated in the Philippines a few years ago. It is something that has also been done in many different countries at various times. For example, when I was an advisor in Sri Lanka in the mid–eighties, the ministry of planning and the districts were doing GIS local level monitoring for poverty outcomes through the local administrations at that time. As such, we can see some pieces of CBMS type of approaches out there in various countries. To network and bring all of these experiences together is very useful.

**Furthering the CBMS contributions**

Finally, let me end with a few questions regarding where the CBMS can take us even further. Can CBMS be used, for example, in assisting policymakers to rationalize fiscal policy? We heard this morning about using it in terms of getting better knowledge for enhancing the tax base. It may be extending it a bit but it is really important to think about these possibilities when you are thinking of scaling up.

What are the other opportunities that will interest and have a direct bearing at the national level? Can CBMS contribute towards building up investor confidence in any particular area or even in mobilizing investments? The issues of improving human resources and increasing
human capital, transparency and better governance are all important things for private investment. What needs to be done is to crowd in investment and CBMS is the type of work that really has a role there. In terms of better targeting such as pro-poor infrastructure development, this will help to crown in investment and will create local demand.

At a national context, this is going to have great value added. There is also the matter of ensuring quality control. This is related to the role of national institutions like the National Statistics Office in consolidating and getting together some of these information. Again, this is something where the CBMS inputs will be critical.

On that note, let me congratulate all of you for working so hard and for contributing to where the CBMS is now at this point.
Allow me to briefly present the work that our group, the Voluntary Service Overseas (VSO), had provided in Bohol and now in Agusan del Sur where we have the natural resource database (NRDB) system combined with the community-based monitoring system (CBMS) in doing monitoring work.

The CBMS, of course, is basically about the gathering of information on a regular basis to track human development based on indicators classified under 3 major categories: survival, security and enabling. Said information, presented in text and tables, are useful in measuring the human development index and thereby in monitoring the status of human welfare in a particular place.

Said information, however, are made even more telling when presented in map format. The NRDB, which basically uses the geographic information system (GIS), plays a very useful role in that it allows the data to be shown in maps. With the available data, the information may capture situations not only at the level of provinces but also down to the level of barangays and even households. At the same time, the program provides a mapping of the distribution of natural resources within a locality so that it combines the human dimension with the physical attributes of the environment.

As such, the combination of the CBMS and NRDB becomes a powerful tool in capturing welfare conditions of the people and the

---

*Regional Coordinator, Voluntary Service Organization.*
communities. For it not only helps in answering the who, what and where but also the why. Answers may also be captured and easily seen in the maps by which the information are presented, thereby showing a more dynamic picture. Thus, they help in enhancing local governance by addressing concerns and designing appropriate assistance programs.

We therefore hope that this can help as many local government units (LGUs) as possible. That is why we are helping organize workshops that explain the nature and use of the CBMS and the NRDB. In the process, we also hope that the interaction with LGUs may help further refine the integration of natural resource database systems with human development monitoring.
National Government Agencies

Commission on Higher Education (CHED)

Josephine D. Antonio
Position: Education Program Specialist
Institution: Office of Policy, Planning and Research Information-
Commission on Higher Education
Address: Room 205 Jollibee Center, San Miguel Avenue, Pasig City
Tel. No.: 6331981/9101982
Fax No.: 6331981
E-mail: jdantonio@ched.gov.ph

Commission on Population

Ms. Mia C. Ventura
Position: Deputy Executive Director
Institution: Commission on Population
Address: Welfareville Compound, Mandaluyong City
Tel. No.: 5316805/61
Fax No: 5335122
E-mail: ventura@popcom.gov.ph

Ms. Virginia Candor
Position: Information Technology Officer III
Institution: Commission on Population
Address: Welfareville Compound, Mandaluyong City
Tel: 5316983
Fax: 5335122
E-mail: virgie@popcom.gov.ph
Ms. Victoria D. Corpuz
Position: Planning Officer V
Institution: Commission on Population
Address: Welfareville Compound, Mandaluyong City
Tel: 5317303
Fax: 5335122
E-mail: vicky@popcom.gov.ph

Council on the Welfare of Children (CWC)
Ms. Lina Laigo
Position: Executive Director
Institution: Council for the Welfare of Children
Address: #10 Apo St., Brgy. Sta. Teresita, Quezon City
Tel. No.: 7408864/7811039 c/o Alice
Fax No.: 7408860
E-mail: cwc@info.com.ph

Ms. Edna R.L. Estal
Position: Planning Officer
Institution: Council for the Welfare of Children
Address: #10 Apo St., Brgy. Sta. Teresita, Quezon City
Tel. No.: 7408864/7811039 c/o Alice
Fax No.: 7408860
E-mail: cwc@info.com.ph

Ms. Margarita Navales
Position: Planning Officer-PPD Head
Institution: Council for the Welfare of Children
Address: #10 Apo St., Brgy. Sta. Teresita, Quezon City
Tel. No.: 7408864/7811039 c/o Alice
Fax No.: 7408860
E-mail: cwc@info.com.ph

Department of Interior and Local Government (DILG)
Ms. Maritess Balhon-Kelly
Position: Local Government Officer IV
Institution: Bureau of Local Government Development
Address: A. Francisco Gold Condominium II, EDSA corner Mapagmahal Streets, Diliman Quezon City
Tel. No.: 9299215
Ms. Anna Bonagua  
Position: Section Chief-Local Development Planning Division  
Institution: Bureau of Local Government Development  
Department of Interior and Local Government  
Address: A. Francisco Gold Condominium II, EDSA corner Mapagmahal Streets, Diliman Quezon City  
Tel. No.: 9299215

**Department of Social Welfare and Development (DSWD)**  
**Undersecretary Lourdes Balanan**  
Position: Undersecretary  
Institution: Department of Social Welfare and Development  
Address: DSWD Bbuilding, Constitution Hills, Batasan Complex, Quezon City, Philippines  
Tel. No.: 9317916  
Fax No. 9318191

**League of Municipalities**  
**Mayor Gerardo V. Calderon (Angono, Rizal)**  
Position: Secretary General  
Institution: League of Municipalities  
Address: 2nd Floor LMP Bldg. 265 Ermin Garcia St. Cubao, Quezon City  
Tel. No.: 9135737/38  
Fax No.: 9135737

**League of Barangays**  
**Mr. Eduardo Tiongson**  
Position: Deputy for External Affairs  
Institution: League of Barangays  
Address: 1401 Prestige Tower Emerald Ave. Ortigas Center, Pasig City  
Tel. No.: 6320710  
Fax No.: 6320409  
E-mail: liga@barangay.gov.ph

**League of Local Development Planners**  
**Mr. Paul Villarete**  
Designation: National President  
Institution: League of Local Development Planners  
Address: LLDP Satellite Office, 3rd Floor Bureau of Local Government Supervision-DILG, Francisco Gold Condominium, EDSA, Quezon City.  
Tel. No.: 9251151; (032) 2557380  
Fax No.: 9289181; (032) 2551884
National Anti-Poverty Commission (NAPC)
Mr. Oscar D. Francisco  
Position: Vice-Chair for Basic Sectors  
Institution: National Anti-Poverty Commission  
Address: 7th Floor DHC Bldg. EDSA, Quezon City  
Tel. No.: 3733361/64 loc. 130  
Fax No.: 3733361 loc. 132  
E-mail: oschs_napc@yahoo.com

Ms. Fe Cabral  
Position: OIC-Macro Policy Unit  
Institution: National Anti-Poverty Commission  
Address: 7th Floor DHC Bldg. EDSA, Quezon City  
Tel. No.: 3733361/64  
E-mail: mafe_cabral@yahoo.com

National Commission on Indigenous People (NCIP)
Ms. Grace Pascua  
Position: Director-Office on Policy, Planning and Research  
Institution: National Commission on Indigenous People  
Address: 2/F N. dela Merced Building, corner Quezon & West Avenues, Quezon City  
Tel. No.: 3739636

Engr. Grace P. Buasen  
Position: Planning Officer V-Office on Policy, Planning and Research  
Institution: National Commission on Indigenous People  
Address: 2/F N. dela Merced Building, corner Quezon & West Avenues, Quezon City  
Tel. No.: 3739636

Mr. Agustin C. Panganiban  
Position: Project Development Officer III-Office on Policy, Planning and Research  
Institution: National Commission on Indigenous People  
Address: 2/F N. dela Merced Bldg., corner Quezon & West Avenues  
Quezon City  
Tel. No.: 3739636  
E-mail: agotacp@yahoo.com.ph
**National Commission on the Role of Filipino Women (NCRFW)**

Ms. Lorenza A. Umali  
Position: Deputy Director  
Institution: National Commission on the Role of Filipino Women  
Address: 1145 J. P. Laurel St. San Miguel, Manila  
Tel. No. 7365250  
Fax Number: 7364449  
E-mail: ddo@ncrfw.gov.ph

Ms. Janice Gabriel  
Position: Planning Officer II  
Institution: National Commission on the Role of Filipino Women  
Address: 1145 J. P. Laurel St. San Miguel, Manila  
Tel. No.: 7365250  
Fax No.: 7364449  
E-mail: ddo@ncrfw.gov.ph

Ms. Irene F. Daguno  
Position: Planning Officer II  
Institution: National Commission on the Role of Filipino Women  
Address: 1145 J. P. Laurel St. San Miguel, Manila  
Tel. No. 7358917  
Fax Number: 7364449  
E-mail: pdd@ncrfw.gov.ph

**National Economic and Development Authority (Central Office)**

Ms. Erlinda Capones  
Position: Director  
Institution: Social Development Staff  
Address: #12 Escriva Drive, NEDA Building Ortigas Center, Pasig City  
Tel. No.: 6313758  
Fax No.: 6315435

Ms. Maritess Lagarto  
Position: Chief Economic Development Specialist  
Institution: Social Development Staff  
Address: #12 Escriva Drive, NEDA Building Ortigas Center, Pasig City  
Tel. No. 6383571  
Fax Number: 6315435  
E-mail: mblagarto@neda.gov.ph
Ms. Elnora Romero
Position: Chief Economic Development Specialist
Institution: Social Development Staff
Address: #12 Escriva Drive, NEDA Building Ortigas Center, Pasig City
Tel. No. 6312189/6313758
Fax Number: 6313758
E-mail: ecromero@neda.gov.ph

National Economic and Development Authority-Region IVB
Mr. Oskar D. Balbastro
Position: Regional Director
Institution: Regional Office 4B (MIMAROPA)
Address: NEDA Complex, EDSA Quezon City

Ms. Myra Santos
Position: Economic Development Specialist
Institution: Regional Office 4B (MIMAROPA)
Address: NEDA Complex, EDSA Quezon City
Tel. No. 9277218
Fax No. 9296479; 9296272
E-mail: MDSantos@nro4b.neda.gov.ph

National Statistical Coordination Board (NSCB)
Dr. Romulo Virola
Position: Secretary General
Institution: National Statistical Coordination Board
Address: Midland Building, 403 Sen. Gil Puyat Avenue, Makati City
Tel. No. 8952395
Fax No. 8961778

Ms. Lina Castro
Position: Director-Social Sector
Institution: National Statistical Coordination Board
Address: Midland Building, 403 Sen. Gil Puyat Avenue, Makati City
Tel. No.: 8952395
Fax No.: 8961778
Philippine Institute for Development Studies (PIDS)

Dr. Caesar Cororaton
Position: Senior Research Fellow
Institution: Philippine Institute for Development Studies
Address: NEDA sa Makati Building, 120 Amorsolo Street, Makati City
Tel No.: 893-9571
Fax No.: 892-1583

Mr. Mario C. Feranil
Position: Director for Research
Institution: Philippine Institute for Development Studies
Address: NEDA sa Makati Building, 120 Amorsolo Street, Makati City
Tel No.: 8937819
Fax No.: 8939582

Academe

Ateneo de Manila, University

Dr. Cielito Habito
Position: Professor
Institution: Ateneo de Manila University
Address: Department of Economics, 2/F Social Sciences Building
Ateneo de Manila University, Katipunan Avenue,
Loyola Heights, Quezon City
Tel. No.: 4265661
E-mail: cfhabito@mozcom.com

De La Salle University

Dr. Michael Alba
Position: Dean-College of Business and Economics
Institution: De La Salle University
Address: 2401 Taft Avenue, Manila
Tel. No: 5360261 c/o Ms. Eva
Fax. No: 5240489
E-mail: albam@dlsu.edu.ph
Local Government Units

Agusan del Sur

Hon. Santiago B. Cane, Jr.
Position: Sangguniang Panlalawigan Member
Institution: Provincial Government of Agusan del Sur
Address: Government Center, Patin-ay, Prosperidad, Agusan del Sur
Tel.No: (085) 3437268; (085) 2423773/3437682
Fax No.: (085) 3437268
E-mail: ppdo_ads@yahoo.com; Dioric_gavs@yahoo.com

Mr. Nepthali F. Morgado
Position: Acting Chief, Information Technology Unit
Institution: Provincial Government of Agusan del Sur
Address: Government Center, Patin-ay, Prosperidad, Agusan del Sur
Tel.No: (085) 3437268; (085) 2423773/3437682
Fax No.: (085) 3437268
E-mail: ppdo_ads@yahoo.com; Dioric_gavs@yahoo.com

Honorable Allan J. Santiago
Position: Sangguniang Panlalawigan, Member
Institution: Provincial Government of Agusan del Sur
Address: Government Center, Patin-ay, Prosperidad, Agusan del Sur
Tel.No: (085) 3437268; (085) 2423773/3437682
Fax No.: (085) 3437268
E-mail: ppdo_ads@yahoo.com; Dioric_gavs@yahoo.com

Mr. Dioric M. Gavino
Position: GIS Specialist
Institution: Provincial Government of Agusan del Sur
Address: Government Center, Patin-ay, Prosperidad, Agusan del Sur
Tel.No: (085) 3437268; (085) 2423773/3437682
Fax No.: (085) 3437268
E-mail: ppdo_ads@yahoo.com; Dioric_gavs@yahoo.com

Mr. Don P. Carney
Position: VSO-Volunteer (Database Management Specialist)
Address: Government Center, Patin-ay, Prosperidad, Agusan del Sur
Tel. No: 0853437369
Ms. Edna U. Tongson  
Position: Chief-Macro Division (Evaluation, Statistics, Research)  
Organization: Provincial Government of Agusan del Sur  
Address: Government Center, Patin-ay, Prosperidad, Agusan del Sur  
Tel. No.: 0853437268/3437682

Bohol  
Dr. Nestor M. Pestelos  
Position: Head  
Organization: Bohol Poverty Reduction Management Office  
Address: Governor’s Mansion, CDG Avenue, Tagbilaran City 6300 Bohol  
Tel. No.: (038) 5018062  
Fax. No.: (038) 411-2143  
E-mail: pestelos2003@yahoo.com; bprmo@yahoo.com

Bulacan  
Arlene Pascual  
Position: Provincial Planning and Development Coordinator  
Institution: PPDO, Provincial Government of Bulacan  
Address: 3F Capitol Building, Malolos City, Bulacan 3000  
Tel. No.: (044) 7910901/6627080  
Fax No.: (044) 7910901  
E-mail: plan_dev@mozcom.com

Norminda Calayag  
Position: Project Development Officer IV  
Institution: PPDO, Provincial Government of Bulacan  
Address: 3F Capitol Building, Malolos City Bulacan 3000  
Tel. No.: (044) 7910901/6627080  
Fax No.: (044) 7910901  
Email:norminda_calayag@yahoo.com

Eloisa Bulaong  
Position: Project Development Officer IV  
Institution: PPDO, Provincial Government of Bulacan  
Address: 3F Capitol Building, Malolos City Bulacan 3000  
Tel. No.: (044) 7910901/6627080  
Fax No.: (044) 7910901
Camarines Norte
Hon. Winifredo Balce Oco
Position: Municipal Mayor of Labo and President League of Mayors, Camarines Norte
Institution: Municipal Government of Labo, Camarines Norte
Address: Office of the Mayor, Municipal Government of Labo, Municipal Hall, Camarines Norte
Tel. No.: (054) 5852044/4476105
Fax No.: (054) 5852319

Engr. Evaristo Pandi
Position: Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator
Address: Municipal Planning and Development Office, Municipal Government of Labo, Municipal Hall, Camarines Norte
Tel. No: (054) 5852340
Fax No.: (054) 5852319
E-mail: ivan_mpdc@yahoo.com

Mr. Jose Ramon Lagatuz
Position: Planning Officer/Municipal CBMS Team Leader
Address: Municipal Planning and Development Office, Municipal Government of Labo, Municipal Hall, Camarines Norte
Tel. No.: (054) 5852340
Fax No.: (054) 5852319
E-mail: jrblagatuz@yahoo.com

Ms. Constancia Labios
Position: Barangay Captain
Organization: Barangay Kalamunding, Labo, Camarines Norte
Address: Barangay Kalamunding, Labo, Camarines Norte
Tel. No.: 09273482946

Ms. Mirian M. Hernandez
Position: Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator
Institution: Municipal Government of Talisay, Camarines Norte
Address: Municipal Planning and Development Office, Municipal Government of Talisay, Camarines Norte

Mr. Bimbo Doria
Position: Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator
Institution: Municipal Government of Sta. Elena, Camarines Norte
Address: Municipal Hall LGU-Sta. Elena, Camarines Norte
Tel. No.: (054) 2013085  
E-mail: doriabimbo@yahoo.com

**Ms. Rosalie Ocan-Lopez**  
Position: Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator  
Institution: Municipal Government of Basud, Camarines Norte  
Address: Municipal Hall, Basud, Camarines Norte  
Tel. No. (054) 4431016 loc. 110  
Fax. No. (054) 443-1017

**Arch. Madonna Abular**  
Position: Provincial Planning and Development Coordinator  
Institution: Provincial Government of Camarines Norte  
Address: Provincial Capitol, Daet, Camarines Norte  
Tel. No. (054) 7214104 or 7214130  
Fax. No. (054) 5712752  
E-mail: ppdocnorte@yahoo.com

**Eastern Samar**

**Hon. Antonio V. Rivera**  
Designation: Municipal Mayor  
Organization: Municipal Government of Dolores, Eastern Samar  
Tel. No.: 055-565-0013; 09196853900

**Hon. Cesar G. Tagon, Sr.**  
Designation: Municipal Mayor  
Organization: Municipal Government of Hernani, Eastern Samar  
Address: LGU-Hernani, Eastern Samar  
Tel. No.: 055-574-0040; 09162480496  
Fax. No. 055-574-0040

**Mr. Henry M. Afable**  
Designation: Provincial Planning and Development Coordinator  
Organization: Provincial Government of Eastern Samar  
Tel. No.: 055-261-2072; 09194599900  
Fax. No. 055-560-9060
Makati City
Ms. Marilyn R. Salapare
Position: Assistant City Urban Development Officer
Urban Development Department
Institution: City Government of Makati
Address: UOD, 5th Floor Makati City Hall Old Building, J.P. Rizal Avenue, Makati City
Tel. No.: 8701740
Fax. No. 8998958
E-mail: umrs@makati.gov.ph

Ms. Carmelita G. Senga
Position: Project Evaluation Officer IV and Section Head-Monitoring and Evaluation
Institution: Urban Development Office, Urban Development Department City Government of Makati
Address: UOD, 5th Floor Makati City Hall Old Building J.P. Rizal Avenue, Makati City
Tel. No.: 8701733
Fax. No. 8998958

Mr. Juanito A. Tan
Position: Planning Officer III and Section Head-Planning Urban Development Department
Institution: City Government of Makati
Address: UOD, 5th Floor Makati City Hall Old Building J.P. Rizal Avenue, Makati City
Tel. No.: 8701737
Fax. No. 8998958
E-mail: umrs@makati.gov.ph

Mandaue City
Mr. Serafin Blanco
Position: City Administrator
Institution: City Government of Mandaue
Address: Mandaue City Hall, Centro, Mandaue City, Cebu
Tel. No.: 3465191/3450339
Fax No.: 3450339
Palawan

Hon. Joel T. Reyes
Position: Provincial Governor of Palawan
Institution: Provincial Government of Palawan
Address: Capitol Complex, Puerto Princesa City, Palawan
Tel. No.: 0484335505
Fax. No.: 0484332777

Ms. Josephine Escaño
Position: Chief, Research and Evaluation Division
Institution: Provincial Planning and Development Office
Address: Capitol Complex, Puerto Princesa City, Palawan
Tel. No. (048) 4347298
Fax No: (048) 4332777
E-mail: jcepalawan@yahoo.com

Engr. Rogelio Abiog
Position: Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator, Española and Manager, Southern Palawan Planning Information Center
Institution: Municipal Government of San Vicente and Southern Palawan Planning Information Center
Address: Pulot Center, S. Española, Palawan
Tel. No. 09192596326
E-mail: tangentshear@yahoo.com

Ms. Lucylyn Panagsagan
Position: Assistant Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator
Institution: Municipal Government of San Vicente, Northern Palawan
Address: LGU-San Vicente, Northern Palawan
Tel. No.: 09206574791

Ms. Jovenee Sagun
Position: Assistant City Planning and Development Coordinator and CBMS Focal Person
Institution: City Government of Puerto Princesa
Address: City Hall, Puerto Princesa City, Palawan
Tel. No.: (048) 4334297/4342631
Fax No.: (048) 4342523
E-mail: jovenee_sagun@yahoo.com
Mayor Lucena Diaz-Demaala  
Position: Municipal Mayor  
Institution: Municipal Government of Narra  
Address: LGU-Narra, Southern Palawan  
Tel. No.: 09172072611/09209069265

Ms. Anita A. Mingingin  
Position: Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator  
Organization: Municipal Government of Bataraza  
Address: LGU-Bataraza, Southern Palawan  
Tel. No.: 0916-589-8372

Ms. Myrna Gripon  
Designation: Municipal Planning and Development Coordinator  
Organization: Municipal Government of El Nido  
Address: LGU-El Nido, Northern Palawan  
Tel. No.: 0916-589-8372

Mr. Ibrahim Palampisi  
Position: Barangay Captain  
Institution: Barangay Oring-Oring Brookespoint, Southern Palawan  
Address: Barangay Oring-Oring, Brooke’s Point, Southern Palawan

Pasay City  
Hon. Mayor Pewee Trinidad  
Position: City Mayor  
Institution: City Government of Pasay  
Address: City Government of Pasay, City Hall, Pasay City

Engr. Merlita L. Lagmay  
Position: City Planning and Development Coordinator  
Institution: City Government of Pasay  
Address: CPDO Room 216 Pasay City Hall, Pasay City  
Tel. No.: (632) 8340439  
Fax No.: (632) 8340433

Mr. Rolando Londonio  
Position: City Cooperative Officer  
Institution: City Government of Pasay  
Address: Room 426 4th Floor Pasay City Hall F.B. Harrison St. Pasay City  
Tel. No.: (02) 5515233  
Fax No.: (02) 5515233
**Quezon City**

Architech Gerardo G. Magat  
Position: City Planning and Development Officer  
Institution: City Government of Quezon City  
Address: City Hall, Quezon City  
Tel. No.: 9256045

**Private Sector**

**ABS-CBN Foundation Inc.**  
Mr. Junnel D. Esguerra  
Designation: Community Development Officer  
Organization: Bantay Kalikasan-ABS CBN Foundation, Inc.  
Tel. No.: 925-5555  
Fax No.: 4109670

**CONCEP Inc.**  
Ma. Rosario Catalina D. Narciso  
Position: Social Development Specialist  
Institution: Consultants for Comprehensive Environmental Planning, Inc.  
Tel. No.: 8951812/8961902  
Fax No.: 8902480  
E-mail: ninsnarciso@yahoo.com

Nona Londonio  
Position: Community Development Specialist  
Institution: Consultants for Comprehensive Environmental Planning, Inc.  
Tel. No.: 8951812/8961902  
Fax No.: 8902480  
E-mail: ifp@pacific.net.ph

**Metro Bank Foundation**  
Mr. Paul Buenconso  
Position: Vice-President  
Tel./Fax No.: 8185656

**Manila Doctors College**  
Ms. Nida Arma  
Position: Co-Chairperson  
Organization: CWTS
International Organizations

Asian Development Bank (ADB)
Karin Schelzig
Designation: Poverty Specialist
Organization: Asian Development Bank
Address: #6 ADB Avenue, Mandaluyong City
Tel. No: (632) 6325395
Fax. No: (632) 6326318
E-mail: kschelzig@adb.org

Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA)
Ms. Lynette Corcino
Position: Program Coordinator
Institution: Canadian Fund for Local Initiative
Tel. No.: 8138264
Fax. No.: 8928913
E-mail: lynette.corcino@pcco.org.ph

Ms. Agnes Navera
Position: Program Officer
Institution: Canadian Fund for Local Initiative
Tel. No.: 8138264
Fax. No.: 8928913
E-mail: lynette.corcino@pcco.org.ph

German Agency for Technical Cooperation (GTZ)
Mr. Angelo Antonio M. Salanga II
Designation: Project Coordinator
Institution: German Agency for Technical Cooperation (GTZ)-PAPSI
Address: c/o PPDO, 2nd Flr. Capitol Building, Borongan,
Province of Eastern Samar
Tel. No.: (055) 5609131
Fax. No.: (055) 5609131
E-mail: bms5_gsc@hotmail.com
**International Development Research Centre (IDRC)**

**Dr. Evan Due**  
Designation: Senior Regional Program Specialist  
Institution: International Development Research Centre (IDRC)-Regional Office for Southeast and East Asia  
Address: 07-01 RELC Bldg  
30 Orange Grove Road, Singapore  
Tel. No.:  
Fax. No.:  
E-mail: edue@idrc.org.sg

**Ms. Michelle Hibler**  
Designation: Chief, Writing and Translation  
Institution: International Development Research Centre (IDRC)  
Address: PO Box 8500 Ottawa, Canada K1G  
Tel. No.: 613-286-6163 loc. 2095  
Fax. No: 613-5632476  
E-mail: mhibler@idrc.ca

**Ms. Martha Melesse**  
Designation: Senior Program Officer  
Institution: International Development Research Centre (IDRC)  
Address: PO Box 8500 Ottawa, Canada K1G  
Tel. No.: 613-236-6163 ext. 3016  
Fax. No: 613-567-7748  
E-mail: mmelesse@idrc.ca

**SEARCA**

**Dr. Jesus C. Fernandez**  
Designation: Manager-Training Department  
Institution: Southeast Asian Regional Center for Graduate Study and Research in Agriculture (SEARCA)  
Address: SEARCA, Los Baños 4031, Laguna, Philippines  
Tel. No. (049) 5363459; 5362287 loc. 175  
Fax. No. (049) 5362283; 5367097  
E-mail: jcf@agri.searca.org
222  Proceedings of the 2004 National Conference on CBMS

**VSO-Philippines**

Ronet Santos  
Position: SPARK Regional Programme Coordinator  
Institution: Voluntary Service Organization  
Tel #: (632) 9252367/9252368  
Fax #: (632) 4262761  
E-mail: ronet.santos@vsoint.org.

Jocel Pangilinan  
Position: SPARK Programme Assistant  
Institution: Voluntary Service Organization  
Address: 20 Lawin Avenue, Philam Homes, Quezon City  
Tel #: (632) 9273304  
Fax #: (632) 4262761  
E-mail: jocel.pangilinan@vsoint.org

**USAID**

Mr. Gerry Porta  
Designation: Senior Civic Participation Specialist  
Organization: USAID-Philippines  
Address: 8F PNB Financial Center, Roxas Blvd., Pasay City  
Tel. No.: 5529950  
Fax. No.: 5529993

**World Bank**

Ms. Miriam A. Pahm  
Position: Operations Officer for Mindanao  
Institution: World Bank Office-Manila  
Address: 20th Floor Taipan Place Emerald Ave., Ortigas Center, Pasig City  
Tel. No.: (632) 6375855 loc. 3087; (632) 9173087  
Fax No. (632) 6375870  
E-mail: mpahm@worldbank.org
**Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies (AKIEBS)**

**Dr. Ponciano Intal, Jr.**  
Designation: Executive Director  
Institution: Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies  
Address: Room 1015 10th Floor Angelo King International Center  
Estrada Cor. Arellano Ave., Malate, Manila  
Tel. No.: (632) 5245333; 5245369  
Fax No: (632) 5245347

**Mr. Raymund Habaradas**  
Institution: Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies  
Address: Room 1015 10th Floor Angelo King International Center  
Estrada Cor. Arellano Ave., Malate, Manila  
Tel. No.: (632) 5245333; 5245369  
Fax No: (632) 5245347

**Bai Yasmin Sinsuat**  
Position: Chairperson, SAMASA Consortium and President,  
Coconut Coir Industry Association of the Philippines  
Address: Room 1015 10th Floor Angelo King International Center  
Estrada Cor. Arellano Ave., Malate, Manila  
Tel. No.: (632) 5245333; 5245369  
Fax No: (632) 5245347

**Dr. Gelia Castillo**  
Position: Board of Trustees Member  
Institution: Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies  
Address: 64 Maahas Street, College, Los Baños, Laguna  
Tel. No.: (049) 5361393  
Fax No.: (049) 5361393

**Atty. Ricardo Puno, Jr.**  
Position: Member, Board of Trustees  
Institution: Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies  
Address: 1006B West Tower, Philippine Stock Exchange Building  
Ortigas Center, Pasig City  
Tel. No.: 6877413 to 14  
Fax. No: 6877412
Conference Secretariat

Dr. Celia M. Reyes
Position: CBMS Network Leader
Institution: CBMS Network Coordinating Team, Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies
Address: Room I-1016 10th Floor Angelo King International Center, Estrada Cor. Arellano Ave., Malate, Manila
Tel. No.: (632) 5262067 (direct)/5245333
Fax. No. (632) 5262067
E-mail: reyesc@csb.dlsu.edu.ph

Anne Bernadette E. Mandap
Position: Research and Administrative Officer
Institution: CBMS Network Coordinating Team, Angelo King Institute Economic and Business Studies
Address: Room I-1016 10th Floor Angelo King International Center, Estrada Cor. Arellano Ave., Malate, Manila
Tel. No.: (632) 5262067 (direct)/5245333
Fax. No. (632) 5262067
E-mail: mandapa@csb.dlsu.edu.ph

Kenneth C. Ilarde
Position: Research Officer
Institution: CBMS Network Coordinating Team, Angelo King Institute Economic and Business Studies
Address: Room I-1016 10th Floor Angelo King International Center, Estrada Cor. Arellano Ave., Malate, Manila
Tel. No.: (632) 5262067 (direct)/5245333
Fax. No. (632) 5262067
E-mail: ilardek@csb.dlsu.edu.ph

Lani V. Garnace
Position: Research Associate
Institution: CBMS Network Coordinating Team, Angelo King Institute Economic and Business Studies
Address: Room I-1016 10th Floor Angelo King International Center, Estrada Cor. Arellano Ave., Malate, Manila
Tel. No.: (632) 5262067 (direct)/5245333
Fax. No. (632) 5262067
E-mail: valencial@csb.dlsu.edu.ph
Jasminda P. Asirot  
Position: Senior Database Management Specialist  
Institution: CBMS Network Coordinating Team, Angelo King Institute  
Economic and Business Studies  
Address: Room I-1016 10th Floor Angelo King International Center, Estrada Cor. Arellano Ave., Malate, Manila  
Tel. No.: (632) 5262067 (direct)/5245333  
Fax. No. (632) 5262067  
E-mail: asirotj@csb.dlsu.edu.ph

Joel E. Bancolita  
Position: Junior Database Management Specialist  
Institution: CBMS Network Coordinating Team, Angelo King Institute  
Economic and Business Studies  
Address: Room I-1016 10th Floor Angelo King International Center, Estrada Cor. Arellano Ave., Malate, Manila  
Tel. No.: (632) 5262067 (direct)/5245333  
Fax. No. (632) 5262067  
E-mail: bancolitaj@csb.dlsu.edu.ph

Lei-Ann Genevieve D. Burgos  
Position: Administrative Assistant  
Institution: CBMS Network Coordinating Team, Angelo King Institute  
Economic and Business Studies  
Address: Room I-1016 10th Floor Angelo King International Center, Estrada Cor. Arellano Ave., Malate, Manila  
Tel. No.: (632) 5262067 (direct)/5245333  
Fax. No. (632) 5262067  
E-mail: delenal@csb.dlsu.edu.ph
Contextualizing CBMS: growing list of demands on LGUs amidst decentralization

- Local Government Units (LGUs) are constantly facing a lot of difficulties given the meager resources that are at their disposal. Because of the extent that they are responsible for the disbursement of these funds, they need to have a rational utilization plan.
- They likewise have to do something to reduce their dependence on the national budget. One way to do this is to increase their alternative sources of revenue.
- Given this scenario, the CBMS can help decision makers at the local level to set their priorities. CBMS information not only tells them where they are now and where they ought to be but more importantly, how they are going to get there.

Information requirements of LGUs

- A number of LGUs still have to look at information as a critical input in the policymaking process. Policies and programs should be based on the realities on the ground.
- Most of the time, LGUs have to make a distinction between actual and perceived needs of their constituents. Due to lack of information, plans such as Annual Investment Plans are crafted based on gut feel. CBMS can help them in this regard.
Information strengthens the argument for rational spending and prioritization.

### Balancing political survival and community needs

- The provision of social services and other interventions that are going to be put in place have to be immediately felt by the people. This situation poses a dilemma to politicians who are judged by their constituents on the basis of “visibility” of their accomplishments such as infrastructure projects, e.g., waiting sheds and sports complex.
- With CBMS, the people themselves will come to realize what the priority needs of their communities are. They would not ask the governor, for instance, to keep on providing them with waiting sheds; instead, they would probably ask for more teachers and for supplemental feeding programs, among others. Things which may not be so visible yet would have a greater impact on their welfare.

### Influencing national programs and policies through CBMS

- CBMS results can influence national government agencies to modify their programs according to the needs at the local level. The challenge therefore is how to institutionalize an anti-poverty strategy that relies significantly on local leads and information. That is where CBMS can come in.
- Information itself can be a powerful tool wielded by the members of the community to influence decision-making at the local level. If this does not work out, that is where the media can come in.

### Synchronizing initiatives on poverty monitoring systems at the local level

- There are also other initiatives on institutionalizing local poverty monitoring systems that are being supported by foreign donors.
There is a need to synchronize these efforts so that LGUs will not be confused as to what indicators should be monitored.

- What international organizations can do is to encourage local initiatives by providing the venue where they can come together. A forum similar to this conference where LGUs can share their experiences and learn best practices from each other should be conducted more often.

### Challenges ahead

- **Coming up with an integrated plan**
  There is a need to have an integrated plan to support the policies that are going to be enforced based on CBMS results. For example, if PhilHealth insurance will be provided, it is important to make sure that government medical centers are fully equipped to receive PhilHealth members.

- **Providing legislative support**
  The only way to ensure the continuity of CBMS is to make it part of policy through an ordinance or though the passage of a law that institutionalizes CBMS in the whole country.

- **Ensuring sustainability**
  There have been many attempts in the past to come up with community-based monitoring systems. Some of them date back to 20 years ago. These initiatives, however, did not prosper. One important factor was that these were externally introduced to communities (i.e., donor-driven). When the project finished, the community-based monitoring system also stopped. On the other hand, the monitoring systems also showed the people what their problems were and as a result, their expectations also rose that these will be addressed fully and immediately by the government.
Harmonizing surveys of CBMS and national statistical agencies

- Related to the concern on data quality is the issue of data aggregation. There might be some issues about being able to harmonize certain information from the surveys of the National Statistics Office (NSO) as against the information that might be generated through the CBMS.
- Disparities exist in the survey results of CBMS and national statistical agencies. For example, CBMS survey results show that 60 percent of the total number of households in Labo, Camarines Norte have access to safe drinking water. NSO data however show that only 48 percent have access.

CBMS and gender disaggregated statistics

- A possible linkage between the CBMS and the National Commission on the Role of Filipino Women (NCRFW) should be explored in order to come up with gender disaggregated statistics.
- All CBMS partners are encouraged to look at the gender dimensions of poverty as well as to incorporate other indicators that are relevant to their communities. Provisions for data to be segregated by gender are made in the survey instrument.
- The CBMS is flexible enough such that CBMS partners could add different indicators into the system. For example, after basic data have been collected from the CBMS questionnaires, data from administrative reports as well as from other sources may also be included.

“Selling” CBMS to LGUs

- The constraints on human resource hamper the spread of CBMS. This also explains why some of the participants have heard of the CBMS for the first time.
- A local development planning conference could go a long way in pushing for the implementation and institutionalization of
CBMS. Certainly, if stakeholders see that CBMS is working, then little by little, they would be able to convince people that this is really what they need and in the process, help improve the image of government officials.

**Wealth of talent at the local level**
- There was a time when the national government bureaucracy worried about the capacity of local government to undertake contracts and other “sophisticated” functions. What is emerging here, though, is that there are a lot of able and innovative local officials. In fact, a lot of innovations in governance are emanating from below.

**Broadening the scope of CBMS**
- In order to capture all the concerns from different sectors, CBMS should not only concentrate on poverty indicators but should also tackle other indicators of welfare such as civil rights, family care and environment conservation. Local chief executives should push for a list of indicators that could be added aside from the 13 core poverty indicators.

**Cost of implementing CBMS**
- It is indeed impressive that local government units are willing to spend their own money in implementing CBMS. Usually, they would not do this unless you provide them with computers and other needs.

**Theoretical basis of instruments**
- It is important that the instruments have theoretical models behind them so that the list of variables will be complete in order to do academic studies.
Providing analytic support

- Analytic support should be provided to avoid a situation where there are data-rich but information-poor LGUs. Academic researchers could provide some help in understanding many of these data. When all of these data are available, the influence of local government units in designing national programs is actually being strengthened.

CBMS versus other frameworks for development planning

- Experience shows that every time there is a new framework for development planning, this has to be included in the training modules for LGUs. In fact, when there was a population and development planning approach before, we had to include said approach as part of our framework. We had to show the LGUs that these are the indicators that need to be collected and this is how it has to be analyzed. When the gender-responsive local development planning came out, we had to adjust our indicators again and teach them how to gather and analyze the data. Most of these initiatives eventually did not prosper because of lack of tools. CBMS is different in this respect since the system is already in place.

Learning from the CBMS experience

- LGUs are indeed lucky that they can get CBMS enumerators who are willing to be paid a very minimal amount for their services. The National Statistics Office (NSO) could learn from this experience by also tapping these people to reduce the cost of the implementation of their surveys such as the Labor Force Survey (LFS) and Family Income and Expenditures Survey (FIES).

Problems encountered by LGUs in implementing CBMS

- Difficulties in data collection especially in barangays that are currently involved in boundary disputes.
• Lack of computers to process the CBMS-generated data.
• Lack of funds for computerized processing.
• Need to sustain the commitments of local chief executives.
• Lack of technical capacity in writing the barangay socioeconomic profiles. This issue was solved by tapping the services of local teachers in helping the barangay secretaries and volunteers to put the CBMS results in narrative form.
• Need to increase acceptance/ recognition of CBMS data as official. Some LGUs are already complaining that the data that they have gathered from CBMS are not considered official. For instance, some donor agencies still insist on asking for official statistics from NSO even after knowing that these LGUs have generated their own information.

**Improving the survey instrument**

• The present CBMS survey questionnaires are only focused on extracting socioeconomic data at the local level. There is a need to include other criteria related to sustainable development such as the political criteria, the environmental criteria, the cultural aspect, even technology and the viability of institutions.
• The questionnaire needs to be upgraded to make it an important tool in attaining sustainable development for the Philippines.

**Cost-sharing arrangements**

• It is best that local communities actually pay for everything in the implementation of their own poverty monitoring systems. But realistically, there will be some communities that may not have the resources to truly undertake the project. In this case, private sector and donor agencies can be tapped for financial aid. There is just a need to inform the members of the business community, especially those who are advocating corporate governance and social responsibility, on the usefulness and importance of the system. Most of them now realize that it is
not just a matter of making profits but also making sure that the entire community is also improving.

Budget allocation for CBMS

- It is good to know that planning officers as well as junior officers are taking this up and convincing local chief executives to allot a portion of their budget for CBMS.

Scaling-up CBMS

- Plans should already be set in place on how to scale up CBMS operations in the country because experience shows that LGUs may be good at implementing programs with 100 families but the same cannot be said when they are dealing with 100,000 families.
- A major source of concern that should be tackled immediately is how to deepen the kind of enthusiastic support from LGUs that CBMS is enjoying right now.
- The CBMS should be implemented at the national level and in areas that really need it most such as in Metro Manila where there are 13 million people.
- In scaling up CBMS work throughout the entire country, operations will certainly be difficult and data quality must be ensured.

Documenting best practices

- Before branching out, increasing the network and scaling up, it is important that the experiences that have been gathered and generated by LGUs in the past, are documented. This documentation should also include the lessons drawn from the experiences shared by the LGUs since most development organizations are always coming up with best practices.
- Provide details on what the common elements and inherent conditions are in the experiences presented by the different municipalities.
Right now, the DILG is already documenting best practices of local governments. There are various levels of best practices: it can be *process* or it can be *project implementation*. There are different ways of looking at how innovative LGUs can be and how these innovations can be replicated by other LGUs. Every LGU has its own unique or innovative practices.
The implementation of the Community-Based Monitoring System (CBMS) in the Philippines is a joint undertaking of the PEP-CBMS Network Coordinating Team of the Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies of the De La Salle University and various local government units (LGUs). The latter have provided inputs in the design of the CBMS data collection instruments for greater applicability to various communities and played significant roles in the advocacy of CBMS to other LGUs and stakeholders. The CBMS was developed to address the lack of disaggregated data for planning, program formulation, policy impact assessment and poverty monitoring. At the same time, there was also a need to come up with support mechanisms for the implementation of the decentralization policy that was passed in the early 1990s. The CBMS involves the design, pilot-test and implementation of a methodology for data collection and processing, validation and utilization of survey data for needs identification as well as for the design and monitoring of program interventions at all geopolitical levels. The CBMS poverty maps are used to identify who and where the poor are.

The framework and design of the CBMS methodology and instruments were developed by the PEP-CBMS Network Coordinating Team (formerly known as the MIMAP-CBMS Philippines Team). Further refinements in the methodology to incorporate recent developments such as localizing the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) are also being spearheaded and undertaken by the Team in collaboration with various CBMS partners at the national and local levels in the country.

The CBMS initiative is also being implemented in Bangladesh, Burkina Faso, Benin, Cambodia, Ghana, Lao PDR, Nepal, Pakistan, Senegal, Sri Lanka and Vietnam in collaboration with various government, research and academic institutions in these countries. Work in these countries is being coordinated by the PEP-CBMS Network Coordinating Team. The CBMS activities in the Philippines and other countries in Asia and Africa are being carried out with the aid of a grant from the International Development Research Centre (IDRC) of Canada.

Inquiries regarding the CBMS-Philippines Project may be sent through:

PEP-CBMS Network Coordinating Team
Mailing Address: Angelo King Institute for Economic and Business Studies
Room 1-1016 10th Floor Angelo King International Center
Estrada corner Arellano Avenue
Malate, Manila 1004, Philippines

Telephone Number: *(632) 5262067 (direct) / 5245333 (trunkline)*
Facsimile: *(632) 5262067*
Email: reyescd@dls-csb.edu.ph • mimap@dls-csb.edu.ph